Subject: Application to alter 187 Billings Avenue, a property designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

File Number: ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0002

Report to Built Heritage Committee on 17 January 2023

and Council 25 January 2023

Submitted on January 4, 2023 by Court Curry, Manager, Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department

Contact Person: Ashley Kotarba, Planner II, Heritage Planning Branch

613-580-2424,23582, Ashley.Kotarba@ottawa.ca

Ward: Alta Vista (18)

Objet : Demande de modification du bien-fonds situé au 187, avenue Billings, une propriété désignée en vertu de la partie IV de la Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario

Dossier: ACS2023-PRE-RHU-0002

Rapport au Comité du patrimoine bâti

le 17 janvier 2023

et au Conseil le 25 janvier 2023

Soumis le 4 janvier 2023 par Court Curry, Gestionnaire, Services des emprises, du patrimoine et du design urbain, Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique

Personne-ressource : Ashley Kotarba, Urbaniste II, Planification du Patrimoine

613-580-2424,23582, Ashley.Kotarba@ottawa.ca

Quartier : Alta Vista (18)

REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Built Heritage Committee recommend that Council:

- 1. Approve the application to alter 187 Billings Avenue according to information submitted by the applicant on November 14, 2022 conditional upon:
 - a. The applicant providing samples of all final exterior materials for approval by Heritage Staff prior to installation
- 2. Direct staff to amend the designation by-law (2020-76) to include the interior hand-hewn timbers of the Charles Billings House;
- 3. Delegate the authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development including the final decision on the brick chimney restoration;
- 4. Approve the issuance of the heritage permits for each application with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance unless otherwise extended by Council.

RECOMMANDATIONS DU RAPPORT

Que le Comité du patrimoine bâti recommande au Conseil :

- D'approuver la demande visant à modifier le bien-fonds situé au 187, avenue Billings, conformément aux renseignements soumis par le requérant le 14 novembre 2022, à la condition que :
 - a. le requérant fournisse des échantillons des matériaux de revêtement extérieur, aux fins d'approbation par le personnel responsable du patrimoine, avant leur installation;
- De demander au personnel de modifier le Règlement sur la désignation (no 2020-76) afin d'inclure les poutres extérieures taillées à la main de la maison Charles-Billings;
- 3. De déléguer au directeur général de la Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique le pouvoir d'apporter des changements mineurs à la conception, y compris la décision finale concernant la restauration de la cheminée en briques;

4. D'approuver la délivrance des permis patrimoniaux pour chaque demande, valides pendant deux ans à compter de la date de délivrance, sauf si le permis est prolongé par le Conseil municipal.

BACKGROUND

The building at 187 Billings Avenue, known as the Charles Billings House is a one and a half storey wood frame house constructed before 1857. The Billings family were the first settlers in Gloucester Township and can be attributed to much of the development in the area. This house was constructed by Charles Billings, the youngest son of Braddish. His family lived here for three generations.

Architecturally, the house is a rare vernacular example of the Ontario Cottage style in Ottawa, which was popular in Ontario from the 1830s until the 1870s. The house has a wood frame, constructed of hand-hewn and sawn timbers and features a symmetrical façade, and a side-gabled roof with a central gable over the entrance. (Documents 1-2)

The house is one of the earliest remaining buildings in the Alta Vista neighbourhood and the orientation of the building away from the street, facing the Rideau River indicates that it was built during the early settlement of the area.

The property, which included the cottage and its large lot, was sold in 2013. The property was severed in two, and a new house was constructed on the new lot. Council passed a by-law to designate the Charles Billings House under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* in 2014, see Statement of Cultural Heritage Value attached as Document 3.

In 2015, the previous property owner made an application to alter the Charles Billings House. The project included the alteration of the house through the removal of a portion of the designated building, and the construction of an addition to the rear of the property. The addition connects to the north end of the historic building by a single storey glazed entrance. The previous property owner worked collaboratively with City staff to conserve the heritage attributes of the property and a permit was issued in 2015 through staff report ACS2015-PAI-PGM-0001.

In 2018 the current owner purchased the property. At the time of designation in 2014, an error was made in the legal description, making the registration of the by-law impossible. City staff corrected this error, and in April 2020, a notice was sent to the owner informing them that the designation by-law was now registered on the property's title. (Document 4)

In summer 2022, Heritage staff were made aware that changes were made to the property without permission under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. All of the wood shiplap cladding was removed and replaced with Exterior Insulation Finish System (EIFS), as was the wood window frames and the red brick chimney facing the street was covered in EIFS. All three of these are attributes identified in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value. (Document 3)

Over the course of the summer and fall 2022, Heritage staff worked with the property owner on how to bring the property into conformity with the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

This report has been prepared to address the non-compliance noted above and because alterations to a property designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* requires the approval of City Council.

