

Subject: Application to alter 29 Russell Avenue, a property designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act, located in the Russell Avenue-Range Road Heritage Conservation District

File Number: ACS2024-PRE-RHU-0018

**Report to Built Heritage Committee on 16 January 2024
and Planning and Housing Committee on 17 January 2024
and Council on 24 January 2024**

Submitted on December 22, 2023 by Court Curry, Manager, Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department

Contact Person: Ashley Kotarba, Planner II, Heritage Planning Branch

613-580-2424, ext.23582, Ashley.Kotarba@ottawa.ca

Ward: RIDEAU-VANIER (12)

Objet: Demande de modification du bien-fonds occupant le 29, avenue Russell, désigné en vertu de la partie V de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario* et situé dans le district de conservation du patrimoine de l'avenue Russell et du chemin Range

Dossier: ACS2024-PRE-RHU-0018

Rapport au Comité du patrimoine bâti

le 16 janvier 2024

et au Comité de l'urbanisme le 17 janvier 2024

au Conseil le 24 janvier 2024

Soumis le 22 décembre 2023 par Court Curry, Gestionnaire, Services des emprises, du patrimoine et du design urbain, Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique

Personne ressource: Ashley Kotarba, Urbaniste II, Planification du Patrimoine

613-580-2424, ext.23582, Ashley.Kotarba@ottawa.ca

Quartier: Rideau-Vanier (12)

REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Built Heritage Committee and the Planning and Housing Committee recommend that Council:

- 1. Approve the application to 29 Russell Avenue according to plans prepared by Woodman Architect & Associates, dated July 28, 2023 and the landscape plan prepared by James Lennox dated August 2, 2023 conditional upon:

 - a. The applicant providing samples of all final exterior materials for approval by Heritage Staff prior to the issuance of the building permit;****
- 2. Delegate the authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development;**
- 3. Approve the issuance of the heritage permit with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance unless otherwise extended by Council.**

RECOMMANDATIONS DU RAPPORT

Que le Comité du patrimoine bâti et le Comité de la planification et du logement recommandent ce qui suit au Conseil :

- 1. Approuver la demande visant le 29, avenue Russell, conformément aux plans préparés par Woodman Architect & Associates, en date du 28 juillet 2023, et au plan d'aménagement paysager préparé par James Lennox, en date du 2 août 2023, sous réserve de la condition suivante :

 - a. que le requérant soumette des échantillons des matériaux de revêtement extérieur à l'approbation du personnel responsable du patrimoine avant la délivrance du permis de construire;****
- 2. Déléguer au directeur général de Planification, Immobilier et Développement économique le pouvoir d'autoriser des changements mineurs de conception;**
- 3. Approuver la délivrance d'un permis patrimonial d'une durée de deux ans à compter de la date de délivrance, sauf prolongation accordée par le Conseil municipal.**

BACKGROUND

The building at 29 Russell Avenue (23 Russell Avenue) was constructed c. 1887 and is a two-and-a-half storey building clad in red brick, with a hipped roof. The house features a symmetrical front façade with projecting end bays capped with gable roofs. The building contains two gabled dormers with ornate mouldings, a central chimney, and prominent cornice. The property has a large front lawn with two walkways leading to the building. There is a laneway at the rear of the building. The property is classified as a contributing property within the Russell Avenue–Range Road Heritage Conservation District, and is located next to 312 Laurier Avenue East, a property designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act (OHA)*. (See documents 1-3 for location map, photos and Heritage Survey Form)

The Russell Avenue-Range Road Heritage Conservation District (HCD) was designated in for its cultural heritage value as representative sample of building types in Sandy Hill dating from the late 19th to the late 20th century, during which time it evolved from being home to civil servants and businesspeople, to a more mixed neighbourhood associated with both the wider city and the nearby University of Ottawa. It is significant for its large number of built heritage resources and for its historic associations with the development of the By Estate, of which it is a small section. The HCD has well-conserved, tree-lined streetscapes that contain a variety of single-family dwellings and apartments in a variety of architectural styles. The mix of Queen Anne Revival, Gothic Revival and early mid-20th century apartment design, as well as several buildings in eclectic styles, distinguishes this area from other parts of Sandy Hill.

The Russell Avenue-Range Road HCD Plan was approved by City Council in 2018. The overarching objective of the Russell Avenue-Range Road HCD Plan is to provide direction in managing change and conserving the HCD in a manner that respects its values.

