



Environment and Climate Change Committee

Minutes

Meeting #: 4
Date: Monday, June 5, 2023
Time: 9:30 am
Location: Andrew S. Haydon Hall, 110 Laurier Avenue West, and by electronic participation

Present: Chair: Councillor Shawn Menard, Vice-chair: Councillor Marty Carr, Councillor Riley Brockington, Councillor David Brown, Councillor Cathy Curry, Councillor Sean Devine, Councillor David Hill, Councillor Theresa Kavanagh, Councillor Rawlson King, Councillor Matt Luloff, Councillor Tim Tierney

1. Notices and meeting information for meeting participants and the public
Notices and meeting information are attached to the agenda and minutes, including: availability of simultaneous interpretation and accessibility accommodations; *in camera* meeting procedures; information items not subject to discussion; personal information disclaimer for correspondents and public speakers; notices regarding minutes; and remote participation details.
Accessible formats and communication supports are available, upon request.
Except where otherwise indicated, reports requiring Council consideration will be presented to Council on June 14, 2023 in Environment and Climate Change Committee Report 4.
The deadline to register by phone to speak, or submit written comments or visual presentations is 4 pm on Friday, June 2, and the deadline to register to speak by email is 8:30 am on Monday, June 5.
This draft Minutes document contains a summary of the disposition of items and actions taken at the meeting. This document does not include all

of the text that will be included in the final Minutes, such as the record of written and oral submissions. Recorded votes and dissents contained in this draft Minutes document are draft until the Minutes of the meeting are confirmed by the Committee. The final draft Minutes will be published with the agenda for the next regular Committee meeting and, once confirmed, will replace this document.

2. Declarations of Interest

No Declarations of Interest were filed.

3. Confirmation of Minutes

3.1 ECCC Minutes 3 - Tuesday, April 18, 2023

Carried

4. Responses to Inquiries

4.1 OCC 2023-04 / ECCC 2023-02 - Tewin Tree Cutting

Deferred to ECCC meeting of 20 June 2023

5. Office of the City Clerk

5.1 Status Update – Environment and Climate Change Committee Inquiries and Motions for the period ending May 25, 2023

File No. ACS2023-OCC-CCS-0065 - City-wide

Report recommendation

That the Environment and Climate Change Committee receive this report for information.

Received

6. Public Works Department

6.1 Update on the Provincial Blue Box Program Transition

File No. ACS2023-PWD-SWS-0002 – City-wide

At the outset, Mr. Alain Gonthier, General Manager, Public Works Department (PWD) introduced Ms Shelley McDonald, Director, Solid Waste Service, PWD, Ms Andrea Gay-Farley, Program Manager, Program Planning, PWD, and Ms Nichole Hoover-Bienasz, Program Manager, Long Term Planning, PWD.

Each, in turn, spoke to various elements of the program as outlined in a detailed slide presentation which served as an overview of the report. A copy of the presentation is held on file with the Office of the City Clerk. The presenters then responded to questions from the Committee.

With questions to staff and Committee discussions having concluded, the report recommendations were put before the Committee and were then 'CARRIED', as presented. The following Direction to Staff was also provided:

Direction to Staff (Councillor D. Hill)

That staff include in the new Solid Waste Master Plan options for greater education outreach, including exploring broader options for engagement with local school boards.

Report recommendations

That the Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend Council:

- 1. Receive, for information, the outcomes of contract negotiations associated with the transition to the Provincial Blue Box Program under Individual Producer Responsibility and further details on the transition period (from July 1, 2023 to December 31, 2025); and**
- 2. Delegate the authority to the General Manager of the Public Works Department to make consequential amendment(s) to the Solid Waste Management By-law No. 2012-370 arising from the implementation of Individual Producer Responsibility during the transition period; and**
- 3. Delegate the authority to the General Manager of the Public Works Department to finalize and execute a short-term, three-**

month extension (January 1, 2026 to March 29, 2026) for the residential curbside collection contract for collection services excluding recycling collection, with each of the existing curbside collection service providers, including the In-House Collections Group, in accordance with section 22(1)(d) of the Procurement By-law, and as described in this report.