DISCUSSION

The application includes the installation of new wood shiplap siding on top of the existing EIFS, the removal of the raised window surrounds and re-instatement of wood window frames, and the removal of the EIFS from the red brick chimney.

Additionally, the property owner has agreed to an amendment to the designation by-law to include the original interior wood timbers of the structure shown in Document 2.

Recommendation 1

The property owner claims that the changes made to the property in 2021 were done under the assumption that the property was no longer designated under the *Ontario Heritage Act* despite the letter from the City dated April 6, 2020 informing the owner that the designation by-law was now registered on title (see Document 4). These changes were made to correct moisture issues and the resulting deterioration of the wood cladding. The decayed wood was removed, new insulation was installed, and the EIFS was applied.

When the work from the 2015 heritage permit was underway, it was determined that the original wood shiplap siding was beyond repair. The previous property owner worked with Heritage staff on a suitable replacement, and new wood shiplap siding was milled to match the original. This change to the heritage permit was approved under staff's delegated authority for minor design changes as work was ongoing.

In order to bring back the heritage attributes lost as a result of these interventions, Heritage staff have suggested the remedial measures identified above. The cladding was not original, therefore there is no concern with the loss of the actual historic shiplap. However, it had been replaced in accordance with the Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada. The wood was removed last year and is no longer available for reinstatement. Since the EIFS was applied directly to the brick, Heritage staff recommend doing a test patch to determine if the EIFS can be removed without damaging the brick. Should the EIFS come off successfully in the test, the entirety of the chimney will be revealed. If the testing determines that the brick will be damaged if the EIFS is removed, then alternative options will be considered. This may result in an application of brick veneer over the EIFS. Recommendation 3 includes direction to provide staff with this discretion.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

City Council adopted Parks Canada's Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada ("Standards and Guidelines") in 2008. This document establishes a consistent set of conservation principles and guidelines for projects involving heritage resources. Heritage staff have reviewed this proposal against this document and are satisfied that the project meets the relevant standards and guidelines. Heritage staff consider this document when evaluating applications under the *Ontario Heritage Act*, and it is the primary guiding document for alterations to properties with Part IV designation. The following standards are applicable to this proposal:

Standard 1 (a): Conserve the heritage value of an historic place. **(b):** Do not remove, replace or substantially alter its intact or repairable character-defining elements.

Through this application, while compromised, the heritage value of the Charles Billings House will be maintained. Three attributes that were previously altered will be reinstated, thus ensuring that the attributes identified in the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value are conserved.

Standard 13 a): Repair rather than replace character-defining elements from the restoration period. **b)** Where character-defining elements are too severely deteriorated to repair and where sufficient physical evidence exists, replace them with new elements that match the forms, materials and detailing of sound versions of the same element.

With the wood cladding having been removed and discarded, there is no opportunity for repair. Instead, the new cladding will match as closely as possible to the historic wood

cladding. Since the EIFS was applied directly to the brick chimney, there is an opportunity to remove the material and reveal the original brick.

Given the challenging situation and the misunderstanding regarding the heritage status of the building, staff believe that the recommended compromise is appropriate even if it does not fully meet the requirements of the Standards and Guidelines.

Conditions

Heritage staff recommend a condition to ensure that the profile of the new siding matches the original as closely as possible.

Recommendation 2

The 2015 construction and restoration of 187 Billings Avenue uncovered the original large hand-hewn timbers on the interior of the structure. While not designated, these were maintained, and left exposed (Document 2). The owner has agreed to an amendment of the by-law to include this interior feature of the house in the designation by-law.

Heritage staff strongly support this initiative as the visibility of the interior structure provides information about the construction method of the house and similar houses built during this period.

Conclusion:

Given the complicated nature of this application, and in light of the owner's willingness to work with the City towards resolution, staff have no objection to the approval of this application. While it does not completely meet the Standards and Guidelines, the wood cladding and brick chimney are important elements that embody the Ontario Cottage style of architecture. The obscured attributes will be re-instated, and the interior timbers of the Charles Billings House will be protected by an updated by-law.

