A HERITAGE IMPACT ASSESSMENT 480 Coverdale Road Ottawa, Ontario





John Stewart, Commonwealth Historic Resource Management June 2023

AUTHORS QUALIFICATIONS

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management is a consulting and management firm that offers services related to conservation, planning, research, and interpretation for historical and cultural resources. The firm was incorporated in 1986.

John J. Stewart, B.L.A., O.A.L.A., C.S.L.A., CAHP, a principal of Commonwealth is a specialist in the planning and design of cultural resources, building conservation, and commercial area revitalization. A graduate of the University of Guelph, he received additional training at Cornell University (USA) and Oxford University (UK) and holds a diploma in the Conservation of Monuments from Parks Canada, where he worked as Head, Restoration Services Landscape Section. Before Commonwealth's formation, Stewart served for four years as the first director of Heritage Canada's Main Street Program.

Stewart is a founding member of the Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals. He has served as the Canadian representative of the Historic Landscapes and Gardens Committee of ICOMOS and the International Federation of Landscape Architects. Stewart is a panel member with the Ottawa Urban Design Review Panel and a board member of Algonquin College Heritage Trades Program.

John J. Stewart

Principal

TABLE OF CONTENTS

AUTHC	DRS QUALIFICATIONS	1
1.0	INTRODUCTION	2
1.1	Purpose	2
1.2	Site Location, Current Conditions, and Introduction to Development Site	3
1.3	Built Context and Street Characteristics	4
1.3	Relevant Information from Council Approved Documents	8
2.0	HERITAGE RESOURCE DESCRIPTION AND HISTORY	9
2.1	Description and Neighbourhood Heritage Character	9
3.0	STATEMENT of CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST	10
3.1	Statement	10
4.0	DESCRIPTION OF THE DEVELOPMENT	12
4.1	Siting	12
4.2	Design and Massing	13
4.3	Materials and Finishes	15
4.4	Landscape	16
4.5	Clarification of the Design	18
5.0	IMPACT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	20
5.1	Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Properties in Canada	20
5.2	Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan Impacts of the Development Proposa	al 22
6.0	ALTERNATIVES AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES	27
6.1	Alternatives	27
6.2	Mitigation Measures	
6.3	Conclusions	28
7.0	BIBLIOGRAPHY / PEOPLE CONTACTED.	29
8.0	APPENDIX A: EVALUATION FORM FOR 484 CLOVERDALE ROAD	30

1.0 INTRODUCTION

1.1 Purpose

This Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) is a requirement of the City of Ottawa. The purpose of the HIA is to identify the heritage resources and values that may be impacted by the proposed development. The property at 480 Cloverdale Road is located within the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act (By-law 97-10). The property is a large, double, mid block lot located west of McKay Lake and near the northern boundary of the heritage district. The former house (see figure 2 & 3) situated on this well treed property was demolished in 2003.

The City provides a guide to preparing a heritage impact assessment. The parameters are set out in Section 4.5 of the new OP outlining when a HIA is required and its purpose to evaluate the impact of a proposed intervention (alteration, addition, partial demolition, demolition, relocation, or **new construction**) on cultural heritage resources when that intervention has the potential to:

• Adversely impact the cultural heritage value of properties designated under *Part IV* of the Ontario Heritage Act (OHA).

• Adversely impact the cultural heritage value of districts designated under *Part V* of the OHA.

This HIA follows the content outline for Heritage Impact Assessments and responds to the guidelines contained in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan. The assessment responds to the 2023 architectural designs prepared by Linebox Studio in a new application to the City of Ottawa.

The following documents were consulted in the preparation of this report:

- Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Guidelines for the Preparation of Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA), City of Ottawa.
- Village of Rockcliffe Park, Heritage Conservation District Study, Julian Smith & Associates 1997.
- Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan, July 2016 City of Ottawa (By-law 2016-089).
- Architectural Drawings, including Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations, Perspectives, and Conceptual Landscape Plans Linebox Studio April 2023.
- Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, Second Edition, 2010.
- Application for New Construction at 480 Cloverdale Road, Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District File Number: ACS2022-PIE-RHU-0007 Report to Built Heritage Sub-Committee on 8 February 2022
- LB-204 480 drawings, plans, elevations, and renderings prepared by Linebox Studio, April 2023.

Present Owner and Contact Information Jianbin Wang, President Konson Homes Inc. 378 Berkley Ave Ottawa ON. K2A2G7 (613)-869-2638 www.konsonhomes.com,

1.2 Site Location, Current Conditions, and Introduction to Development Site

The property is located within Rockcliffe Park. The site is an internal double lot backing onto the Rockcliffe Lawn and Tennis Club. To the south is Lakehurst Road, Old Prospect Road and McKay Lake are to the east and Hillsdale Road is to the north.

This area of Rockcliffe Park was sub-divided and developed beginning in the 1920s through to the present day. Homes along Cloverdale are large, most are well screened with filtered views through the mixed forest canopy. The residence 484 Cloverdale is a grade 1, Cape Cod Revival style residence. Other homes along the street are generally, large, handsome interpretations of traditional architectural styles and all are classified as Grade II contributing homes. The subject property is a large double lot 85 ft wide along the street frontage, with a notch along the north expanding to 102 ft wide for most of the property that extending 234 ft deep. The property to the south is undeveloped and tennis courts are located to the east. As the aerial view illustrates a canopy of mature trees is a feature of this section of Rockcliffe Park.



Figure 1: Aerial view surrounding the site illustrating the context. Site Arrowed. Source: GeoOttawa.



Figure 2 & 3 Two Aerial views 1965 and 2022 illustrating the house that was demolished at 480 Cloverdale. The layout with the garage to the south and the house set back is very similar to the proposed new house layout. Source: GeoOttawa.