Carried

6.2 Curbside Waste Diversion Policy

File No. ACS2023-PWD-SWS-0003 – City-wide

Mr. Alain Gonthier, General Manager, Public Works Department (PWD), again introduced Ms Shelley McDonald, Director, Solid Waste Service, PWD, Ms Andrea Gay-Farley, Program Manager, Program Planning, PWD, and Ms Nichole Hoover-Bienasz, Program Manager, Long Term Planning, PWD, who spoke to a detailed slide presentation overview of the report. A copy of this presentation is held on file with the Office of the City Clerk.

Also present to respond to questions were Ms Isabelle Jasmin, Deputy City Treasurer, Corporate Finance, Finance and Corporate Services Department, Mr. Roger Chapman, Director, Bylaw and Regulatory Services, Emergency and Protective Services Department, Ms Nazgol Namazi, Associate Legal Counsel, Legal Services Department and Ms Nathalie Gougeon, Auditor General.

Prior to the receipt of public delegations, a number of Motions and Directions to Staff (referenced further below), were read aloud for the benefit of all present.

The Committee then heard from the following delegations:

1. Mr. Duncan Bury⁺, Waste Watch Ottawa
2. Ms Kate Reekie^{*}, Community Associations for Environmental Sustainability (CAFES)
3. Ms Alice Irene Whittaker⁺, Ecology Ottawa
4. Mr. Brian Tansey^{*}

5. Ms Phillipa MacDonald
6. Mr. Jayson MacLean
7. Ms Jennifer Humphries

Correspondence was also received from the following:

- 1 Ms Lisa, Mr. Mitchell and Mr. Beau Levy (The Levys*)
- 2 Mr. David C. Eggett*
- 3 Ms Sara McMillan*
- 4 Mr. John Gervais*
- 5 Ms Frances Sander*
- 6 Mr. Alan Bezanson*
- 7 Mr. Brad Carter*
- 8 Mr. John Murray**

[+ Slide presentations / visuals / #videos held on file with the Office of the City Clerk.]

*[* Individuals / groups marked with an asterisk above either provided comments in writing or by e-mail; all submissions and presentations are held on file with the Office of the City Clerk.]*

*[** Correspondence received after deadline for submissions to Committee had passed.]*

Following questions to the delegations and to staff, and at the conclusion of Committee discussions, the Motions introduced earlier were voted upon as follows :

Motion N° ECCC 2023 04-01

Moved by Councillor R. King:

WHEREAS staff are recommending changes to Ottawa's Curbside Waste Diversion Policy;

WHEREAS the changes to the policy aim to encourage residents to alter their disposal habits and encourage more sustainable waste management habits;

WHEREAS the recommended policy would require some level of change for all residents;

WHEREAS approximately 58 per cent of what residents are placing at the curb could be diverted through the City's recycling or green bin programs;

WHEREAS the purpose of this policy is to encourage residents to evaluate what they are setting out for garbage collection and increase use of the existing recycling and green bin programs.

WHEREAS staff are recommending a "Partial Pay-As-You Throw" program with an annual allotment of garbage items with the option of additional tags to be purchased by residents.

WHEREAS Committee and Council will be provided an Implementation Plan and Readiness Update by Q1 2024 (or four months prior to program implementation) to help with the changes to curbside waste;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that with the Implementation Plan incorporate an education plan for residents that includes:

- a. Identifying barriers and challenges under our current system and target the communications plan to address these concerns and encourage positive participation in the new Curbside Waste Diversion program;
- b. Developing a response plan for illegal dumping, specifically around high rise buildings, low-income neighbourhoods and areas that are known for large garbage items to be placed on curbs and next to buildings;
- c. Ensure that targeted communication campaigns include opportunities for residents to participate in waste audits and explore opportunities to expand the educational campaign to schools and community housing;
- d. Ensure that the one-time capital ask of \$3.5 million in 2024, funded from the reserve, focus on education and outreach first in communities where there is currently a lower participation in the curbside waste diversion program; and

- e. That as part of implementation planning, staff develop a set of proposed metrics to assess enhanced outreach performance in communities with lower diversion rates as part of the Implementation and Readiness Update report in Q1 2024 prior to launch; and
- f. As part of staff's report back to Council on the policy changes, that staff report back on performance metrics assessing the effects of enhanced outreach efforts in communities with lower diversion rates.

