Subject: Appointment of an external licensed auditor to conduct an election compliance audit of the campaign finances of Candidate Shawn Menard, Ward 17 Capital, from the 2022 Municipal Elections

File Number: ACS2025-OCC-GEN-0007

Report to Election Compliance Audit Committee on 24 April 2025

Submitted on April 17, 2025 by Caitlin Salter MacDonald, City Clerk

Contact Person: Krista Bressette, Acting Manager, French Language Services and Municipal Elections, Office of the City Clerk

613-580-2424, extension 23404, krista.bressette@ottawa.ca

Ward: Citywide

Objet : Nomination d'un vérificateur externe agréé pour la réalisation d'une vérification de conformité des élections relativement au financement de la campagne du candidat Shawn Menard (quartier 17 – Capitale), dans le cadre des élections municipales de 2022

Numéro de dossier : ACS2025-OCC-GEN-0007

Rapport présenté au Comité de vérification de la conformité pour les élections le 24 avril 2025

Soumis le 17 avril 2025 par Caitlin Salter MacDonald, greffière municipale

Personne ressource : Krista Bressette, Gestionnaire intérimaire, Services en français et Élections municipales

613-580-2424, extension 23404, krista.bressette@ottawa.ca

Quartier : À l'échelle de la ville

REPORT RECOMMENDATION(S)

That the Election Compliance Audit Committee:

 Approve the appointment of an external licensed auditor to conduct an election compliance audit of the campaign finances of Candidate Shawn Menard of Ward 17 Capital from the 2022 Municipal Elections, as outlined in this report; 2. Delegate the authority to finalize the contract and audit plan to the City Clerk or her designate, in consultation with the Committee's legal counsel, as outlined in this report.

RECOMMANDATION(S) DU RAPPORT

Que le Comité de vérification de conformité des élections :

- approuve la nomination d'un vérificateur externe agréé afin d'effectuer une vérification de conformité des élections relativement au financement de la campagne du candidat Shawn Menard (quartier 17 – Capitale) dans le cadre des élections municipales de 2022, comme l'indique le présent rapport;
- 2. délègue à la greffière municipale ou à son mandataire le pouvoir de finaliser le contrat et le plan de vérification, de concert avec le conseiller juridique du Comité, comme l'indique le présent rapport.

BACKGROUND

On Wednesday, March 23, 2022, City Council approved the staff report titled "<u>Update</u> on the 2022 <u>Municipal Elections and Amendments to Election-Related By-laws and Policies</u>" which included recommendations to establish the 2022-2026 Election Compliance Audit Committee (the "Committee"), pursuant to Section 88.37 of the *Municipal Elections Act, 1996* (the "MEA"). The 2022-2026 Committee's term of office began on Tuesday, November 15, 2022, and will end on Saturday, November 14, 2026.

The Committee is an independent, statutory body whose responsibilities and powers are largely prescribed by the MEA. The Committee is responsible for reviewing and making decisions on applications for municipal election campaign finance compliance audits, and on reports from the City Clerk regarding apparent contraventions of contribution limits prescribed by the MEA, resulting from the regular municipal election or any by-election held during the term of office for the City Council for which the Committee was appointed.

Subsections 88.33(1) and 88.35(1) of the MEA state that any eligible elector who believes that a candidate or registered third party advertiser has contravened the campaign finance rules in the statute may apply for a compliance audit of that party's election campaign finances, even if they have not filed a financial statement.

Further, Subsections 88.33(7) and 88.35(4) state that within 30 days after the Committee has received the application, the Committee shall consider the application make their decision on whether to grant or reject a compliance audit.

Following the consideration of the application, the Committee will provide their decision and brief written reasons to the candidate or third party advertiser, the City Clerk, and the Applicant.

The decision of the Committee to grant a compliance audit may be appealed to the Superior Court of Justice within 15 days after the decision is made, and the court may make any decision the Committee could have made such as granting or rejecting the request for a compliance audit.

At its meeting on Monday, July 31, 2023, the Committee considered an election compliance audit application for Candidate Shawn Menard of Ward 17 Capital from the 2022 Municipal Elections. Following private deliberations, the Committee carried Motion No. ECAC 2023-02-02, rejecting the compliance audit application.

An appeal of the Committee's decision to reject the compliance audit application was subsequently filed with the Superior Court of Justice within 15 days of the Committee's decision being made in accordance with the MEA.

On February 20, 2025, the appeal related to the <u>committee's decision</u> to reject the application for a compliance audit of candidate Shawn Menard's campaign finances was considered and granted. The Superior Court of Justice reversed the decision of the committee and ordered the committee appoint an auditor to conduct a compliance audit.

Subsection 88.33(10) of the MEA requires that, should a compliance audit application be granted, the Committee shall appoint an auditor to conduct a compliance audit of the candidate's election campaign finances. In accordance with Subsection 88.33(11) of the MEA, the appointed Auditor must be licensed under the *Public Accounting Act*, 2004.

Approval of this report will satisfy the Committee's statutory obligation to appoint an auditor in accordance with the MEA.

DISCUSSION

The Office of the City Clerk initiated a call-up against the City's standing offer for Audit and Support Services (RFSO No. 37924-91804-S01). The call-up attached as

Document 1 was circulated to all seven firms on the standing offer list on March 28, 2025.

The following firm's proposal was submitted to the Elections Office on April 11, 2025:

1. OXARO Inc.

OXARO Inc.'s confidential written proposal was provided to the Election Compliance Audit Committee (the "Committee") on April 17, 2025.