1.3 Built Context and Street Characteristics



ZONING MATRIX

ZONING	REQUIRED	EXISTING	PROPOSED
MIN. LOT AREA	925m ²	-	-
MIN. LOT WIDTH	27.0m	25.9m	25.9m
MIN. FRONT YARD SETBACK	4.5m	6.0m	8.7m
MIN. REAR YARD SETBACK	12.0m	n/a	23.4m
MIN. SIDE YARD SETBACK	4.5m	n/a	5.1m
MAX. BUILDING HEIGHT	8.5m	n/a	8.5m
GFA - PROPOSED	780m ^{2 (based on FSI)}	n/a	759.01 m ²
FSI - PROPOSED	0.375	n/a	0.365

SITE STATISTICS - NEIGHBOURHOOD COMPARISON

ADDRESS	BUILDING GRADE	LOT AREA	BUILDING FOOT PRINT	LAND COVERAGE	BUILDING HEIGHT	HARDSCAPE DRIVEWAY	% HARDSCAPE DRIVEWAY	HARDSCAPE OTHER	% HARDSCAPE OTHER
480 CLOVERDALE RD PROPOSED	n/a	2,080m ²	464m ²	22%	2 STOREYS	155m ²	7%	24m ²	1%
484 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEI	1,115m ²	225m²	20%	2 STOREYS	55m²"	5%	n/a ^{**}	n/a**
540 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,548m²	447m ²	29%	3 STOREYS	268m²*	17%	305m²*	20%
475 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,194m²	296m²	25%	2 STOREYS	44m ^{2*}	4%	109m²*	9%
467 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,231 m²	339m²	28%	2 STOREYS	139m²"	11%	80m²*	7%
461 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,230m²	310m²	25%	3 STOREYS	170m²*	14%	243m²*	20%
455 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	2,719m²	750m²	28%	3 STOREYS	278m²*	10%	185m²*	7%
446 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADE II	944m²	232m²	25%	3 STOREYS	136m²*	14%	65m²*	7%

* VALUES ARE APPROXIMATE AND REQUIRE LAND SURVEYS TO BE VERIFIED ** HEAVY FOLIAGE PREVENTS ANALYSIS OF REAR YARD LANDSCAPING





Figure 5: View looking south. The streetscape features a mature wooded landscape of mixed trees, terraced plantings screening the homes, with front lawns containing a variety of flowering plants, shrubs, and mature trees visible from the driveways that interrupt the tree canopy and create picturesque points of view focusing on the homes. Source: Google Earth.



Figure 6: View of 484 Cloverdale Road to the north of the development site. The property is a 11/2 Storey Grade 1 contributing property within the context of the HCD. The front yard with fruit trees and manicured lawn are defining features of this property and support the picturesque traditions of the HCD as seen from the street. A two-storey addition in the rear yard takes up most of the soft landscape and presents a much larger footprint than is suggested from the street. Source: Google Earth.



Figure 7: Winter view of the Hart Massey House is an art piece in the landscape overlooking MacKay Lake. This distinct residence just one block east of the subject property illustrates the eclectic range of styles that Rockcliffe Park features. Attributes of the residence such as the raised floor on stilts, clean lines and modularity are suggested in the proposed Cloverdale project. Source: Thomas d'Aquino. <u>http://thomasdaquino.ca/house-and-qarden/</u>

1.3 Relevant Information from Council Approved Documents

The following council approved documents are relevant to the assessment of the proposed development, including:

- Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Study completed in 1997; and,
- Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan, 2016.
- Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada 2010
- The City's Official Plan ("OP"), including the Rockcliffe Park Secondary Plan ("SP"), and the City's Zoning By-law ("ZBL"). For development within a HCD, the OP encourages, among other requirements, meeting "intensification targets ... through context-sensitive infill that conserves cultural heritage attributes" (s. 3.2.13).
- The Provincial Policy Statement, 2020 ("PPS") s. 2.6.1 directs that "significant built heritage resources and significant cultural heritage landscapes shall be conserved." While this policy is implemented through the OP and SP, the most direct and detailed implementation occurs through the HCDP.

2.0 HERITAGE RESOURCE DESCRIPTION AND HISTORY

2.1 Description and Neighbourhood Heritage Character

The history of Rockcliffe Park is outlined in detail in Julian Smith & Associates *Heritage Conservation District Study* completed in 1997. The area was subdivided beginning in the 1920s.

The development site is located near the northern edge of the HCD in a mature section of the district next to tennis courts and McKay Lake to the east. The area contains an eclectic mix of architectural styles, including Tudor Revival, International, Contemporary Ranch, Cape Cod, and vernacular Queen Anne along with Chateaux style. With the exception of the Cape Cod Revival the residences surrounding the site are visually, large, two-storey buildings set into the landscape.



Figure 8: Detail plan of the Rockcliffe Park HCD illustrating the heritage context with the Grade I building on the single lot next door, (in red), a vacant lot to the south and the tennis courts backing onto the property. Site Arrowed. Source: City of Ottawa.

3.0 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE Value or interest

3.1 Statement

The following Statement of Cultural Heritage Value identifies the primary heritage values and attributes of the HCD.

Rockcliffe Park is a rare and significant approach to residential land subdivision and landscape design adapted to Canada's natural landscape from 18th-century English precedents. Originally purchased from the Crown by Thomas MacKay, it was laid out according to the principles of the Picturesque tradition in a series of "Park and Villa" lots by his son-in-law Thomas Keefer in 1864. The historical associations of the village with the MacKay/Keefer family, who were influential in the economic, social, cultural, and political development of Ottawa continue and the heritage conservation district is a testament to the ideas and initiatives of various key members of this extended family, and their influence in shaping this area. Rockcliffe Park today is a remarkably consistent reflection of Keefer's original design intentions. Although development of the residential lots has taken place very gradually, the ideas of estate management, of individual lots as part of a larger whole, of Picturesque design, of residential focus, have survived. This continuity of vision is very rare in a community where development has occurred on a relatively large scale over such a long time.