Carried

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-02

Moved by Vice-Chair M. Carr:

WHEREAS Council is scheduled to receive the draft Solid Waste Master Plan by Q4 2023, prior to a final round of consultation; and

WHEREAS the Curbside Waste Diversion Policy is just one of the elements of the proposed Solid Waste Master Plan in addition to other options such as Multi-Residential Waste Diversion, Food Waste Reduction Strategy, Expansion of the Take It Back! Program, Textile Waste Diversion, Separate Bulky Waste Collection and Recycling, Automated Cart System, Waste to Energy, Anaerobic Digestion, etc; and

WHEREAS the Curbside Waste Diversion Policy recommendation before Council is a "Partial Pay-As-You-Throw" program that would require residents to tag every garbage item set out at the curb, and some residents have expressed concerns with the administrative burden of this recommendation; and

WHEREAS in 2007, the City's garbage item limit was set to six items every two weeks and that limit was not changed with the introduction of the Green Bin program in 2010, the switch to bi-weekly collection in 2012 or the modifications to the Green Bin program in 2019; and

WHEREAS the current solid waste fee for residents of Ottawa is \$130 annually and would be expected to rise considerably with a status quo approach to curbside collection alone; and

WHEREAS the City’s current average curbside garbage set-out is 2.1 items every two weeks and Council recognizes it is industry best practice to set a garbage limit at or below the average set-out to increase the waste diversion rate; and

WHEREAS the most common PAYT program implemented in Ontario is a partial PAYT system where tags are only required above a certain limit including in nearby municipalities such as Brockville, Mississippi Mills, Carleton Place, Kingston, South Stormont, etc.; and

WHEREAS a transitional allotment of tags, with no expiry date, would provide residents with flexibility at the outset of the program’s implementation in July 2024, allowing them to better manage the transition;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT Recommendation 1A in the Curbside Waste Diversion Policy report (ACS2023-PWD-SWS-0003) be amended to read: “A Partial Pay-As-You-Throw program with a bi-weekly limit of two garbage items set-out every two weeks, with the option of additional tags to be purchased by residents to set out garbage items above the bi-weekly item limit;” and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that households be provided with 15 tags, at no cost and with no expiry date, as a one-time allocation to assist with the transition to the new Partial PAYT program; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that households are permitted to place a third untagged garbage item at the curbside the last week of December and the first week of January.

For (5): T. Kavanagh, S. Devine, R. King, M. Carr and S. Menard

Against (5): M. Luloff, D. Hill, T. Tierney, R. Brockington and D. Brown

Lost

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-03

Moved by Councillor R. Brockington:

BE IT RESOLVED that the Brown Motion to amend the Proposed Curbside Waste Diversion Policy be amended to replace “four (4)” items with “three (3)” items in the 2nd, 7th and 8th resolutions.

For (2): T. Kavanagh and R. Brockington

Against (8): M. Luloff, D. Hill, S. Devine, T. Tierney, R. King, D. Brown, M. Carr and S. Menard

Lost

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-04

Moved by Councillor D. Brown:

WHEREAS staff have proposed changing curbside waste diversion through a partial Pay-As-You-Throw (partial PAYT) system for waste management that, if implemented, would provide residents with 55 garbage tags annually for curbside disposal and the option for residents to purchase more tags if necessary; and

WHEREAS the proposed partial PAYT policy is estimated to improve waste diversion by 6% and extend the life of the Trail Road Landfill by two years; and

WHEREAS the proposed partial PAYT policy is estimated to cost up to \$3.5 million to implement and is estimated to operate at an annual \$1 million net-operating loss, pending confirmation based on the finalized implementation plan; and

WHEREAS during consultation, the partial PAYT was identified by residents as likely to increase illegal dumping, disproportionately increase costs on large families and lower income residents, present challenges for rural residents, and create sanitary concerns; and

WHEREAS Partial PAYT and Firm Garbage Limits were tied for the number one curbside diversion option of residents surveyed through an independent panel commissioned by the City; and

WHEREAS staff are in the process of developing and recommending a variety of other policies that are likely to have an equal or greater impact on extending the life of the Trail Road Landfill as a Partial PAYT program.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the report be revised to replace the “Partial Pay-As-You-Throw” program outlined in Report Recommendation 1 with a Firm Garbage Limit policy; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Report Recommendation 1 be amended to read as follows:

1. Approve the following changes to the City’s current residential curbside collection policy:
 - a. A Firm Garbage Limit program with an enforced allotment of 4 garbage items every 2 weeks, with a phased-in implementation plan.
 - b. Expansion to the City’s Special Considerations Program to include non-hazardous medical waste;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Report Recommendation 2 be amended to read as follows:

2. Direct staff to include the required amounts for capital and operating necessary to facilitate the Firm Garbage Limit program as part of the 2024 Budget process;

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Report Recommendation 3 be amended to read as follows:

3. Delegate the authority to the General Manager of the Public Works Department to make the related amendments to the Solid Waste Management By-law No. 2012-370 to implement the changes to the curbside collection policy, as directed in recommendation 1; and,

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Report Recommendation 4 be amended to read as follows:

4. Direct staff to provide Committee and Council with a phased-in Implementation Plan and Readiness Update no later than Q4 2023 with the goal of beginning the implementation of the policy prior to Q2 2024.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that, in conjunction with the preparation of an Implementation Plan and Readiness Update, staff provide a

cost analysis for Committee and Council’s consideration to develop an exemption process so as to better support large families, “Good Samaritans” who collect garbage in their communities, low-income residents, farmers, and others who are most likely to be disproportionately impacted by such a policy change; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that staff report back to Committee and Council with an analysis of the costs and impacts of increased collection beyond the 4 item allotment on weeks which follow major statutory holidays; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that staff provide Committee and Council with an estimate of the cost savings accomplished by implementing a firm 4-item limit instead of the staff proposed partial PAYT system, and that staff provide Committee and Council with options for how the delta in cost savings could be instead invested improving City-wide waste management, including by improving communication and education.

For (5): M. Luloff, D. Hill, T. Tierney, R. Brockington and D. Brown

Against (5): T. Kavanagh, S. Devine, R. King, M. Carr and S. Menard

Lost

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-05

Moved by Councillor D. Brown (for Councillor S. Desroches):

WHEREAS the City of Ottawa’s Office of the Auditor General (OAG) reviewed the Procurement Practices Related to the Source Separated Organics Contract in 2011 and presented to Audit Committee and Council in 2014; and

WHEREAS the OAG provided a follow-up to the 2011 Audit of Procurement Practices Related to the Source Separated Organics Contract, tabled at Audit Committee in 2018; and

WHEREAS the OAG reached a conclusion that data supporting the 20-year contract with Orgaworld Canada Ltd (Orgaworld) was not correctly interpreted; and

WHEREAS the City of Ottawa’s Solid Waste Services are relying on

key data to support the approval of the Curbside Waste Diversion Policy; and

WHEREAS the City of Ottawa has, in the past, asked the OAG for independent reviews of prior decisions in areas such as transit;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend Council request that the OAG consider a review of the data used by Solid Waste Services to support the Curbside Waste Diversion Policy including, but not limited to, waste volume projections, landfill waste capacity, waste diversion projections, and proposed financial projections; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT the Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend Council defer final consideration and approval of the Curbside Waste Diversions Policy until the OAG has reported back to Council on their findings to ensure the accuracy of supportive data.

For (5): M. Luloff, D. Hill, T. Tierney, R. Brockington and D. Brown

Against (5): T. Kavanagh, S. Devine, R. King, M. Carr and S. Menard

Lost

The report recommendations were then put before Committee and were voted on as noted below:

Moved by Vice-Chair M. Carr:

That the Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend that Council:

- 1. Approve the following changes to the City's current residential curbside collection policy, as outlined in this report, including:**
 - a. A Partial Pay-As-You-Throw program with an annual allotment of 55 garbage items with the option of additional tags to be purchased by residents;**
 - b. Expansion to the City's Special Considerations Program to include non-hazardous medical waste;**

2. **Direct staff to include the required amounts for capital and operating expenditures and for user fees, as detailed in the report, as part of the 2024 Budget process;**
3. **Delegate the authority to the General Manager of the Public Works Department to make the related amendments to the Solid Waste Management By-law No. 2012-370 to implement the changes to the curbside collection policy, as outlined in this report; and,**
4. **Direct staff to provide Committee and Council with an Implementation Plan and Readiness Update no later than Q1 2024 (or four months prior to program implementation).**