The proposal from OXARO Inc. met all of the requirements outlined in the call-up on standing offer including the requirement that the Auditor(s) be licensed under the *Public Accounting Act, 2004* in accordance with Subsection 88.33(11) of the *Municipal Elections Act, 1996* (the "MEA").

Following the review of the above-noted proposal, the City Clerk, in consultation with the Committee's legal counsel, is recommending the Committee approve the appointment of OXARO Inc. to conduct the compliance audit. The City of Ottawa is responsible for the costs associated with the compliance audit.

Staff is further recommending that the Committee delegate the authority to finalize the contract and audit plan of the appointed firm to the City Clerk in consultation with the Committee's legal counsel.

Summary of audit services

The Auditor(s) appointed by the Committee will conduct a comprehensive compliance audit for Candidate Shawn Menard's election campaign finances from the 2022 Municipal Elections to determine whether the candidate appears to have contravened any of the campaign finance rules established by the MEA. Staff has estimated a timeline from April to June 2025 to complete the compliance audit.

In accordance with Subsection 88.33(15) of the MEA, the Auditor has the powers of a commission under Section 33 of the *Public Inquiries Act, 2009*. The Auditor is entitled to have access, at reasonable hours, to all relevant books, papers, documents, or things of the candidate, and to all relevant books, papers, documents or things of the City of Ottawa relating to the 2022 Municipal Elections. The Auditor can also issue summonses to compel persons to produce documents and give evidence under oath for the purposes of the compliance audit.

In addition, the Auditor's compliance audit is not limited to issues identified in the application for a compliance audit and are to be conducted in accordance with Subsection 88.33(12) and 88.33(15) of the MEA:

Duty of auditor

(12) The auditor shall promptly conduct an audit of the candidate's election campaign finances to determine whether he or she has complied with the provisions of this Act relating to election campaign finances and shall prepare a report outlining any apparent contravention by the candidate.

Powers of auditor

- (15) For the purpose of the audit, the auditor,
 - a) is entitled to have access, at all reasonable hours, to all relevant books, papers, documents or things of the candidate and of the municipality or local board; and
 - b) has the powers set out in section 33 of the Public Inquiries Act, 2009 and section 33 applies to the audit.

The Auditor(s) will prepare a report outlining any apparent contraventions of the MEA by the candidate as revealed or discovered during their compliance audit and submit it to the City Clerk.

The City Clerk will then forward the report to the Committee within 10 days of receipt. Within 30 days of receiving the report, the Committee shall hold a meeting for the purposes of considering the Auditor's report and decide whether legal proceedings should be commenced against the candidate for apparent contravention(s). The City of Ottawa is responsible for the prosecutor's costs related to commencing the legal proceedings.

The Auditor(s) will be required to attend the Committee meeting to make presentations and/or answer questions from committee members related to their audit. Should the Committee decide to commence a legal proceeding against the candidate for any apparent contravention(s), the Auditor(s) may be required to provide audit related evidence in an ensuing prosecution. This includes but is not limited to providing documentation and in-court testimony related to the audit and to cooperate with the independent prosecutor retained by the City carrying out the prosecution against the candidate.

In accordance with Subsection 94.2(1) of the MEA, no prosecution for an offence under the MEA in relation to the 2022 Municipal Elections shall be commenced after November 15, 2026.

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

In accordance with Subsection 88.37(7) of the MEA, the City of Ottawa shall pay all costs in relation to the Election Compliance Audit Committee's operation and activities. These costs will be funded from the Tax Stabilization Reserve.

LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no legal impediments to implementing the recommendations in the report.

COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR(S)

This is a City-wide report.

CONSULTATION

This report is required under the MEA and is administrative in nature, therefore no public consultation was required.

ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS

There are no accessibility implication associated with this report.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no risk management implications associated with this report.

RURAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

TERM OF COUNCIL PRIORITIES

This report has no direct impacts on the 2023-2026 City Strategic Plan and Term of Council Priorities.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Document 1 – Call-Up on Standing Offer for Auditing and Support Services – Election compliance audit of the campaign expenses of Candidate Shawn Menard of Ward 17 Capital from the 2022 Municipal Elections

Document 2 – Proposal from OXARO Inc. dated April 11, 2025 – Election compliance audit of the campaign expenses of Candidate Shawn Menard of Ward 17 Capital from the 2022 Municipal Elections – Confidential (*Held on file with the City Clerk*)

DISPOSITION

The City Clerk, in consultation with the Committee's independent legal counsel, will take the necessary steps to formalize the contract and audit plan with the appointed Auditor.

When the Auditor has completed their audit and submitted their final report to the City Clerk, the City Clerk will provide a copy of their report to the Applicant, Candidate Shawn Menard, and the Election Compliance Audit Committee (the "Committee") within 10 days of receipt.

Within 30 days of receiving the report, the Committee shall hold a meeting for the purposes of considering the Auditor's report and decide whether legal proceedings should be commenced against the candidate for apparent contravention(s).

If the Committee decides to commence legal proceedings, the City Clerk will carry out the required steps to implement the Committee's decision, pursuant to Section 88.37(6) of the MEA. Specifically, the City Clerk will, in consultation with the Committee's legal counsel, retain and refer this matter to an independent prosecutor who will have the usual power and authority of a prosecutor. The City Clerk may provide updates to the Committee on the status and/or conclusion of the legal proceedings.