This report has been prepared because alterations to a property in a heritage conservation district designated under Part V of the *Ontario Heritage Act* requires the approval of City Council after consultation with the Built Heritage Committee. In addition to approval under the OHA, a Zoning By-law Amendment application is being reviewed concurrently with the subject application. The Zoning By-Law Amendment seeks relief from certain performance standards in the R4UD zone, including interior side yard setbacks, rear yard setback and rear yard area, resident and visitor parking requirements, and bicycle parking space dimensions.

DISCUSSION

The application includes a three-storey addition to the rear of the property. The addition will be clad in red brick and fibre cement panel and will feature a mansard roof. The addition will be accessed from the rear lane. A new amenity space and bicycle parking is proposed at the rear.

The existing front porches will be removed and replaced with porches that are more in keeping with the streetscape and district. These new porches will be constructed of wood, and feature gables, decorative posts and shed roofs. No other alterations are proposed to the front façade. (Documents 4-7)

A landscape plan has been submitted which shows enhanced greenery on the property. New plantings are proposed for the front yard to beautify the street, and act as a buffer for proposed bicycle parking.

Recommendation 1

The Russell Avenue-Range Road Heritage Conservation District Plan (HCD) has guidelines for alterations and additions to contributing buildings. Generally, additions should be located in the rear, lower than the existing roofline, and clad in a compatible material.

Heritage staff have reviewed the application to alter 29 Russell Avenue and find that the proposal is generally compliant and consistent with the applicable policies and guidelines of the HCD Plan for the following reasons:

- The design is contemporary and complements the existing buildings in its cladding and roof form.
- The location, height and massing are in alignment with the HCD plan in that the addition will be located behind the existing building and will be lower in height.
- The materials follow the specified materials identified in the HCD plan for additions to contributing properties.
- The re-introduction of appropriate front porches improves the character of the front façade. The existing front porches are not original, and research determined that a full-length verandah was once located on the front façade and wrapped around to the sides. While not required to re-instate the verandah, two small porches are being proposed at each main door that emulate a typical porch found in Sandy Hill.

This proposal complies with the HCD policies and guidelines and will not have a negative impact on the character of the HCD. The introduction of compatible porches will be an improvement to the character of the existing building and the streetscape. The addition will be of a contemporary design, located in the rear, lower than the existing house, and use materials specified in the HCD Plan.

Heritage staff recommend one condition of approval for this permit. The applicant must provide final exterior samples for review prior to the issuance of a Building Permit as a condition of approval to ensure that the selected materials are consistent with the HCD Plan.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada

City Council adopted Parks Canada's Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada ("Standards and Guidelines") in 2008. This document establishes a consistent set of conservation principles and guidelines for projects involving heritage resources. The Russell Avenue-Range Road Heritage Conservation District Plan was based on the principles included in the Standards and Guidelines. As such, applications in the HCD are reviewed using the policies and guidelines in the HCD Plan which are more contextually specific than the Standards and Guidelines.

Conclusion

Staff have reviewed the application to alter 29 Russell Avenue in accordance with the objectives, policies and guidelines of the Russell Avenue-Range Road HCD Plan and the Standards and Guidelines and have no objections to its approval subject to the conditions outlined above.

Recommendation 2

Delegate authority for minor design changes to the General Manager, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department

Minor design changes may emerge during the working drawing phase of a project. This recommendation is included to allow Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development to approve these changes should they arise.

Recommendation 3

Issue the heritage permit with a two-year expiry date from the date of issuance.

The *Ontario Heritage Act* does not provide any timelines for the expiry of heritage permits. A two-year expiry date is recommended to ensure that the project is completed in a timely fashion.

Provincial Policy Statement

Staff have reviewed this proposal and have determined that is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.

RURAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

CONSULTATION

Application materials were posted on the City's Development Application website on December 4, 2023.

Heritage Ottawa and Action Sandy Hill were notified of this application on December 5, 2023 and offered the opportunity to provide comments.

Neighbours within 30 metres of the property were notified of this application and offered an opportunity to comment at the Built Heritage Committee meeting.

COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR(S)

The councillor is aware of the application related to this report.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no direct financial implications.

LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no legal implications associated with implementing the report recommendations.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no risk implications.

ASSET MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no servicing constraints identified for the proposed rezoning at this time. Servicing capacity requirements to be confirmed at time of site plan.

ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS

There are no accessibility implications associated with this report.

TERM OF COUNCIL PRIORITIES

This project addresses the following Term of Council Priorities:

- Thriving Communities: Promote safety, culture, social and physical well-being for our residents

APPLICATION PROCESS TIMELINE STATUS

The statutory 90-day timeline for consideration of this application under the Ontario Heritage Act will expire on 2024-Feb-29

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Document 1 Location Map

Document 2 Site Photos

Document 3 Heritage Survey Form

Document 4 Project Description

Document 5 Proposed Site Plan

Document 6 Proposed Elevations

Document 7 Proposed Landscape Plan

DISPOSITION

Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services, to notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust, 10 Adelaide Street East, 3rd Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3) of Council's decision.

