

**Subject: Application for demolition and new construction at 230-232 Lisgar Street, a property designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act***

**File Number: ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0031**

**Report to Built Heritage Committee on 12 September 2023 and**

**Planning and Housing Committee on 20 September 2023 and**

**Council on 27 September 2023**

**Submitted on August 17, 2023 by Court Curry, Manager, Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department**

**Contact Person: Luis Juarez, Planner II, Heritage Planning Branch**

**613-580-2424,21333, Luis.Juarez@ottawa.ca**

**Ward: Somerset (14)**

**Objet: Demande de démolition et de nouvelle construction aux 230 et 232, rue Lisgar, propriété désignée aux termes de la partie V de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario***

**Dossier : ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0031**

**Rapport au Comité du patrimoine bâti le 12 septembre 2023 et**

**au Comité de l'urbanisme et du logement le 20 septembre 2023**

**et au Conseil le 27 septembre 2023**

**Soumis le 17 août 2023 par Court Curry, Gestionnaire, Services des emprises, du patrimoine et du design urbain, Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique**

**Personne ressource: Luis Juarez, Urbaniste II, Planification du Patrimoine**

**613-580-2424,21333, Luis.Juarez@ottawa.ca**

**Quartier: Somerset (14)**

## **REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS**

**That the Built Heritage Committee and Planning and Housing Committee recommend that Council:**

- 1. Approve the applications to demolish the buildings at 230 and 232 Lisgar Street, conditional upon:
 
  - a. The applicant depositing photographs and research material related to the site's existing buildings to the City of Ottawa Archives, as required by Policy 5.6 of the Centretown and Minto Park HCD Plan.****
- 2. Approve the application for new construction at 230 and 232 Lisgar Street, according to plans prepared by Project 1 Studio, dated July 20, 2023, conditional upon:
 
  - a. The applicant providing samples of all final exterior materials, including details on the proposed decorative metal patterns, for approval by Heritage Planning staff prior to the issuance of the building permit.****
- 3. Delegate the authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department.**
- 4. Approve the issuance of the heritage permits for each application with a three-year expiry date from the date of issuance unless otherwise extended by Council.**

## **RECOMMANDATIONS DU RAPPORT**

**Que le Comité du patrimoine bâti et le Comité de la planification et du logement recommandent au Conseil ce qui suit :**

- 1. Approuver la demande de démolition visant les 230 et 232, rue Lisgar, à condition que le requérant :
 
  - a. dépose les photographies et les documents de recherche relatifs aux bâtiments existants aux Archives de la Ville d'Ottawa, conformément à la politique 5.6 du Plan de district de conservation du patrimoine visant les districts de conservation du patrimoine du centre-ville et du parc Minto;****

- 2. Approuver la demande de construction visant les 230 et 232, rue Lisgar, selon les plans préparés par Project1 Studio datés du 20 juillet 2023, à condition que le requérant :
  - a. soumette des échantillons de tous les matériaux de revêtement extérieur, y compris le détail des motifs décoratifs en métal, aux fins d’approbation par le personnel responsable du patrimoine, et ce, avant qu’on ne lui délivre un permis de construire;****
- 3. Déléguer au directeur général de la Planification, de l’Immobilier et du Développement économique le pouvoir d’apporter des changements mineurs de conception;**
- 4. Approuver les demandes de permis en matière de patrimoine, valide pendant trois ans à compter de la date de délivrance, sauf si la période de validité du permis est prolongée par le Conseil municipal.**

## **BACKGROUND**

### **Context**

230 and 232 Lisgar Street are designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* (OHA) and are considered contributing properties within the Centretown Heritage Conservation District (HCD). They are located on the northern edge of the HCD, situated on the south side of Lisgar Street, west of Metcalfe Street and east of O’Connor Street (See Document 1 – Location Map).

Each property contains a two and a half storey front-gable house clad in brick, constructed circa 1888. Whilst both dwellings maintain setbacks and heights consistent with the first period of development in the HCD, 230 Lisgar Street has been altered with a two-storey front addition that obscures most of the building’s original architectural elements and materials that are visible from the streetscape. 232 Lisgar Street still displays several original elements including decorative bargeboard on the front gable, red brick cladding, and a covered porch that spans the width of the front façade (See Document 2 – Site Photos, for images of existing conditions). The entirety of the front, side, and rear yards has been paved to facilitate parking, detracting from the streetscape. The houses are located at the end of a row of five similarly scaled front gable houses built with similar roof pitches and setbacks.