Recommendation 3

Delegate authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department

Minor design changes may emerge during the working drawing phase of a project. This recommendation is included to allow Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development to approve these changes should they arise. This recommendation also allows staff to

make the final decision on the brick restoration after seeing the results of the test patch for the removal of the EIFS.

Recommendation 4

Issue the heritage permit with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance

The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not provide any timelines for the expiry of heritage permits. A two-year expiry date is recommended to ensure that the project is completed in a timely fashion.

Provincial Policy Statement

Staff have reviewed this proposal and have determined that is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.

RURAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

CONSULTATION

Heritage Ottawa was notified of this application on December 13, 2022 and offered the opportunity to provide comments.

Neighbours within 30 metres of the property were notified of this application and offered an opportunity to comment at the Built Heritage Committee meeting.

COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR(S)

The councillor is aware of the application related to this report.

LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no legal impediments to the adoption of the recommendations in this report.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no risk implications.

ASSET MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no asset management implications associated with this report.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no direct financial implications.

ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS

There are no accessibility implications associated with this report.

APPLICATION PROCESS TIMELINE STATUS

The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on 2023-Feb-20

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Document 1 Location Map

Document 2 Photos

Document 3 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Document 4 Notice of Amendment to Designation By-Law 214-142

DISPOSITION

Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services, to notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, 10 Adelaide Street East, 3rd Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3) of Council's decision.

Document 1 – Location Map



Document 2- Photos



Photo showing the condition of the house before the development in 2015



Photo showing the condition of the house before the development in 2015



Renderings from the 2015 heritage permit which included restoration and alteration







Renderings from the 2015 heritage permit which included restoration and alteration



Google Streetview image from 2020 before the application of EIFS



Aerial photo from 2022 showing the full property. Credit: Realtor.ca



Image from 2022 showing the house with EIFS. Credit: Realtor.ca



Image from 2022 showing the house with EIFS. Credit: Realtor.ca



Interior of the Charles Billings House showing the hand-hewn timbers. Credit: Realtor.ca



Interior of the Charles Billings House showing the hand-hewn timbers. Credit: Realtor.ca

Document 3 – Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Description of Property

The Charles Billings House, 187 Billings Avenue, is a one-and-one-half-storey frame structure with wood siding that was built before 1857. It is located on the north side of Billings Avenue, immediately east of the Cavendish Road intersection within the Alta Vista neighbourhood of Billings Bridge in the City of Ottawa.

Heritage Value

The Charles Billings House has cultural heritage value for its physical value as an early pioneer cottage style house and its historical value as associated with the settlement and development of the Billings Bridge community – including several important local families; namely Billings and McKellar. Contextual value is found in the property's orientation away from the street which speaks to the age of the building and the early settlement of the community.

As an example of an early residence, the Charles Billings House is vernacular but illustrates elements of the Ontario Cottage Style, which was the most common house type in Ontario from roughly the 1830s to the 1870s. Features of the house typical of the style include the frame construction, stone foundation, one-and-one-half-storey massing, gabled roof with central gable over the entrance, and the red brick chimneys.

The shiplap siding of the house is rugged and the diamond window in the building's vestibule is the only decoration. Such houses were principally built for shelter and therefore were inspired by necessity rather than aesthetic value.

The property is historically valuable for its early associations with the Billings family and their estate which developed into the Village of Billings Bridge. Arriving in 1812, Braddish Billings was the first settler of Gloucester Township. He and his family developed and leased surrounding lands, including this property, and the area soon became the thriving Village of Billings Bridge. Known locally as 'the foreman's house', the documented history of 187 Billings Avenue begins with Archibald McKellar, a well established Ottawa dairy farmer who began his career here while leasing the property from Billings from 1857 to 1871. After McKellar left, the family of Charles Billings, Braddish's youngest son, owned the property for three generations beginning in 1859 and lasting until 1961. Charles and his son Hugh Braddish were both prominent community members who shaped the political landscape of the village.

Contextual value is found in the property's character as one of the earliest residential structures remaining in the Alta Vista neighbourhood. The building's orientation away from the street indicates the early settlement of the area.

Heritage Attributes

Key attributes that embody the heritage value of 187 Billings Avenue as an early vernacular house include:

- One-and-one-half-storey height
- Side gabled roof with central gable above entrance
- Entrance vestibule with gable roof
- Stone foundation
- Red brick chimneys
- Wooden shiplap siding
- Diamond window in vestibule
- Rectangular window openings with wooden trim

Key attributes of 187 Billings Avenue that embody the historical character of the Billings Bridge community include:

 Orientation of the front entrance of the building to the west, away from Billings Avenue.

