

**Subject: Application to alter 514 Manor Avenue, a property designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, located in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District**

**File Number: ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0016**

**Report to Built Heritage Committee on 9 May 2023**

**and Council 10 May 2023**

**Submitted on April 25, 2023 by Court Curry, Manager, Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department**

**Contact Person: Luis Juarez, Planner II, Heritage Planning Branch**

**613-580-2424,21333, Luis.Juarez@ottawa.ca**

**Ward: Rideau-Rockcliffe (13)**

**Objet : Demande de modification du bien-fonds situé au 514, avenue Manor, propriété désignée en vertu de la partie V de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario* et située dans le district de conservation du patrimoine de Rockcliffe Park**

**Dossier : ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0016**

**Rapport au Comité du patrimoine bâti**

**le 9 mai 2023**

**et au Conseil le 10 mai 2023**

**Soumis le 25 avril 2023 par Court Curry, Gestionnaire, Services des emprises, du patrimoine et du design urbain, Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique**

**Personne ressource : Luis Juarez, Urbaniste II, Planification du Patrimoine**

**613-580-2424,21333, Luis.Juarez@ottawa.ca**

**Quartier : Rideau-Rockcliffe (13)**

## **REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS**

**That the Built Heritage Committee recommend that Council:**

- 1. Approve the application to alter 514 Manor Avenue, according to plans prepared by Art House Developments, dated January 18, 2023, conditional upon:
 
  - a. The submission of a heritage permit application for the front entrance canopy to be processed under the authority delegated to staff;**
  - b. The submission and acceptance of a final Tree Information Report and Landscape Plan, to the satisfaction of the City's Forester;**
  - c. The reinstatement of the original boulder wall along the property's Hillcrest Drive elevation; and,**
  - d. The submission of samples of all final exterior materials for approval by Heritage Planning staff prior to issuance of a building permit.****
- 2. Delegate the authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department;**
- 3. Approve the issuance of the heritage permit with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance unless otherwise extended by Council.**
- 4. Direct that the report be submitted to Council for consideration at its meeting of May 10, 2023, pursuant to Subsection 35(7) of the Procedure By-law.**

## **RECOMMANDATIONS DU RAPPORT**

**Que le Comité du patrimoine bâti recommande ce qui suit au Conseil :**

- 1. Approuver la demande de modification du 514, avenue Manor, conformément aux plans préparés par Art House Developments et datés du 18 janvier 2023, sous réserve des conditions suivantes :**
  - a. Soumission d'une demande de permis patrimonial visant l'auvent de l'entrée principale, qui sera traitée au titre des pouvoirs délégués au personnel;**

- b. **Soumission et acceptation d'un rapport d'information final sur les arbres et d'un plan d'aménagement paysager, à la satisfaction de l'expert-forestier de la Ville;**
  - c. **Remise en état du mur de soutènement en pierre qui longe l'élévation de la propriété donnant sur la promenade Hillcrest; et**
  - d. **Soumission d'échantillons du choix final de tous les matériaux de revêtement extérieur à l'approbation du personnel responsable du patrimoine, avant la délivrance d'un permis de construire.**
2. **Déléguer au directeur général de Planification, Immobilier et Développement économique le pouvoir d'apporter des changements mineurs aux plans reçus;**
  3. **Approuver la délivrance d'un permis patrimonial d'une durée de deux ans à compter de la date de délivrance, sauf prolongation accordée par le Conseil municipal.**
  4. **Demander que le rapport soit soumis à l'examen du Conseil à sa réunion du 10 mai 2023, conformément au paragraphe 35(7) du Règlement de procédure.**

## **BACKGROUND**

514 Manor Avenue is located on the southwest corner of Manor Avenue and Hillcrest Road and is a Grade I property in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District (see Document 1). The property contains a two-and-a-half storey stone and wood clad dwelling constructed in 1914 in a vernacular Arts and Crafts style. It has a steeply pitched gabled roof with a central dormer and a rectangular shaped plan that fronts onto Manor Avenue. Its landscape features include a newly planted cedar hedge along the length of the Hillcrest Road property line, a contemporary boulder wall along Manor Avenue, and several mature trees. A heritage permit was issued in 2017 to facilitate window and siding replacement, stone repointing, the replacement of the deteriorated roof structure, and the addition of roof dormers.