The preservation of the natural landscape, the deliberately curved roads, lined with mature trees, and without curbs or sidewalks, the careful landscaping of the public spaces and corridors, together with the strong landscaping of the individual properties, create the apparently casual and informal style so integral to the Picturesque tradition. The preservation and enhancement of topographical features, including the lake and pond, the internal ridges and slopes, and the various rock outcroppings, has reinforced the original design intentions. The views to and from the Ottawa River, the Beechwood escarpment, and the other park areas are integral to the Picturesque quality of Rockcliffe Park.

Beechwood Cemetery and the Rockeries serve as a compatible landscaped boundary from the earliest period of settlement through to the present. The various border lands create important gateways to the area and help establish its particular character.

The architectural design of the buildings and associated institutional facilities is similarly deliberate and careful. Many of the houses were designed by architects, in a variety of the architectural styles that have been popular since the first decades of the 20th century, including Georgian Revival, Tudor Revival, and Arts and Crafts. The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines, has maintained the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer.

The attributes of the Rockcliffe Park HCD are:

- The siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the neighbouring buildings.
- the variety of mature street trees and the dense forested character that they create.
- the profusion of trees, hedges, and shrubs on private property.
- varied lot sizes and irregularly shaped lots.
- spacing and setbacks of the buildings.
- cedar hedges planted to demarcate property lines and to create privacy.
- the dominance of soft landscaping over hard landscaping.
- wide grass verges.
- the high concentration of buildings by architect Allan Keefer.
- the rich mix of building types and styles from all eras, with the Tudor Revival and Georgian Revival styles forming a large proportion of the total building stock.
- the predominance of stucco and stone houses and the relative rarity of brick buildings.
- the narrow width of many streets,
- the road pattern that still reflects the original design established by Thomas Keefer when he originally laid out the area for residential development.
- the low, dry-stone walls that demarcate property lines in certain areas of the Village.
- Informal landscapes character with simple walkways, driveways, stone retaining walls and flowerbeds.
- the "dog walk," a public footpath that extends from Old Prospect Road to corner of Lansdowne Road and Mariposa Avenue.
- the public open spaces including the Village Green and its associated Jubilee Garden.
- institutional and recreational buildings including the three schools, Rockcliffe Park Public School, Ashbury College and Elmwood School for Girls and the Rockcliffe Park Tennis Club.
- the multi-unit buildings, small lots, and more modest houses in the area referred to as the "Panhandle," that characterize the south and west boundaries of the District,

A description of the Cape Code/Colonial Revival at 484 Cloverdale Road is included as Appendix A.

4.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE DEVELOPMENT

4.1 Siting

The property at 480 Cloverdale is a large, wooded lot on the east side of Cloverdale Road, backing onto the Rockcliffe Lawn and Tennis Club. To the north is a single-family Grade I Listed residence with a 2-storey addition at the rear, and to the south the lot is vacant. Across the street large estate style houses are set back and screened by mature trees. The owner of the property has set the retention of as much of the existing tree cover as possible as one of the project directives. For this reason, the new home has been sited with a generous front yard setback in keeping with other houses on the street; a series of different scaled pavilions have been staged ensuring the footprint has minimum impact to the environment and does not dominate or interfere with the existing streetscape of Cloverdale Road. See the Zoning Matrix and the stats comparisons of neighbouring houses on Page 5 and 6. With clarifications to questions raised in an April 27, 2023, email (Section 4.5)

The proposed design locates substantially more of the home on the southern edge of the site to reduce the impact on the neighbouring designated house. Furthermore, on the north side of the property, the proposed home is set back over 23 meters from the property line to the extent that its' front edge is in line with the rear yard of the adjacent property. This was done to help the existing neighbours maintain the 'park like setting' they currently enjoy.



Figure 9: Site analysis illustrating grade changes, vegetation seasonal sun/shade patterns and feature views. There is a steep grade change between the front property and midway through the lot. A large retaining wall along the north property line defines the north edge of the depression. Source Linebox Studio 2022.

4.2 Design and Massing

The massing of the building is broken-up into a series of linked pavilions scaled to increase from a 1-1/2 storey green roof portion stepping to the 2-storey garage wing at the street, extending into the lot. A twostorey entrance and connection in the centre of the property links with the two main sections of the building set apart to form a courtyard and screened area sheltered from the neighbouring properties. The twostorey portion along the north is positioned away from the property line with minimal slotted windows. Mature vegetation and a live hedge buffers views along the side yard. The design concept is an Asian expression with strong modernist lines.

The existing vegetation and contour of the site are respected by locating the new building well clear of the required setbacks, thus centralizing the design to maintain the existing nature around the perimeter as much as possible. Views into the property will be much the same as all of the property edges will maintain most of the existing vegetation, particularly from the tennis courts to the east, and the street to the west. An effort has been made to ensure that the visual character from the north maintains the green continuity between properties.

The scale and siting of the home is respectful of the scale of the adjacent house at 484 Cloverdale Road and appears much less massive than buildings across the street. The massing is broken up into pavilion like sections by glass sections and subtle changes in alignment. The effect is a series of linked pavilions, which fragment the overall impression. The centre portion of the home is a two-storey entrance and will be constructed predominately in contemporary glazing units, on stilts.

This home takes full advantage of its setting with a GFA of 759 m2 including ground floor and second floor. This is a reduction from previous submissions where the GFA was 777.6M2. The basement floor area does not count towards total GFA as per City of Ottawa Zoning By-Law Exception 1259.

Impact of Covid 19 Pandemic

Although not specifically a heritage issue it is important to recognize that with the Covid 19 pandemic and requirements for lockdown and isolation, the nature of a family home is quickly changing and becoming far more inward focused with the potential of introducing amenities that had been deemed external services (theatre, gym, exercise, worship). These are now being incorporated into the basic structure of the home.