The designation is limited to the original gable-ended structure with central gable and vestibule. Later additions and the interior of the building are not included in the designation.

Document 4 - Notice of Amendment to Designation By-Law 214-142



File Number: ACS2019-PIE-RHU-0018

April 6, 2020

Stephen Jonathan Kawasaki 187 Billings Avenue Ottawa, Ontario K1H 5K8

Dear Mr. Kawasaki,

Re: Notice of Amendment to Designation By-Law 2014-142 under Section 30.1 Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act, a by-law to designate the Charles Billings House, 187 Billings Avenue

City Council, at its meeting held on February 26, 2020, passed By-law No. 2020-76 amending the above noted by-law designating the Charles Billings House, 187 Billings Avenue, under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* as a property of cultural heritage value or interest. Please find enclosed a copy of the amending By-law, including the revised legal description for the property. The amending by-law will now be registered on title.

Should you require further information, please contact MacKenzie Kimm, Heritage Planner at (613)580-2424, ext. 15203 or mackenzie.kimm@ottawa.ca.

Yours truly,

Carthy Saite Man Donald, Deputy Clerk

M. Rick O'Connor, CMO

City Clerk

cc: MacKenzie Kimm, Heritage Planner, Heritage and Urban Design Service (by email)

Ontario Heritage Trust, 10 Adelaide Street East, 3rd Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3 (by mail)

Office of the City Clerk City of Ottawa 110 Laurier Avenue West Ottawa, ON K1P 1J1 www.ottawa.ca

Direct Line (613) 580-2424 Ext. 21215 Fax (613) 560-2416 Rick.OConnor@ottawa.ca Bureau du greffier municipal Ville d'Ottawa 110, ave. Laurier ouest Ottawa (Ontario) K1P 1J1 www.ottawa.ca

Ligne directe (613) S80-2424 poste 21215 Télécopieur 613 560-2416 Rick.OConnor@ottawa.ca BY-LAW NO. 2020 - 76 Anders Date MAR 1 2 2020

A by-law to amend by-law No. 2014-142 entitled, "A by-law of the City of Ottawa to designate the Charles Billings House, 187 Billings Avenue, Ottawa, to be of cultural heritage value or interest".

WHEREAS Section 30.1 of the Ontario Heritage Act, R.S.O. 1990, Chapter 0.18 authorizes the Council of a Municipality to amend by-laws to designate real property, including all buildings and structures thereon, to be of cultural heritage value or interest;

AND WHEREAS the legal description of the property, located at 187 Billings Avenue contained in heritage designation by-law No. 2014-142 does not meet the current requirements of the Land Registry Office;

AND WHEREAS on October 21, 2019 Council consulted with its Built Heritage Sub-Committee which recommended that Council approve the update to the designation by-law for the property located at 187 Billings Avenue, and legally described as PT LT 16, CON JG, GLOUCESTER, BEING PART 1 ON PLAN 4R-28282;

AND WHEREAS the City of Ottawa served a notice of the proposed amendment of the designation by-law on the owner(s) of the subject property on December 5, 2019;

AND WHEREAS no notice of objection to the proposed designation was served on the Clerk of the City of Ottawa.

THEREFORE the Council of the City of Ottawa, enacts as follows:

- To delete Schedule 'A', of by-law No. 2014-142, and replace it with the document hereto attached as Schedule 'A' and forming part of this by-law;
- A copy of by-law No. 2014-142 and this amending by-law shall be registered against the property affected in the proper land registry office. The City Clerk is hereby authorized to cause a copy of these by-laws to be served on the owner of the land described in Schedule 'A' hereto and on the Ontario Heritage Trust.

ENACTED AND PASSED this 26th day of February, 2020.

CITY CLERK

MAYOR

SCHEDULE 'A'

Legal Description

PT LT 16, CON JG, GLOUCESTER, BEING PART 1 ON PLAN 4R-28282

BY-LAW NO. 2020 -76

A by-law to amend by-law No. 2014-142 entitled, "A by-law of the City of Ottawa to designate the Charles Billings House, 187 Billings Avenue, Ottawa, to be of cultural heritage value or interest".

Enacted by City Council at its meeting of February 26, 2020.

LEGAL SERVICES ML/GS COUNCIL AUTHORITY: City Council November 6, 2019 Bulk Consent Agenda Item A BHSC Report No. 6