Document 1 – Location Map



		LOCATION MAP / PLAN DE LOCALISATION HERITAGE / PATRIMOINE	
D09-01-RUSS29	23-1087-D		29 av. Russell Avenue
I:\CO\2023\Heritage\Russell_29			
<small>Parcel data is owned by Teranel Enterprises Inc. and its suppliers. All rights reserved. May not be produced without permission. THIS IS NOT A PLAN OF SURVEY.</small>			
<small>Les données de parcelles appartiennent à Teranel Enterprises Inc. et à ses fournisseurs. Tous droits réservés. Ne peut être reproduit sans autorisation. CECI N'EST PAS UN PLAN D'ARPENTAGE.</small>			
REVISION / RÉVISION - 2023 / 11 / 21			

Document 2- Site Photos



Front façade of 29 Russell Avenue



Russell Avenue looking south



Front façade of 29 Russell Avenue



29 Russell Avenue

Document 3 – Heritage Survey Form



Sandy Hill Heritage Study

Descriptive sheet

23 Russell

Municipal Address	23 Russell Avenue	Building name	23 Russell
Legal description		Lot:	Block: Plan:
Age/Date of Construction	1887 est.	Original use	
		Present use	



Source: Ron J. Roy

Date: 2007/12/05

Heritage Status

Existing heritage building	Name:	
	Bylaw / date:	
Existing heritage district	Name:	
	Bylaw / date:	
Potential Heritage Building:	not recommended	
Potential Heritage District:	not recommended	
Comments:		

Prepared by: Date:

Phase 2 Evaluation Results

Score	100 - 70	69 - 55	55 - 40	39 - 0
Group	1			

History

Prepared by: JB Bourdeau Date: 2007/04/20

Age/Date of Construction (Factual/Estimated)

c. 1887 est. (Note: what is today identified as 23 Russell was earlier described as 25 Russell - 29 Russell, from the period of its construction in 1888 (est.) through at least 1956).

The first Directory entries for residents are in 1888-89 listing - L. Poulist and Wm. Carter - but Wm. Carter (without address) is listed in the 1887 Directory. The 1888 insurance map shows a structure on site.

23-33 Russell today constitute a single complex of historic and contemporary structures.

M1878: Nothing on site.

M1888 (1901): 2 1/2 storey brick dwelling with mansard roof, contiguous with 29 Russell Ave.

M1902 (1912): Same.

M1902 (1922): Same.

M1948: Same, with 1 storey garage at 29 Russell Ave. (independent building at the back of the property).

M1956: Same.

Events

Unknown

Persons/Institutions

D 1878 - Nothing on site.

D 1886 - Russell Avenue vacant.

D 1887 - Wm. Carter listed without address.

D 1888-89. 25 Russell - Poulist L II

29 Russell - William. Carter

D 1889-90. 25 Russell - Gorman, M.J.

29 Russell - William. Carter

D 1895-96. 25 Russell - Gorman, Michael.

29 Russell - William. Carter

D1901 - 25 Russell - William H. Middleton

29 Russell - Ebin B Wood, clerk, Privy Council Office

D1912 - 25 Russell - Thomas Keilty

29 Russell - Frank Grierson, Clerk, Department of Finance

D1922 - 25 Russell - Patrick E. Ryan, agent

29 Russell - Frank Grierson, clerk

D1927 - 25 Russell - H. Salt Richards

29 Russell - Frank Grierson

D1934 25 Russell - H.M. Salt Richards (Dora)

29 Russell - Frank Grierson (Frances M.)

D1940 - 25 Russell - Salt Richards (Dora)

29 Russell - Frank Grierson (Frances M.)

D1948 - 25 Russell - Salt Richards (Dora)

29 Russell - Frank Grierson (Frances M) (owner)

Developmental Context

This large double house is one of the first to be built on Russell Avenue, and is part of efforts to systematically develop the eastern part of the Colonel By Estate south of Theodore. The house anticipates the large 2 and a half story multiple tenant residential structures to be built on the Laurier-Osgoode block of Russell Avenue, as well as the substantial form, scale and height of nearby single family structures.

Summary/Comments on historical significance

The historical significance of this house derives from its age (1887), its associations with one of the earliest residents in Sandy Hill (Wm. Carter) and later government clerks Ebin Wood, Privy Council, Frank Grierson, Dept. of Finance, and its strong role in establishing residential use on Russell Ave., in development of the Colonel By Estate south of Theodore.