The residence is being designed to serve three generations with expectation that the entire family does not necessarily have to come together and always participate. The concept offers a series linked pods, that cater to a variety of the family's everyday needs. One of the concerns raised in the pre-consultation minutes was the distance between kitchen and dining room. This is a reasonable concern if there was just a core family. It is less valid when accommodating three generations with special catered needs, different timetables, and interests.



Figure 10: Views of the South Elevation illustrating the house from various vantage points. Source: Linebox Studio 2023.



Figure 11: Views of the street elevation from various perspectives illustrating the relationship to the neighbouring property. The main entry is set well back from the street and the neighbour to the north with a 2-storey garage volume separated by the driveway. Native plantings have been proposed to flank the driveway and permeable paving is proposed for the driveway. A softer grey masonry façade is being illustrated. The side entry of the garage eliminates views from street of a gapping garage entrance. Source: Linebox Studio 2023.



Figure 12: North Elevation from the neighbouring property. On the north side of the property, the proposed home is set back over 23 meters from the street property line to the extent that its' front edge is in the rear yard of the adjacent property. Existing mature trees and additional trees and shrubbery will buffer the massing from the neighbour. Source Linebox Studio 2023.



Contrast Casto REVATION

Figure 13: The east elevation overlooking the rear garden with the floating dining area linking the two separate pavilions. Source: Linebox Studio 2023.

4.3 Materials and Finishes

The materials used on the home will consist mainly of natural stone veneer with a rough-cut finish, including copper coping and framing of large, glazed units. A light tone of grey limestone is being used. The centre portion has minimal glazing details with slit windows along the north elevation. With the natural grade change over the property the east portion of the basement sits partially out of the ground. The intent is to have the building flow through the landscape as a series of linked units to take advantage of the setting, different views and changing light throughout the day and seasons.



Figure 14: West (Street) elevation illustrating the material palette. Linebox 2023.



Figure 15: View of the house looking west. The roof deck is a combination green roof and water feature. Source Linebox Studio

4.4 Landscape

Rockcliffe Park HCD Policies [5.0 Statement of Objectives] specifies that development should strive "To maintain the park-like attributes, qualities and atmosphere of the HCD." As indicated earlier, a comprehensive effort in retaining as much of the existing vegetation is a prime goal. Some of the highlights of the plan include:

- less front yard hardscape (7%) than what is typical of properties on street (11%)
- less 'other' hardscape (6%) than is typical of properties on street (12%)
- equivalent building coverage (21%) compared to typical coverage of properties on street (26%)
- 50 out of 54 existing trees preserved.

• a house designed to intertwine between stands of existing trees using angled volumes and raised courtyards to avoid critical root zones even the unorthodox way columns are randomly set to mimic stands of trees.

• A palette of natural, noble materials, and finishes that capture the spirit of the Rockcliffe Park as a cultural landscape.

• driveway and rear patio to be constructed of permeable pavers to allow for better drainage.



Figure 16: Perspective view of the front elevation from Cloverdale. Source: Linebox Studio 2023. The location of the views are arrowed figure 17 below.



Figure 17: Conceptual landscape plan showing the layout. The new house is setback from the street and is well back from the next-door house to the north. Source: Linebox Studio 2023.



Figure 18: Perspective view of the north elevation from the backyard at 484 Cloverdale. Source: Linebox Studio 2023



Figure 19: Perspective view of the east elevation from the tennis court will appear much the same as the well treed backyard at 484 Cloverdale will remain unprogrammed. Source: Linebox Studio 2023

4.5 Clarification of the Design

An April 27, 2023, file review raised questions of clarification for the design development. The following were provided by Linebox Studio:

- 1. Could you please confirm the reductions from the previous applications in height, GFA, length of building and amount of hardscaping? I have some figures from our discussions over the past few months, but it would be helpful to have the final numbers.
 - breakdown of previous and current statistics noting the changes.

	Previous Submission	Current Submission
Height	8.5m	8.5m
GFA	777.6 m²	759.0 m²
Length of Building	42m	38.8m
Distance from Garage to	8.3m	16.8
484 Cloverdale		
Front Yard Setback	6.70m	8.75m
Rear Yard Setback	20.1m	23.4m
Amount of Hardscape	155m2	155m2

- 2. The proposed stone masonry cladding looks like brick on the renderings, can you confirm? I don't have concerns with brick, just want to be sure it is clear what the proposed materials are.
 - There will be both stone and brick cladding, we have clarified this on the updated elevations attached Figure 14.
- 3. The landscape plan shows an existing retaining wall to remain, can you confirm there is a retaining wall and if so, what is the material?

It is confirmed that the existing retaining wall is still on the site, and that it is concrete and decorative concrete blocks. The survey identifies it with the tag 'RWC' which stands for Retaining Wall: Concrete

- 4. Has a grading plan been prepared yet? Is so, could we receive a copy?
 - There has been no grading plan prepared at this time. The existing grating plan, and we will be working with the existing grades and contours to enable maximum tree protection.
- 5. Are the decks over the garage and the dining room outdoor terraces or green roofs?
 - The 3 roofs are being planned as green roofs with limited access for maintenance only.



Figure 20: Ground floor plan. Source Linebox Studio 2023.

5.0 IMPACT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

5.1 Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Properties in Canada

The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (2010) were adopted by City Council and are used to assess applications under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The Standards and Guidelines in this particular exercise address the impact of new development at 480 Cloverdale Road as a potential new attribute to the Rockcliffe Park Conservation District.

As per the General Standards (all projects)

- Conserve the character defining elements of a historic place; The existing topography, views and viewsheds in and out of the site, the vegetation, and the property in context with the HCD are considered to be character defining. A guiding principle is the retention of the wooded area and its topography.
- 2. Do not move a component of a historic place if it is determined that the current location is a character defining element.