## **Centretown Heritage Conservation District**

The Centretown HCD was designated under Part V of the *OHA* in 1997. In 2022 a new HCD Plan, applying to both the Centretown HCD and the Minto Park HCD, was approved by Council following the conclusion of the Centretown Heritage Study. This HCD Plan replaces the original management guidelines for the Centretown HCD and is in full force and effect as of October 18, 2022.

The cultural heritage value of the Centretown HCD lies in its role as an early residential neighbourhood within the larger area of Centretown. The HCD features a mix of housing types including large architect-designed houses, high style and vernacular detached dwellings, row houses, apartment buildings, and small dwellings. Further cultural heritage value is derived from its associated commercial corridors and institutions. For a complete description of the HCD's cultural heritage value, please refer to Document 3 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value.

This report has been prepared following receipt of OHA applications to demolish the existing houses on the properties and construct a nine-storey, 49-unit apartment building. Under the OHA, applications for demolition and new construction in HCDs require the approval of City Council. In addition to approval under the OHA, the subject proposal requires a minor variance from the Heritage Overlay (Section 60) provisions of Zoning By-law 2008-250.

## **DISCUSSION**

### **Project Description**

The applicant is proposing to demolish the two existing two and a half storey houses on the properties and construct a new nine-storey 49-unit residential building with a new landscape program. The site plan, elevations, and renderings of the proposed building are attached to this report as Documents 4 and 5.

The proposed building features a flat roof with a height of 28.2 metres, employing step-backs at the fourth and ninth storeys. Its ground floor height and three-storey podium generally align with the top of the neighbouring porch canopy and gable to the west, to provide a continual datum line along the streetscape. The proposed building is setback approximately 5.8 metres from the street, providing a transition between the existing building to the east, which protrudes closer to the street, and the existing building to the west, which is further recessed from the street. The proposal features the following elements:

- Red brick cladding on all elevations.

- Three vertical bays, with inconspicuous balconies above each step back.
- Vertically oriented windows spaced at regular intervals with dark gray aluminum spandrels.
- Perforated metal accents on selected brick returns that mimic decorative patterns found on 232 Lisgar Street's existing woodwork.
- A front yard landscaped area inclusive of new plantings, entrance walkway, bicycle parking and a seating area adjacent to the main entrance.
- A softscaped rear yard amenity space.
- An underground parking garage, accessed via a car elevator with egress through a garage door on the front façade, east of the main entrance.

The subject application is accompanied by a Heritage Impact Assessment, attached as Document 6, that assesses the impact of the proposed demolition and new construction on the character of the Centretown HCD. The HIA addresses the relevant policies and guidelines set out in the HCD.

### **Centretown and Minto Park HCD Plan**

Applications for demolition and new construction in the Centretown HCD are reviewed for consistency with the Plan's Statement of Objectives, Statement of Cultural Heritage Value and identified heritage attributes. All proposed alterations must comply with the policies and guidelines established by the plan. The following sections of the HCD plan set out guidelines and policies specifically relevant to the subject proposal:

- Section 5.0 – Demolition
- Section 9.0 – New Construction

The HCD plan categorizes all properties as *contributing* or *non-contributing*. Based on the results of the Centretown heritage inventory, contributing properties may be further sub-defined as: Significant Resources (SR), Character-Defining Resources (CDR) and Character-Supporting Resources (CSR). The HCD plan identifies the subject properties as contributing properties and CSRs. As such, policies and guidelines in the HCD Plan specific to CSRs and contributing properties also apply.

### **Recommendation 1: Approve the applications to demolish the buildings at 230 and 232 Lisgar Street**

The demolition of contributing properties within HCDs is generally discouraged in favour of retention and intensification via adaptive reuse or the construction of additions.

Through early discussions with Heritage Planning staff, the applicant was encouraged to pursue retention and restoration of the existing buildings. The applicant has opted to instead demolish the existing buildings and construct a new building that reflects the perceived attributes of the existing buildings. This approach is pursuant to Section 5 of the HCD plan, which contemplates the demolition of certain CSRs, provided that their removal achieves broader city building goals. Further, these demolition policies require that replacement buildings comply with the HCD plan's policies and guidelines as they relate to new construction, outlined in Section 9, to ensure that they positively contribute to the character of the HCD.