In 2016, the owner submitted a consent application to sever the eastern portion of the lot to facilitate the construction of a new dwelling unit on Hillcrest Road. The application was denied by the Committee of Adjustment, however in 2017, the Ontario Municipal Board (now Ontario Land Tribunal) released a decision to permit the severance on the basis that the 1997 Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District ("HCD") Plan was not enforceable, and that the 2016 HCD Plan was still under appeal and therefore not yet in effect. After this decision, the owner failed to fulfil the related conditions of approval

within the prescribed timeframe, thereby rendering the severance lapsed. The Department will not support the creation of a new lot should a new application be filed on the basis that the 2016 Rockcliffe Park HCD Plan is now fully in force, and its policies would not support the severance of this property. As such, the heritage permit application discussed in this report considers the existing lot in its entirety.

The Rockcliffe Park HCD was designated in 1997 for its cultural heritage value as an early planned residential community first laid out by Thomas Keefer in 1864. The district is also important for its historical associations with Keefer and his father-in-law, Thomas MacKay, the founder of New Edinburgh and the original owner of Rideau Hall. The picturesque nature of the village also contributes significantly to its cultural heritage value. The Statement of Cultural Heritage Value notes that today, the Village of Rockcliffe Park is a distinctive community of private homes and related institutional properties within a park-like setting. Additionally, Rockcliffe Park features many diplomatic residences, the concentration of which expresses an important trend in Canada's history in international relations.

The Rockcliffe Park HCD Plan was approved by City Council in 2016 and came into effect in 2019. The overarching objective of the Rockcliffe Park HCD Plan is to provide direction in managing change and conserving the HCD in a manner that respects its values.

This report has been prepared because alterations to a property in a heritage conservation district designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* require the approval of City Council after consultation with the Built Heritage Committee.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **Proposal**

The applicant is proposing to construct a one-storey addition on the south elevation and a below-grade garage with an accessory pool house above, north of the existing house. For elevations, renderings and landscape plan see Documents 6,7 and 8 of this report.

The proposed addition is set back 1.4 metres behind the front elevation of the existing house and maintains a 4.5 metre setback along Hillcrest Road. It is situated where a former sunroom used to exist and attempts to interpret it through its horizontal wood cladding, setback, and gable dormer window facing Manor Avenue.

The proposed garage is situated to align with the existing 3.5 metre driveway, with its front elevation wall aligning with the rear elevation wall of the existing dwelling. The one-storey pool house is further set back 6.3 metres from the garage entrance, allowing for a canopied green roof above the garage entrance towards the pool house entrance.

The landscape plan includes generous soft landscaping, a recently planted cedar hedge along Hillcrest Road, the reinstatement of the original stone wall along Hillcrest Road, and the placement of additional boulders and plantings in front of the contemporary stone wall facing Manor Avenue to soften its hard edges. The submission and acceptance of a finalized Tree Information Report and the reinstatement of the stone wall are conditions of approval for this heritage permit.

### **Recommendation 1**

The Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan (“RPHCDP”) has guidelines for alterations and additions to Grade I buildings. Generally, additions should be of their own time, be lower than the existing roofline, use natural materials, be compatible with Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape, and not result in the obstruction of heritage attributes.

The character of the existing landscape in Rockcliffe Park is a heritage attribute of the HCD. There are guidelines associated with landscaping in the RPHCDP. These note that new additions must maintain a dominance of soft over hard surfaces and visual continuity between properties, particularly in the front and side yards.

This proposal complies with the HCD policies and guidelines and has little impact on the character of the HCD. The one-storey addition and accessory garage and pool house are carefully sited to minimize interruptions in the existing landscape. They are lower in height than the existing dwelling and use the same natural materials as the existing dwelling. While the grade will be altered to facilitate a below-grade garage, the proposed placement of the garage under the pool house will minimize the accessory building’s lot coverage and reduce its height and visual impact along the Manor Avenue streetscape. The proposed green canopy above the garage will contribute to the property’s soft landscaped character. Further, maintaining the driveway’s existing location eliminates the need to interrupt the landscape along Hillcrest Road with a new driveway. The proposed design will generally maintain the remainder of the property’s existing grades.

A detailed analysis of the applicable guidelines and how this proposal satisfies them is provided in Document 3.