Construction of the house has required the replacement of four mature trees.

- 3. Find a use for a historic place that requires minimal changes to its character defining elements. The introduction of a family residence requires minimal change to the defined attributes on site to the exclusive residential nature of the District and the neighbouring Grade 1 building.
- 4. Evaluate the existing condition of the character defining elements to determine the appropriate intervention needed.

Following conservation practices, the history of the district was considered, the landscape was documented and a detailed as-found tree inventory as well as a comparative assessment of the neighbouring properties, including the relative heights, setbacks, and visual integration.

Standard 1

Conserve the heritage value of an historic place. Do not remove, replace, or substantially alter its intact or repairable character defining elements. Do not move a part of an historic place if its current location is a character-defining element.

Standard 11

Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.

Comment

The proposal is consistent with these Standards. The heritage value of the HCD is conserved, as viewsheds in and out of the property are curated to maintain the visual continuity between lots. The existing landscape features as well as the proposed building adds to the rich and diverse architecture typified in the HCD, including mature trees, soft landscaping, and grades are retained. New trees are proposed to be planted throughout the site. The building is designed with natural materials that are complementary to the attributes of the HCD and that help to integrate the building in its surroundings.

Houses in Rockcliffe Park tend to be rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition. certainly, proposed house does not exhibit the picturesque principles found in some parts of the HCD, it is certainly within the vocabulary of modern homes being constructed. A number of these homes are acknowledged as contributing to the district's value (see Figure 5). The massing of the house has been designed to acknowledge these qualities while also attempting to achieve a distinct design vision. Following the advice set out in comments the house has been further scaled back, reduced in height, with additional soft landscape to the rear.

• Subsection 4.1.4 – Spatial Organization, Guideline 13

Designing a new feature when required by a new use that is compatible with the character-defining spatial organization. The new home is situated respectfully addressing the street's spatial organization (height, setback, vegetation, attached garage, and driveway). The new house as a feature in the Rockcliffe cultural landscape is compatible in massing and scale with the District's spatial organization and is respectful of the neighbouring home at 484 Cloverdale.

• Subsection 4.1.5 – Visual Relationships, Guideline 15

The new house in its landscape respects the historic, visual relationships in the cultural landscape, including matching established setbacks, uses, the overall ratio of open space to building mass (GFA 759m2) is in excess of required guidelines, and the height in relation to neighbouring buildings visually matches the height of the rear addition of the Grade 1 building to the north. Utilizing the tree cover the views of the house from the street will be filtered and will establish a picturesque relationship.

• Subsection 4.1.8 – Vegetation, Guideline 16

This project is unique in that it is a mature wooded lot, and most trees will be retained. Introducing additional plantings is intended to ensure that the heritage value of the district's cultural landscape is

preserved, including augmenting with the planting of native species appropriate to the district plan and planting hedges to filter views and screen the new construction.

• Subsection 4.1.11 – Built Features, Guideline 15

The use of noble materials and traditional finishes (limestone, wood, and copper) in the construction of the house, and the conservation of the existing mature tree canopy as a structural element.

5.2 Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan Impacts of the Development Proposal

The following assesses the development proposal using the Conservation District Plan Guidelines for new buildings.

Description of Heritage Attributes

The attributes of the Rockcliffe Park HCD are:

"strong landscaping of the individual properties"	The proposed landscape calls for retention of trees and integration of the building into the existing topography.
"The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this	There is ample space around all sides of the property to provide generous buffering and privacy screen both looking into and out.
space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines , has maintained the estate qualities	Reducing the size of the house and flipping it away from the north has created an extended landscape separating the two buildings, a less prominent façade along the north property line, and a deeper rear yard.
and park setting envisioned by Keefer."	Initially, a chain-link fence was proposed. Considered inappropriate for Rockcliffe Park a black chain-link was screened by cedar hedges as a better alternative.
"The unobtrusive siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the	Front yard setback is respectful with an appropriate distance from the street and the neighbouring Grade 1 House. The choice of materials gives the impression of a picturesque folly, which integrates well into the Rockcliffe landscape. The house is discretely situated when viewed from the street.
neighbouring buildings"	From the side yards, the space between the building and its neighbour is generous.
"The profusion of trees, hedges, and shrubs on private property"	The Proposal maintains most trees. four mature trees will be removed and replanted.
"Generous spacing and setbacks of the buildings"	The unobtrusive siting of the house with sufficient space around the property in excess of neighbouring properties in the area offers a positive impact.
"The dominance of soft landscaping over hard landscaping"	Applicant's landscape plan demonstrates that soft landscaping will dominate.
"The rich mix of building types and styles from all eras"	The building design is a compatible contemporary design with an Asian influence.

7.4 Additions and New Construction

7.4.2 Guidelines for New Buildings

The following guidelines from the RPHCDP are relevant in the discussion of the new construction at 480 Cloverdale Road:

RPHCDP Guidelines

7.4.2.2 New buildings shall contribute to and not detract from the heritage character of the HCD and its attributes.

7.4.2.4 New buildings shall be of their own time but sympathetic to the character of their historic neighbours in terms of massing, height, and materials. New buildings are not required to replicate historical styles.

7.4.2.9 The use of natural materials, such as stone, real stucco, brick, and wood are important attributes of the HCD, and the use of materials such as vinyl siding, aluminium soffits, synthetic stucco, and manufactured stone will not be supported.