Heritage Planning staff have reviewed the applications to demolish 230 and 232 Lisgar Street and find that the proposal is generally consistent with the applicable policies and guidelines of the HCD Plan for the following reasons:

- **230 Lisgar Street:** The building's heritage attributes including but not limited to its front gable form, covered porch, decorative woodwork, redbrick cladding, and gothic revival influences have been obscured by an unsympathetic two-storey front addition. Its contribution to the streetscape is limited to its height, massing, siting, and front yard setback. These contributions are successfully maintained through the design of the proposed building as described below.
- **232 Lisgar Street:** Several of the heritage attributes of 232 Lisgar Street, including datum lines to reflect its front porch and gable, decorative metal detailing to interpret its woodwork patterns, and its redbrick will be contemporarily reflected in the proposed development. Other development options were considered by the applicant, including strategies involving the retention of 232 Lisgar Street, however of these options, the subject proposal is the most successful in its conformity and consistency with the policies and guidelines of the HCD Plan.
- The proposal is compliant and consistent with the HCD Plan's policies for the demolition of a CSR:
  - A heritage professional has provided an assessment indicating that 230 Lisgar Street has been altered to the extent where its cultural heritage value to the HCD in its current form is compromised, and that the new

building will carry forward and enhance the perceived attributes of 232 Lisgar Street.

- Elements of the proposed design reflect and commemorate the existing houses, enhancing the compatibility of the proposed building with the Centretown HCD. In particular, the proposed setback and red brick cladding is generally consistent with adjacent historic properties to the west. Further, the proposed height of the ground floor and three-storey podium align with the top of the neighbouring historic property's porch and gable, providing a consistent datum line across this section of the streetscape.
- The design of the proposed building is consistent and compliant with the policies and guidelines for new construction set out in Section 9 of the HCD Plan as described below.
- The proposed intensification of residential units on site contributes to the broader city-building goal of residential intensification while contributing to the HCD, consistent with the direction of the City of Ottawa Official Plan and the Central and East Downtown Core Secondary Plan.

**Recommendation 2: Approve the application to construct a new building at 230-232 Lisgar Street**

Several positive design interventions have been incorporated into the proposal to achieve the new construction guidelines outlined in Section 9 of the HCD plan, thereby mitigating its impact on the HCD and contributing to its cultural heritage value. Some of the proposed building's design elements include:

- The front yard setback, which allows for a landscaped entrance plaza that reflects the front porches characteristic of Centretown and eliminates the existing paved condition.
- Its massing, which employs step backs on the fourth and ninth storeys to allow the adjacent historic houses to the west to remain prominent along the streetscape and to maintain continual datum lines along the row.
- The three distinct vertical bays and vertically oriented windows, which help maintain the streetscape's historic rhythm and provide a successful transition to the neighbouring property.
- Its materiality, consisting of red brick cladding, and perforated metal detailing, which interprets some of the carved wood detailing currently found on 232 Lisgar Street.

The proposed building is built to an appropriate scale and setback for the area's historic context and character, is clad in compatible materials, and includes design elements that reflect the broader character of the area, its immediate context, and the site's existing buildings.

### **Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada**

City Council adopted Parks Canada's Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada ("Standards and Guidelines") in 2008. This document establishes a consistent set of conservation principles and guidelines for projects involving heritage resources.

Policy 9.2 of the HCD Plan references Standard 11 in regard to the applicability of the Standards and Guidelines to new construction, requiring that new buildings be "physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to, and distinguishable from the historic place." Through its sensitive design and compliance with the additional policies of Section 9, the proposed building achieves this standard.

### **Heritage Impact Assessment**

Section 4.5.2 (2) of the City of Ottawa Official Plan requires that a Heritage Impact Assessment (HIA) be submitted where a proposed development has the potential to adversely affect a heritage resource. A Heritage Impact Assessment was prepared for this proposal by Trace Architectures and is attached as Document 7. Heritage Planning staff have reviewed the document and have determined that it meets the requirements of the city's guidelines for HIAs.

The applicant's justification for demolition of the existing houses and construction of a new building is set out in the HIA. The HIA concludes that 230 Lisgar Street's contribution to the character of the HCD is limited to its scale and form, since its perceived attributes have been heavily altered. It further finds that the proposed new building maintains the common built form, similar scale, and the consistent front yard setbacks of neighbouring historic properties while interpreting the perceived heritage attributes of 232 Lisgar Street in a contemporary way. It ultimately concludes that the proposed building provides an overall greater contribution to the character of the HCD than that of the existing houses.