### **Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada**

City Council adopted Parks Canada’s Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (“standards and guidelines”) in 2008. This document establishes a consistent set of conservation principles and guidelines for projects involving heritage resources. Heritage staff have reviewed this proposal against this

document and are satisfied that the project meets the relevant standards and guidelines. An analysis of compliance has been included as Document 4.

### **Heritage Impact Assessment**

Section 4.5.2 of the City of Ottawa Official Plan requires that a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) be submitted where a proposed development has the potential to adversely affect the heritage resource. A HIA was prepared for this proposal by John Stewart Commonwealth Historic Resource Management and is attached as Document 6. Heritage Planning staff have reviewed the document and have determined that it meets the requirements of the City's Guidelines for HIAs.

Heritage Planning staff generally support the findings of the HIA which conclude that the proposed addition and accessory building will maintain the heritage character of the surrounding Grade I properties and the landscape attributes of the HCD.

### **Conclusion**

Staff have reviewed the application to alter 514 Manor Avenue in accordance with the objectives, policies and guidelines of the RPHCDP and the Standards and Guidelines and have no objections to its approval subject to the conditions outlined above.

### **Recommendation 2**

Delegate authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department.

Minor design changes may emerge during the working drawing phase of a project. This recommendation is included to allow Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department to approve these changes should they arise.

### **Recommendation 3**

Issue the heritage permit with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance.

The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not provide any timelines for the expiry of heritage permits. A two-year expiry date is recommended to ensure that the project is completed in a timely fashion.

### **Provincial Policy Statement**

Staff have reviewed this proposal and have determined that it is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.

**RURAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

**CONSULTATION**

The plans were posted on the City's Development Application website on 2023-Mar-24.

Heritage Ottawa and Ward Councillor King were notified of this application and offered the opportunity to provide comments.

The Rockcliffe Park Residents Association participated in a pre-consultation meeting with the applicant on 2021-Feb-24. Staff and the Rockcliffe Park Residents Association provided comments.

Neighbours within 30 metres of the property were notified of this application and offered an opportunity to comment at the Built Heritage Committee meeting.

**COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR(S)**

The councillor is aware of the application related to this report.

**ADVISORY COMMITTEE(S) COMMENTS**

N/A

**LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no legal implications associated with implementing the report recommendations.

**RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS**

There are no risk management implications.

**ASSET MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS**

There are no asset management implications for this report.

**FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no direct financial implications.

**ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS**

There are no accessibility implications associated with this report.

## **APPLICATION PROCESS TIMELINE STATUS**

The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on May 17, 2023.

## **SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION**

Document 1 Location Map

Document 2 Current Context Photos

Document 3 HCD Plan Evaluation Chart

Document 4 Standards and Guidelines

Document 5 Heritage Survey Form

Document 6 Heritage Impact Assessment

Document 7 Site Plan

Document 8 Elevations and Renderings

Document 9 Landscape Plan

Document 10 Tree Information Report

Document 11 Rationale for Reverse Slope Driveway




## **DISPOSITION**

Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services, to notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, 10 Adelaide Street East, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3) of Council's decision.



Document 1 – Location Map



|  |           |   |   |
|--|-----------|---|---|
|   |           | LOCATION MAP / PLAN DE LOCALISATION<br>HERITAGE / PATRIMOINE                        |   |
| D09-01-MAN0514   | 23-0310-R |  | <b>541 av. Manor Avenue</b>   |
| I:\CO\2023\Heritage\Manor_514  |           |   |   |
| <small>                     © parcel data is owned by Teramex Enterprises Inc. and its suppliers.<br/>                     All rights reserved. May not be produced without permission.<br/>                     TRES B. NOT A PLAN OF SURVEY                 </small> |           |   |   |
| <small>                     © les données de parcelles appartiennent à Teramex Entreprises Inc. et à ses fournisseurs. Tous droits réservés. Ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation. CE N'EST PAS UN PLAN D'ARPENTAGE                 </small>                       |           |   |   |
| REVISION / RÉVISION - 2023 / 04 / 11   |           |   |   |
|  |           |   |  |

**Document 2 – Current Context Photos**



Rear elevation of dwelling, along Hillcrest Drive (City of Ottawa, 2023)