Comment:

- The new construction proposed for the site follows the management guidelines for the district in that its siting, form, materials, and detailing are sympathetic to the surrounding natural and cultural environment.
- The proposed development respects the existing lot size and density. The existing grades are largely maintained; the siting of the built form is strategically organized to retain existing trees with a sufficient setback to protect the root zone during construction. This strategic approach to the massing also addresses the relationship to the side-yards between neighbouring properties.
- As recommended in the district study, the design of the new house is "of its own time" but harmonizes with its setting in its unique presentation, and generous use of limestone and wood. The proposed house is also compatible with the existing streetscape in its height, dimensions, and function as a private family residence.
- The siting and materials of the new building have been guided by the HCD Plan and are compatible with the Grade I building next door with the length of the north elevation reduced, and the sidewall angled away from the shared property line to reduce overview. The proposed home is set back over 23 meters from the property line to the extent that its' front edge is in line with the rear yard of the adjacent property. At the same time, the mirrored footprint provides a larger green soft landscape along the north edge of the property and to the rear. Statistics on page 4 compare the zoning and building statistics and compare 480 Cloverdale with neighbouring residences.
- The landscape design is consistent with the guidelines incorporating nearly all the existing mature trees and shrubs and adds to the plantings on the property to conserve a distinct environment that will contribute to the streetscape, will provide privacy, and will support the view sheds featuring naturalistic character between properties and the tennis court to the east.

RPHCDP Guideline 7.4.7.a. and 7.4.11

7.4.2.7 In order to protect the expansive front lawns, and the generous spacing and setbacks of the buildings, identified as heritage attributes of the HCD, the following guidelines shall be used when determining the location of new houses on their lots:

a. New buildings on interior lots shall be sensitively sited in relation to adjacent buildings. Unless a new building maintains the front yard setback of a building it is replacing, the front yard setback of the new building shall be consistent with that of the adjacent building that is set closest to the street. A new building may be set back further from the street than adjacent buildings.

7.4.2.11 Terraces and balconies below the top storey (for example, on a garage roof, or one storey addition) may be recommended for approval if they do not have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding cultural heritage landscape.

Comment of Siting as it pertains to Guideline 7.4.2.7a. and 11.

The front façade is set behind the garage with the proposed home set back over 23 meters from the front property line to the extent that its' front edge is in line with the rear yard of the adjacent property. Average setbacks for each facade are significantly more than required by zoning by-law. The allowable setbacks along both the north and south side yards are indicated in yellow and the orange documenting the actual distance of the home from the lot line. Angled volumes allow for the saving of multiple trees along the north and south property lines with the building well setback from the 40 'rear setback with open unprogrammed landscape forming the core of the property.



Figure 21: Setback analysis Linebox Studio 2023.

Positive Impacts:

- New scheme reduces the building length, with lot coverage reduced to 22%; positions the smaller façade on the north side, the setback of the residence and garage relates well to the neighbouring property at 484 with the north elevation setback away from the neighbouring property. Average setbacks for each face are significantly more than required by zoning by-law.
- A series of angled volumes allows for the saving of multiple trees along the north and south property lines with the building only approach setbacks at specific points.

Negative Impacts

• This submission has taken into consideration the community comments with regard to earlier submissions and has responded with a new design incorporating mitigation measures to address these concerns by flipping the mass to the south side of the property and reducing the length and height of the building.

RPHCDP Guidelines 7.4.2.3, and 7.4.2.5

7.4.2.3 Construction of new buildings will only be permitted when the new building does not detract from the historic landscape characteristics of the associated streetscape. The front yard setback is in-line with the neighbouring Grade I house. Proposed side yard setbacks are excessively generous with room for planting of mature trees, considering their future canopy and a 70 foot unprogrammed rear yard.

The height is in accord with, and the setback designed to be respectful of the Grade I building in the associated streetscape. The front yard's treatment, and materials of the new building are compatible with the guidelines for the associated streetscape.

7.4.2.5 Integral garages shall be located in a manner that respects the cultural heritage value of the streetscape.

Impact of Massing Options as it pertains to Guideline 7.4.3 and 7.4.2.5.

The three options described below and illustrated in figure 15 are useful in illustrating possibilities for siting the building and their varying impact. The first two suggest more traditional approaches for the massing of the house and its placement on the lot. Option 1 and 2 reference neighbouring homes with a traditional footprint at the front of the property and a two and half storey front facing home with an attached garage occupying the front half of the property. (garage is orange and the building is yellow).



Figure 22: Three options considered in siting the residence and the garage. Source: Linebox Studio 2023.

setback will little room for vegetation buffer

The lot size and layout of 480 Cloverdale Road are unique with the notch along the north property line creating a bottle neck at the street frontage and a lot that is more than twice the length of

downward slope directed towards house

the adjacent lots. The reduced frontage results in side-yards between the adjacent homes being pinched in both Option 1 and 2.

Given the adjacency to 484 Cloverdale, the third option pushes the bulk of the massing east/back on the property to have a more modest street face and to not overwhelm the Grade I building. The garage at 480 is a single storey with a second-floor setback.

The third option maintains a discrete interface with the street and offers a respectful distance to the neighbour's lot-line with the bulk of the building on the south side of the lot. Overall, the height and massing - as seen from the street - as well as the landscaping (largely preserved), materiality (natural stone, wood, and copper), and setbacks (matching front yard setbacks) along with the generous side yard setback of 480 allows for a building design that complements 484 and neighbouring properties across the road.



Figures 23: A view of the west elevation from Cloverdale . The garage of the Grade 1 home projects into the notch and creates a pinch point that is compensated for with a side yard setback and shifting of the garage to the opposite side of the lot. The distance of the garage from the grade 1 garage at 384 Cloverdale is 16.8m. Source Linebox Studio.

7.4.3 Landscape Guidelines – New Buildings and Additions

2. New buildings and additions will be sited on a property to respect the established landscaped character of the streetscape.

3. The existing landscaped character of a lot will be preserved, when new buildings and additions are constructed.

4. The front lawns and side yards of new buildings shall protect the continuity and dominance of the soft landscape within the HCD.

7. Setbacks, topography and existing grades, trees, pathways, and special features, such as stone walls and front walks shall be preserved.