Heritage Planning staff generally concur with the findings of the HIA and agree that the sensitively designed proposed building successfully interprets the heritage attributes of the existing buildings and contributes to the HCD's character.



## Conditions

Staff recommend two conditions of approval for this permit to ensure that the policies and guidelines of the Centretown and Minto Park HCD Plan are met:

### a) Material Samples

Section 7 of the applicant's HIA makes recommendations related to the proposed building's exterior materials to ensure compatibility with the HCD. As a condition of approval, the applicant is required to provide final material samples for heritage staff's approval, including details on the proposed perforated metal detailing, prior to the issuance of the building permit.

### b) Filing of Information

Policy 5.6 of the Centretown and Minto Park HCD Plan requires that when applications for the demolition of a contributing property are approved the building be recorded and this information deposited at the City of Ottawa Archives. As a condition of approval, the applicant is required to file all documentation and historic information compiled on the existing house with the City of Ottawa Archives.

## Conclusion

Staff have reviewed the application for demolition and construction at 230 and 232 Lisgar Street against the policies and guidelines of the Centretown and Minto Park HCD Plan. It is staff's opinion that the subject proposal addresses the relevant criteria required for the demolition of contributing CSRs, that the applicant has employed several design interventions to ensure compliance and consistency with the policies and guidelines of HCD Plan, and that the proposal contributes to achieving the broader city goal of providing additional housing units. For these reasons, staff have no objections to its approval subject to the conditions outlined above.

### Recommendation 3:

Delegate authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning Real Estate and Economic Development Department.

Minor design changes may emerge during the working drawing phase of a project. This recommendation is included to allow Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department to approve these changes should they arise.

### Recommendation 4:

Issue the heritage permit with a three-year expiry date from the date of issuance.

The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not provide any timelines for the expiry of heritage permits. A three-year expiry date is recommended to ensure that the project is completed in a timely fashion.

### **Provincial Policy Statement**

Staff have reviewed this proposal and have determined that is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.

### **RURAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

### **CONSULTATION**

Application materials were posted on the City's Development Application website on August 4, 2023.

Heritage Ottawa was notified of this application and offered the opportunity to provide comments.

Representatives of the Centretown Community Association participated in a pre-consultation meeting with the applicant in July 2022.

Neighbours within 30 metres of the property were notified of this application and offered an opportunity to comment at the Built Heritage Sub-Committee meeting.

### **COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR(S)**

The Councillor is aware of the application related to this report.

### **LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no legal implications associated with implementing the report recommendations.

### **RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS**

There are no risk management implications associated with this report.

### **ASSET MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS**

There are no direct asset management implications associated with this report.

### **FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS**

There are no direct financial implications.

## **ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS**

There are no accessibility implications associated with this report.

## **TERM OF COUNCIL PRIORITIES**

This project addresses the following Term of Council Priorities:

- Thriving Communities: Promote safety, culture, social and physical well-being for our residents.

## **APPLICATION PROCESS TIMELINE STATUS**

The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on October 4, 2023.

## **SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION**

Document 1: Location Map

Document 2: Site Photos

Document 3: Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Document 4: Proposed Site Plan and Elevations

Document 5: Architectural Package

Document 6: Heritage Impact Assessment

Document 7: Supplementary Information Regarding Demolition

## **DISPOSITION**

Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services, to notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, 10 Adelaide Street East, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3) of Council's decision.

Document 1 – Location Map



		LOCATION MAP / PLAN DE LOCALISATION HERITAGE / PATRIMOINE	
D09-23-LIS230	23-0725-L		<b>230 &amp; 232 rue Lisgar St.</b>
I:\CO\2023\Heritage\Lisgar_230_232			
<small>                 ©Parcel data is owned by Terranet Enterprises Inc. and its suppliers                  All rights reserved. May not be produced without permission.                  THIS IS NOT A PLAN OF SURVEY             </small>			
<small>                 ©Les données de parcelles appartiennent à Terranet Enterprises Inc. et à ses fournisseurs. Tous droits réservés. Ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation. CE CI N'EST PAS UN PLAN D'ARPENTAGE             </small>			
REVISION / RÉVISION - 2023 / 08 / 04		 <small>NOT TO SCALE</small>	

**Document 2 – Site Photos**

The existing houses on 230 Lisgar Street (left) and 232 Lisgar Street (right) (City of Ottawa, 2023).



The streetscape along the south side of Lisgar Street, with the two subject properties in the middle (City of Ottawa, 2023).