For (4) : M. Luloff, D. Hill, T. Tierney and D. Brown

Against (6) : T. Kavanagh, S. Devine, R. King, R. Brockington, M. Carr and S. Menard

Lost

With the report recommendation having "LOST", the report will proceed for Council's consideration to its meeting of Wednesday, 14 June 2023 with a recommendation that will read, "**That Council consider this matter.**"

Councillor King's Motion (ECCC 2023 04-01), having been 'Carried', but with the report recommendation having 'Lost', the Motion will again have to be moved at Council and seconded by another member of City Council.

The following Directions to Staff were also provided:

Directions to Staff

A. Councillor R. King (for Councillor L. Johnson)

That staff be directed to:

- a. Ensure that an equity-lens is applied to program roll-out, recognizing that purchasing additional tags will place a disproportionate financial burden on low-income residents.;
- b. Ensure consideration for how the City can support all low-income residents to access tags, including but not limited to, residents on

social assistance, students, the working poor, seniors on fixed pensions and those with temporary residence status.

- c. Utilize data from the City's 2018-2019 Four Season Curbside Waste Audit Study to target public education measures at communities where there is currently a lower participation in diversion programs.

B. Councillor R. King

That staff be directed to work with Ottawa Community Housing (OCH) and other non-profit housing organizations and to help harmonize existing practices, increase staff and tenant knowledge of waste diversion and to consider the unique and diverse needs of their tenants when initiating the City's Implementation Plan and Readiness Update for Q1 of 2024 (or four months prior to implementation).

C. Councillor D. Hill

That staff review options to consider the diversion of Construction and Demolition Solid Waste products from the Trail Landfill with options back to committee by Q4 2023

D. Councillor T. Kavanagh

That Staff work with property managers of multi-residential dwelling units to discuss bag tagging requirements for multi-residential dwellings using common pads.

7. In Camera Items

There were no *in camera* items.

8. Information Previously Distributed

8.1 Use of Delegated Authority during 2022 by Revenue Services under the Delegation of Authority By-law

File No. ACS2023-FCS-REV-0003 – City-wide

9. Notices of Motions (For Consideration at Subsequent Meeting)

9.1 Councillor D. Hill - Green Construction – Consumer Financing

WHEREAS the city of Ottawa declared a Climate Emergency on April 24, 2019; and

WHEREAS the city of Ottawa has declared a housing and homelessness emergency on January 29, 2020; and

WHEREAS the City Council has committed to build 151,000 homes by 2031

WHEREAS the City of Ottawa has explored and implemented innovative financing models to support retrofitting existing homes to increase energy efficiency, including the Better Homes Ottawa Loan Program; and

WHEREAS creating financing models to support consumer choice allows the City to support its climate change objectives while reducing front end financing barriers to home buyers.

THEREFORE, BE IT RESOLVED THAT staff be directed to investigate options with financial institutions and other levels of government for green financing models that would reduce the up-front financing barriers to home buyers considering the purchase of new homes with green and energy efficiency technologies.

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT staff provide an update on this effort for Environment Committee’s review by Q1 2024.

10. Inquiries

There were no Inquiries.

11. Other Business

11.1 Reestablishment of Council Sponsors Group – Waste Management

At the Environment and Climate Change Committee meeting of Monday, 5 June 2023, with the will of the Committee, Vice-Chair Marty Carr introduced the following Motion to reestablish the Solid Waste Council Sponsor Group:

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-06

Moved by Councillor M. Carr:

That the following motion be added to the agenda for the Environment and Climate Change Committee meeting of June 5, 2023, pursuant to Subsection 89(3) of the Rules of Procedure, so that an expression of interest process can be completed prior to City Council's June 14, 2023, Council meeting.