9. The removal of mature trees is strongly discouraged, and all applications will be subject to the appropriate bylaw and permitting process. Where a tree has to be removed to accommodate new construction, it will be replaced with a new tree of an appropriate size and species elsewhere on the lot with preference given to native species.

10. Existing grades shall be maintained.

Discussion of Landscape Guidelines 7.4.3. Positive Impacts

- The design of the landscape is contemporary with specific picturesque viewsheds and vistas of the house from the street in keeping with the Keffer vision.
- The impact to the existing property is minimal and demonstrates a unique approach that appears to integrate well with natural surroundings and blends "outdoor" and "indoor."
- The approach to the design development is positive. In most cases, the design of a new home evolves with the management of the landscape taking a subservient role and retention of existing vegetation is seen as an impediment. At 480 Cloverdale, the approach has been reversed to place the conservation of the tree canopy as a primary requirement and to meld the house in a far more plastic way to fit in.
- Changes to grade are limited and will occur along the driveway (slices topography) with minimal impact.
- The majority of the landscape is designed as unprogrammed space with hardscape limited to the driveway which will be permeable.

Negative Impacts

Negative Issues to the landscape were identified as part of the vetting process and are addressed; these included the replacement of a fence with a cedar hedge, eliminating a roof terrace and reducing the amount of hard paving with more permeable materials. The scale and massing of the house, the setbacks from the property lines and the height have all been reduced in response to the committee's comments.

6.0 ALTERNATIVES AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES

6.1 Alternatives

The design process for this project has gone through a number of alternative designs for the building its placement, massing, finishes and landscape. These were explored with the design team and reviewed by the client, the city, and the community association. Throughout the HIA, these alternatives have been highlighted and where appropriate incorporated into the new design submission.

The most-recent scheme described in this HIA has responded to recommendations with a smaller footprint, less height, and fewer areas where the topography has been altered. (See the chart in section 4.5 for a comparison of stats of previous and the current submission.)

An alternative that has guided this new submission is the flipping or mirroring the footprint with the driveway next to 484 and the smaller building on the north side. This plan mitigates the side yard setback and building massing in relation to the Garde 1 building next door.

6.2 Mitigation Measures

Mitigation measure may include:

• The inclusion of a system of green roofs as a means of reducing the impact of additional hard surfaces.

6.3 Conclusions

The plan for 480 Cloverdale Road is in keeping with the character defining attributes of the District by maintaining the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer. It acknowledges and respects the Grade 1 building next door with the "generosity of space around the proposed house, and the visual flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines." The proposed design results in a unique residential expression, which is well within the normal parameters of the HCD with regards to understated prominence on the street, setbacks, height, lot coverage and preservation of the existing vegetation.

The new construction proposed for the site follows the management guidelines for the district in that its siting, form, materials, and detailing all of which are sympathetic to the surrounding natural and cultural environment. The proposed development retains the existing lot size and density. The existing grades are maintained; the siting of the built form is strategically organized to retain existing trees with sufficient setback to protect the root zone during construction. This approach to the massing also addresses the relationship to the side-yards between neighbouring properties.

The height and mass of the new building have been adjusted and broken up to be more consistent with the Grade I buildings (484 Cloverdale) and the siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape. While the proposed house does not exhibit the picturesque principles found in some parts of the HCD, it is certainly within the vocabulary of modern homes that existed before/after designation, and the guidelines were implemented. A number of these homes are acknowledged as contributing to the District's value. As recommended in the district study, the design of the new house is "of its own time" but harmonizes with its setting in its unique presentation, and generous use of limestone, copper, and wood. The proposed house is also compatible with the existing streetscape in its height, dimensions, and functions as a private family residence.

The landscape design incorporates nearly all the existing mature trees and shrubs and adds to the plantings on the property to create a distinct environment that will provide privacy and support the naturalistic character between properties and the tennis court at the rear of the lot. As a heritage consultant and a registered landscape architect, this project has been intriguing from several perspectives. One rarely sees a design where the landscape takes precedence, and the architecture is integrated.

This home takes full advantage of its setting. The building size and form are in response to a program set out by the owner to create a home that can accommodate three generations of family, with expectation that the entire family does not necessarily have to come together and participate at all times. The concept of linked pods that has evolved capitalizes on and attempts to prioritize the site's unique characteristics (a bucolic setting, mature wooded lot, significant existing grade changes) all of which are attributes of the Rockcliffe Park ethos.



Figure 24: Comparison of the neighbouring building confirm the compatibility of 484 with its neighbours.

7.0 BIBLIOGRAPHY / PEOPLE CONTACTED.

Bibliography

- Part IV and V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Guidelines for the Preparation of Heritage Impact Assessments (City of Ottawa).
- See the Introduction for a list of references consulted.

8.0 APPENDIX A: EVALUATION FORM FOR 484 Cloverdale Road

ttawa

Municipal Address	484 Cloverdale Road	Building or		
		Property Name	042280002	
Legal Description	PLAN M61 LOT 11 AND PT LOT E;RP CAR 38 PART 1	Lot	Block	Plan
Date of Original Lot Development		Date of current structure	c. 1945	
Additions	1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at rear	Original owner	Colonel R.D.	Huestis