Front elevation of dwelling, along Manor Avenue (City of Ottawa, 2020)

**Document 3 – HCD Plan Evaluation Chart**

| <b>Section of HCD Plan</b>  | <b>Applicable Policy (#) and Guidelines (x)</b>   | <b>Staff comment</b>  |
|---|---|---|
| 7.3.2, Conservation and Maintenance – Roofs and Chimneys              | 6. Chimneys are important heritage attributes of historic buildings. Chimneys that contribute to the cultural heritage value of a building should be retained. Non-functioning chimneys that contribute to the cultural heritage value of a building shall be retained. Non-functioning chimneys should be vented and protected to prevent deterioration. | There is an existing stone chimney on the south elevation of the house. The proposed addition will cover the base of the chimney and obscure its visibility along Hillcrest Road. Notwithstanding, the portion above the second storey will still be visible. The base of the chimney was previously obscured from the street when the previous sunroom existed.            |
| 7.3.2, Conservation and Maintenance – Verandas, Porches, and Canopies | 2. The conservation of small canopies found on many houses over the front door is encouraged.   | The owner is exploring conservation options for the existing entrance canopy. The gable canopy will be maintained, however details as to whether it will be supported by wall brackets or columns is to be determined. As a condition of heritage permit approval, a Delegated Authority permit will be required to review the canopy design when details become available. |

|  |  |  |
|--|--|--|
| <p>7.3.3, Landscape Guidelines – Front Yards, Plant Material, Trees and Walkways</p> | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. The dominance of soft landscape over hard landscape is an essential heritage attribute of the HCD and shall be retained in order to maintain a green setting for each property.</li> <li>2. Landscape projects shall respect the attributes and established character of the associated streetscape and the HCD.</li> <li>3. Front yards shall have a generous area of soft landscaping which may include lawns, shrubs and flower beds, specimen or groupings of trees.</li> <li>4. The removal of mature trees is strongly discouraged. Where a tree must be removed to allow for new construction, it will be replaced with a new tree of an appropriate size and species.</li> </ol> | <p>A landscape plan was reviewed as part of this application that demonstrates that soft landscape will continue to dominate the property.</p> <p>The stone wall along the Hillcrest Avenue elevation will be reinstated as a condition of this heritage permit approval. Additional planting and boulders are also proposed along the Manor Avenue stone wall to soften the existing contemporary wall's hard edge on the streetscape.</p> <p>As part of this proposal, a Tree Information Report was submitted. It identifies 26 trees either entirely or partly on the property. 20 trees will be retained and protected during construction as per the Ottawa Tree Protection Specifications (March 2021), including the trees along the northern property line that will help to buffer the proposed accessory building from the adjacent property.</p> |
|--|--|--|

|  |  |   |
|--|--|---|
|  |  | <p>Six trees are proposed for removal, five of which are identified as Norway Maples in poor condition and the other as a Sugar Maple in poor condition. Final review and acceptance of the plan by the City's Forester is required prior to the issuance of a Building Permit as a condition of the Heritage Permit approval. Further, whilst a cedar hedge and several white pine, tamarak, and fruit trees have been recently planted on the property, the final number and species of replacement trees will be determined through the tree permit process.</p> |
| <p>7.3.3, Landscape Guidelines – Driveways, Landscape Features, and Lighting</p> | <p>1. Driveway design that minimizes the amount of asphalt and other paving materials is encouraged. Consideration should be given to the use of porous materials such as turfstone.</p> <p>5. Cedar hedges are a common feature of the HCD. The retention of existing mature cedar hedges is encouraged. The replacement of taller overgrown hedges with lower hedges may be appropriate.</p> | <p>The proposed one-car driveway will be situated in the same location as the original driveway and maintains a width of 3.5 metres until it widens to 3.7 metres at the entrance of the below grade garage. The placement minimizes any additional interruptions to the landscape while preserving existing trees on site.</p>   |