WHEREAS on July 10, 2019, Council considered the staff report titled, "Solid Waste Master Plan Roadmap" and approved the establishment of a Council Sponsors Group to work with staff on the development of the Solid Waste Master Plan through each phase, as described in the report; and

WHEREAS the Sponsors Group reviewed and provided input/feedback on the project plan and detailed timeline, on specific areas for inclusion in reports, on the draft consultation plan, on the draft vision statement, guiding principles, goals and targets prior to consultation, on the proposed options analysis prior to consultation, and on the draft and final recommended Plans; and

WHEREAS the Public Works Department is recommending the re-establishment of the Sponsors Group for this term of Council, to work with staff on the next steps in the Solid Waste Master Plan including initiatives that support increasing waste diversion, reuse and recycling; and

WHEREAS on December 7, 2022, Council directed the City Clerk to bring forward a report on matters relating to advisory bodies and staff has advised that they will incorporate any forthcoming guidance from the City Clerk and/or direction from Council into the operation of the Solid Waste Council Sponsors Group;

WHEREAS staff have proposed that the Sponsors Group should include the following composition:

- **Chair, Environment and Climate Change Committee;**
- **Vice Chair, Environment and Climate Change Committee;**

- **Councillor(s) able to provide rural, urban and suburban representation; and**
- **A designate from the Mayor's Office;**

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend that Council approve the establishment of a new Solid Waste Council Sponsors Group as described in this Motion; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Environment and Climate Change Committee direct the Director of Solid Waste services, in coordination with the Office of the City Clerk, to circulate an expression of interest for membership on the Sponsors Group to all Members of Council and submit the proposed membership for Council's consideration at its June 14, 2023 meeting.

Councillor D. Hill proposed the following Motion as a substitution to Vice-Chair Carr's Motion:

Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-07

Moved by Councillor D. Hill:

WHEREAS on July 10, 2019, Council considered the staff report titled, "Solid Waste Master Plan Roadmap" and approved the establishment of a Council Sponsors Group to work with staff on the development of the Solid Waste Master Plan through each phase; and

WHEREAS staff have proposed that the Sponsors Group be re-established for the 2022-2026 Term of Council and should include the following composition:

- **Chair, Environment and Climate Change Committee;**
- **Vice Chair, Environment and Climate Change Committee;**
- **Councillor(s) able to provide rural, urban and suburban representation; and**
- **A designate from the Mayor's Office;**

WHEREAS the recommended structure does not provide for a representative mix of Councillors and provides disproportionate influence from un-elected participants; and

WHEREAS Council may establish sub-committees to address specific policy matters within a Standing Committee’s mandate; and

WHEREAS, unlike a Sub-Committee, the structure of a Sponsors Group does not support public oversight, transparency, and participation, including matters such as formal *Rules of Procedure*, meeting minutes, open meetings, and public delegations;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the Environment and Climate Change Committee recommend that City Council approve the establishment of a new Solid Waste Sub-committee instead of a Sponsor’s Group; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Sub-committee’s membership include the following:

- **The Vice-Chair of the Environment and Climate Change Committee**
- **6 Councillors, including:**
 - **2 Councillors representing rural Wards;**
 - **2 Councillors representing suburban Wards, 1 from the East end and another from the West end of the City; and**
 - **2 Councillors representing urban Wards.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that the Environment and Climate Change Committee direct the Director of Solid Waste Services, in coordination with the Office of the City Clerk, to circulate an expression of interest for membership on the Sub-committee to all Members of Council and submit the proposed membership for Council’s consideration at its June 14, 2023, meeting; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Council direct the Office of the City Clerk to work with Solid Waste Services to bring forward recommended Terms of Reference for the Sub-Committee, for approval by Environment Committee and Council as soon as possible.

During deliberations, the above Motion was amended to replace “*Vice-Chair*” of the Environment and Climate Change Committee with “*Chair*” in the proposed Sub-Committee’s membership. Discussions having concluded, the Committee voted on **Motion N^o ECCC 2023 04-07** (Councillor D. Hill) as follows:

For (5): M. Luloff, D. Hill, T. Tierney, R. Brockington and D. Brown

Against (5): T. Kavanagh, S. Devine, R. King, M. Carr and S. Menard

Lost

The original **Motion ECCC N^o 2023 04-06** (Vice-Chair M. Carr) was then put before the Committee and was 'Carried' as presented.

Carried

12. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned at 3:04 pm.

Next Meeting - June 20, 2023.

Committee Coordinator

Chair