Historical sources

- City of Ottawa heritage files.
- June 1878 Insurance Plan of Ottawa, Ontario. National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- January 1888 Key Plan of Ottawa and Vicinity. (Revised 1901). National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- September 1902 Key Plan of the City of Ottawa, Ontario. Volume 1 (Revised 1912). National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- September 1902 Insurance Plan of the City of Ottawa, Ontario. Volume 1 (Revised 1922). National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- November 1948 Fire Insurance Map, Ottawa, Ontario. Volume 2. National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- October 1956 Fire Insurance Map, Ottawa, Ontario. Volume 2. National Map Collection, Public Archives Canada.
- The Ottawa City Directory, 1878, 1886, 1887, 1888-89, 1989-90, 1895-96, 1899, 1901, 1912, 1922, 1927, 1934, 1940,

Architecture

Prepared by: Andrew Jeanes Date: 2006/11/23

Architectural characteristics and design

Property characteristics: Single use residential. Multi-unit, 2 1/2 storey with irregular plan, multiple entries and occupied basement. Site features consist of double lot coverage with a fence. This property is attached to 25, 29 and 31 and 33 Russell through additions at the rear to form one complex of multiple units.

Exterior elements: Sloped hipped roof of asphalt shingles; dormers and 2 brick chimneys. Decorative roof elements include a cornice. Exterior brick wall with string courses, stone sills, window hoods and voussoirs. 2 1/2-storey brick bay with entry door and gable end at side of front facade. Rubble stone foundation.

Windows and doors: Rectangular wood double hung 1 x 1 windows. Metal storm windows. Single wood front door with transom. Entry doors at north and south sides of front facade.

Other features: 1 storey wood porch at side with wood base and wood balustrade. Concrete porch addition at front with metal balustrade.

Architectural Stylistic Influences

Second Empire with Italianate influences.

Designer/Builder/Architect

Unknown

Architectural integrity

Medium: Form is intact; modifications to entries, windows and cornice diminish architectural integrity.

Other**Summary/Comments on architectural significance**

While one of the earliest buildings on Russell, this example of Second Empire Revival has been devalued by modifications to the entries, windows and fascias. Efforts to replace these elements with those more closely resembling the original should be encouraged in future renovations.

Sandy Hill Heritage Study

23 Russell

Context

Prepared by: Date:

Existing heritage building	Name:	
	Bylaw / date:	
Existing heritage district	Name:	
	Bylaw / date:	



Source: Ha Nguyen

Date: 2006/25/11

Compatibility with surroundings:

Pattern of site use: Typical front and side setbacks

Use: Typical (residential)

Height/Volume: Typical height, atypically wide

Materials: Typical (brick, shingle)

Typology: Type 1C (b)

Community context/Landmark status

This property makes a strong contribution to the architecture and history of the neighbourhood.

Summary/Comments on environmental significance

This property sets an example and helps to establish the character of the block in which it sits.

HISTORY	Age/Date of Construction	Pre 1890 ✓ 10	1891 - 1900 8 - 9	1901 - 1910 6 - 7	1911 - 1925 4 - 5	1926 - 1950 1 - 3	1951 + 0	Score 10/10	
	Events / Persons				High	Medium	Low	N / A	2/5
					4 - 5	3	✓ 1 - 2	0	
	Developmental Context				High	Medium	Low		14/15
			✓ 11 - 15	6 - 10	1 - 5				
Total								26/30	

ARCHITECTURE	Architectural characteristics	Proportion/Scale 4/5	Detail/Craftsmanship 4/5	Coherence 3/5	Score 11/15
	Stylistic Influence	Strong	Medium	Weak	13/15
		✓ 11 - 15	6 - 10	0 - 5	
	Designer / Builder / Architect	Renowned	Known	Unknown	0/5
		3 - 5	1 - 2	✓ 0	
	Architectural Integrity	High	Medium	Low	3/5
4 - 5		✓ 2 - 3	0 - 1		
Total					27/40

CONTEXT	Compatibility with surroundings	Sets example ✓ 15 - 20	Reinforces pattern 10 - 14	Compatible with pattern 5 - 9	Incompatible with pattern 0 - 4	Score 15/20
	Community Context/Landmark Status	Strong	Moderate	Weak	No	7/10
		✓ 7 - 10	4 - 6	1 - 3	0	
Total						22/30

Phase II score	75/100
-----------------------	---------------

Heritage Status	Group	1
------------------------	--------------	----------