|   |  |  |
|---|--|--|
|   |  | <p>A new cedar hedge has been planted by the owner along the entirety of the Hillcrest Road elevation which aids in screening the rear yard and proposed new addition.</p>   |
| <p>7.4.1 Alterations and Additions to Existing Buildings – Guidelines for Grade I Buildings</p> | <p>1. All additions to Grade I buildings shall be complementary to the existing building, subordinate to and distinguishable from the original and compatible in terms of massing, facade proportion, and rooflines.</p> <p>3. Alterations and additions to Grade I buildings shall be designed to be compatible with the historic character of buildings in the associated streetscape, in terms of scale, massing, height, setback, entry level, and materials.</p> <p>6. Cladding materials for additions to Grade I buildings will be sympathetic to the existing building. Natural materials are preferred.</p> | <p>The proposed addition and accessory building utilize design queues from the existing building's vernacular architecture. Borrowed design elements include matching wood cladding, wood clad windows, stone accents, gable rooflines, and bay window features with shed rooflines, wooden rafter tails, and bracket detailing.</p> <p>Notwithstanding, the addition remains distinguishable and subordinate to the existing structure as it is one-storey in height and setback 1.4 metres from the front elevation of the existing Grade I house. Similarly, the proposed accessory building is setback approximately 15 meters from the street, ensuring that it is not visually integral.</p> |

|   |   |   |
|---|---|---|
| <p>7.4.2 Guidelines for New Buildings – Garages and Accessory Buildings</p> | <p>1. In general, new garages should be simple in character with a gable or flat roof and wood or stucco cladding.</p> <p>3. Other accessory buildings (sheds, playhouses, pool houses) should be located in the rear yard and will not result in the loss of significant soft landscaping.</p> <p>8. New garages shall not normally be attached to the front or side facades of existing buildings but may be attached to the rear of the building. Exceptions may be made for attached garages set back significantly from the front façade in order to reduce their impact on the cultural heritage value of the associated streetscape.</p> | <p>The proposed new garage is situated below the proposed pool house. Below-grade garages are not normally supported, however contextually for this property, it will allow the existing driveway placement to be maintained while also eliminating the need to have two separate structures, minimizing the impact on the Manor Avenue streetscape, and increasing the property's soft landscaping coverage.</p> <p>The proposed pool house and garage structure is clad in wood and has cross gable roof, complimenting the existing Grade I house.</p> |
| <p>7.4.3 Landscape Guidelines – New Buildings and Additions</p>             | <p>1. New buildings and additions to existing buildings shall respect the heritage attributes of the lot's existing hard and soft landscape</p> <p>2. New buildings and additions will be sited on a property to respect the established landscaped character of the streetscape.</p>   | <p>Given that the previously proposed severance has lapsed, the entirety of the lot was considered in evaluating this proposal.</p> <p>While the grade will be altered to facilitate a below-grade garage, the proposed placement of the garage under the pool house will minimize the accessory building's lot</p>   |

|  |   |  |
|--|---|--|
|  | <p>3. The existing landscaped character of a lot will be preserved, when new buildings and additions are constructed.</p> <p>7. Setbacks, topography and existing grades, trees, pathways and special features, such as stone walls and front walks shall be preserved.</p> <p>10. Existing grades shall be maintained.</p> | <p>coverage and reduce its height and visual impact along the Manor Avenue streetscape. The proposed green canopy above the garage will contribute to the property's soft landscaped character. Further, maintaining the driveway's existing location eliminates the need to interrupt the landscape along Hillcrest Road with a new driveway. The proposed design will generally maintain the remainder of the property's existing grades.</p> <p>The conservation of several existing trees, the newly planted cedar hedge along Hillcrest Drive, the softening of the existing stone wall along Manor Avenue with boulders and landscaping, and the reinstatement of the original stone wall along Hillcrest Road will ensure that the property's heritage landscape attributes are maintained.</p> |
|--|---|--|



#### Document 4 – Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

|  |   |
|--|---|
| <p>1. Conserve the heritage value of an historic place. Do not remove, replace or substantially alter its intact or repairable character defining elements. Do not move a part of an historic place if its current location is a character-defining element.</p>                   | <p>The proposal is consistent with these Standards. The proposal will not result in the removal, replacement or substantial alteration of the property's existing character defining elements. The character of the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District will not be negatively impacted since both the house and landscape will be retained and conserved.</p> |
| <p>2. Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.</p> | <p>The proposed new additions will be physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the original building in their scale, massing, heights, placement, setbacks and materials.</p>   |
| <p>3. Create any new additions or related new construction so that the essential form and integrity of an historic place will not be impaired if the new work is removed in the future</p>   |   |