Main Building

Garden / Landscape / Environment	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault				
	Month/Year: June 2011				
Heritage Conservation District name Rockcliffe Park					
Character of Existing Streetscape					
Cloverdale is a sharply curving and uneven roadway that cuts generally north-south underneath the embankment which overlooks McKay Lake. This particular section of Cloverdale is situated in the middle of the embankment, and therefore properties are defined by their uneven grading and placement above the roadway. There are no curbs or sidewalks on either side of the street and therefore pedestrians and cars share the same street. The landscape features of these properties are informally arranged, featuring a variety of mature trees, lawns and gardens. This informal arrangement is enhanced by the dense growth of trees along the roadside.					
Character of Existing Property					
The property is similar to others on Cloverdale Road. The yard is primarily composed of open lawn, with three apple trees planted at even intervals near the front edge of the lawn. A maple tree is located behind the fruit trees. On the south side of the yard there is a row of trees along the property line. On the north side of the yard, the terrain dips sharply. There are coniferous trees scattered on this section of the yard. Garden beds line the exterior walls of the house, filled with shrubs. There is a straight asphalt driveway on the south side of the yard, and an asphalt pathway leading to the entrance.					
Contribution of Property to Heritage Environs					
Landscape / Open Space The property is consistent with the variety of landscape forms found on Cloverdale Road. Many of the lots are open to the street, while others are defined by hedges. Most are characterised by numerous trees, often planted towards the edge of the road. The presence of mature trees along the roadside contributes to a coherent streetscape.					
Architecture / Built Space The house is consistent with the variety of architectural forms found on Cloverdale Road.					
Landmark Status					
The house is visible from Cloverdale Road.	The house is visible from Cloverdale Road.				
Summary / Comments on Environmental Signifi	cance				
The tree-lined property contributes to the inform	al and naturalized character of Cloverdale Road.				

History	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault					
	Month/Year: June 2011					
Date of Current Building(s) c. 1945						
Trends						
In 1945, the council of the Village of Rockcliffe Park established a bylaw that required 100 foot frontages on a road for all lots falling within the area bounded by Maple Lane, Lansdowne Road, Lakeview Avenue, and Mariposa Avenue.						
density development and crowding in downtown from the city, the Village of Rockcliffe Park beca	In the early to mid 20 th century, there was an influx of families to Rockcliffe Park as a result of higher- density development and crowding in downtown Ottawa. With its scenic location and relative isolation from the city, the Village of Rockcliffe Park became a fashionable neighbourhood, perceived to be a more healthy and peaceful residential environment.					
This section of Rockcliffe was mainly developed in the post WWII period. For the most part, the buildings in this section date from the mid-20 th century and thus relate to one another in terms of their planning. The postwar development of suburbs was coupled with the expansion of the automobile industry and increased prevalence of cars as the primary means of transportation. As such, these suburbs and the architecture of the buildings within them were organized around the increasing cultural reliance on automobiles.						
Events						
Persons / Institutions						
1945: Colonel R.D. Huestis (House previously listed as 480 Cloverdale) 1950, 1960, 1966: Lt. Richard and June White 1966-1970-: Peter L and Nini MacDougall (1990)-1999 Emanuel Somers (worked for WHO) (member of Rockcliffe Park Environmental Committee) 1999- Louise Arbour						
Summary / Comments on Historical Significance						
The historical significance of this house is due t Louise Arbour.	The historical significance of this house is due to its age, constructed c. 1945, and its association with Louise Arbour.					
Historical Sources						
City of Ottawa File						

Rockcliffe LACAC file Edmond, Martha. *Rockcliffe Park: A History of the Village*. Ottawa : The Friends of the Village of Rockcliffe Park Foundation, 2005. *Village of Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Study*, 1997. *Village of Rockcliffe Park LACAC Survey of Houses*, 1988 Carver, Humphrey. *The Cultural Landscape of Rockcliffe Park Village*. Village of Rockcliffe Park, 1985. Might's Directory of the City of Ottawa

Architecture	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault
	Month/Year: June 2011

Architectural Design (plan, storeys, roof, windows, style, material, details, etc)

484 Cloverdale is a one and one half storey residence with a rectangular centre-hall plan and a steeply pitched side gable roof. The entrance is composed of a single unglazed door, with a sidelight of coloured stained glass on the south side. The entrance is flanked by pilasters and topped with a bell cast porch roof. On either side of the entrance there are eight over eight single hung sash windows with decorative shutters. On the half storey, there are three gabled wall dormers with six over six single sung sash windows. On the south side of the house there is a single storey single car garage with secondary entrance and balcony above. On the north side of the house there one and one land storey wing, with a shallow projection on the first storey with a six over six single hung sash window with decorative shutters.

Architectural Style

The house has elements of Colonial Revival/Cape Cod styles.

Designer / Builder / Architect / Landscape Architect

Unknown

Architectural Integrity

1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at rear

Outbuildings

Other

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management

Summary / Comments on Architectural Significance

This house is a good example of Colonial Revival type architecture that became popular in Rockcliffe as the village became a fashionable retreat from the City, and increasing residents demanded higher density housing.



Figure 26: Geo Ottawa aerial view 1965 illustrating the position of 284 in relationship to 480 Cloverdale. A twostorey addition to the rear of 484 Cloverdale added in 2001 leaving about a 9m rear yard.

PHASE TWO EVALUATION					
ENVIRONMENT CATEGORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Character of Existing Streetscape		Х			20/30
2. Character of Existing Property	Х				30/30
3. Contribution to Heritage Environs	Х				30/30
4. Landmark Status			X		3/10
Environment total					83/100
HISTORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Construction Date		Х			23/35
2. Trends			X		11/35
3. Events/ Persons/Institutions		Х			20/30
History total					54/100
ARCHITECTURE CATEGORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Design	Х				50/50
2. Style	Х				30/30
3. Designer/Builder				Х	0/10
4. Architectural Integrity		Х			7/10
Architecture total					87/100

RANGES	EXCELLENT	GOOD	GOOD	FAIR	POOR
	Pre-1908	1908 to 1925	1926 to 1948	1949 to 1972	After 1972

Category	Phase Two Score, Heritage District		
Environment	83x 45% =37.35		
History	54x 20% =10.8		
Architecture	87x 35% =30.45		
Phase Two Total Score	78.6/100 = 79		

PHASE TWO EVALUATION SUMMARY				
Phase Two Score	Above	to	to	Below
Group				