

Subject: Designation of 501 Cole Avenue under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*

File Number: ACS2022-PIE-RHU-0028

Report to Built Heritage Sub-Committee on 20 June 2022

and Council 6 July 2022

Submitted on June 8, 2022 by Court Curry, Manager, Right of Way, Heritage and Urban Design Services, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department

Contact Person: Greg MacPherson, Planner I, Heritage Planning Branch

613-580-2424,23665, Greg.MacPherson@ottawa.ca

Ward: KITCHISSIPPI (15)

Objet : Désignation du bâtiment situé au 501, avenue Cole aux termes de la partie IV de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario*

Dossier : ACS2022-PIE-RHU-0028

Rapport au Sous-comité du patrimoine bâti

le 20 juin 2022

et au Conseil le 6 juillet 2022

Soumis le 8 juin 2022 par Court Curry, Gestionnaire, Services des emprises, du patrimoine et du design urbain, Direction générale de la planification, de l'immobilier et du développement économique

Personne ressource : Greg MacPherson, Planificateur 1, Planification du Patrimoine

613-580-2424,23665, Greg.MacPherson@ottawa.ca

Quartier : Kitchissippi (15)

REPORT RECOMMENDATIONS

That the Built Heritage Sub-Committee recommend that Planning Committee recommend that Council:

1. Issue a notice of intention to designate 501 Cole Avenue under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act according to the Statement of Cultural Heritage Value attached as Document 4;
2. Direct Heritage Staff to undertake further analysis of properties in Ward 15 listed on the City's Heritage Register to establish a proactive approach for designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

RECOMMANDATIONS DU RAPPORT

Que le Sous-comité du patrimoine bâti recommande au Comité de l'urbanisme de faire les recommandations suivantes au Conseil :

1. d'émettre un avis d'intention de désigner le 501, avenue Cole aux termes de la partie IV de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario*, selon la déclaration de valeur sur le plan du patrimoine culturel jointe en tant que document 4;
2. de demander au personnel de la Planification du patrimoine d'entreprendre une analyse plus détaillée des propriétés du quartier 15 qui sont inscrites au Registre du patrimoine de la Ville afin d'établir une approche proactive relativement à la désignation aux termes de la partie IV de la *Loi sur le patrimoine de l'Ontario*.

BACKGROUND

The house at 501 Cole Avenue is a two-and-one-half storey red-brick house constructed between 1913 and 1914 located in the Westboro neighbourhood of Highland Park, near the southeast intersection of Cole Avenue and Kenwood Avenue. The property was listed on the City of Ottawa's Municipal Heritage Register as a non-designated property in 2019 and City staff received a request to designate the property from the Westboro Community Association in October 2021.

Site History

In fall 2021, while the property was for sale, the City received an application for designation for this property, submitted by the Westboro Community Association. In April 2022 the current property owner made an application to the Committee of

Adjustment for consent to sever the existing property into two parcels for the purposes of constructing two new single detached houses. At this time, the 60 day notice required under Section 27 of the Ontario Heritage Act prior to the demolition of a property listed on the Municipal Heritage Register had not yet been submitted. As a result, the application was adjourned by the Committee of Adjustment at the April 20, 2022 meeting. The property owner completed the 60 day notice on May 9, 2022 and the 60 day notice period will expire on July 8, 2022. The Committee of Adjustment approved the application for consent on May 18, 2022. Two conditions of approval reference the 60 day notice period required under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Condition 1 requires the 60 day notice period to be completed, and condition 4 requires the applicant to provide proof that the existing house has been removed from the property. Should the property be designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* the applicant would be unable to satisfy condition 4 and the severance would lapse after two years.

Given the fact that the building has been listed on the City's Heritage Register for its potential cultural heritage value, staff have encouraged the property owner to explore alternatives to demolition such as constructing an addition to the existing building to allow for its use to be expanded. Staff were unsuccessful in these discussions.

This report has been prepared at the request of the ward councillor according to the Council approved procedures regarding the demolition of properties listed on the Heritage Register.

DISCUSSION

Recommendation 1:

In May 2022, the property owner submitted their notice of intention to demolish the building through the "Form for buildings listed on the Heritage Register." Staff acknowledged the notice of demolition and the 60-day timeline required under the *Ontario Heritage Act (OHA)* expires on July 8, 2022. Per the Council approved procedures, staff advised the ward councillor and the Chair of Built Heritage Sub-Committee of the Notice of Intention to Demolish. The ward councillor requested a report regarding the designation of the property under Part IV of the OHA be brought forward for consideration of committee and council.

Cultural Heritage Value

Staff researched and evaluated the property using the criteria in Ontario Regulation 09/06 (Document 2) for designation under the OHA. A property may be designated

under Part IV of the OHA if it meets at least one of the three criteria: design/physical value, contextual value and associative/historical value. The full evaluation is available in the Heritage Survey Form, attached as Document 3.

Design/Physical Value

The house at 501 Cole Avenue is a typical early 20th century upper-middle class residence. It is a vernacular building with stylistic elements drawn from Edwardian Classicism. The building does not display a high degree of craftsmanship and as a typical building of the period it does not have high technical or scientific merit. The house has limited design or physical value and staff have determined that it does not meet the criteria for design or physical value under O. Reg 09/06.

Historical/Associative Value

The house at 501 Cole had several owners through its history including Albert E. Morris, Treasurer for Nepean Township in the interwar period. It was also associated with the Highland Park Baptist church, now the Bromley Road Baptist Church, a local congregation that left Westboro in the 1950s. These associations are typical of the historic residential housing stock of Ottawa's west end. The house has limited associative value and staff have determined that it does not meet the criteria for historical value under O. Reg. 09/06.

Contextual Value

The property meets two of three of the contextual criteria in O.Reg 09/06 as it supports the historic character of Highland Park, and it is visually and historically linked to its surroundings. The property is not a landmark in the community. The contextual value of the property lies in it being one of the remaining houses built and designed in alignment with John E. Cole's vision for an affluent, cohesive, suburban Highland Park neighbourhood. The property's large lot, generous front lawn, mature trees, significant setback, and material palette directly reflect Cole's vision of the ideal suburb and the development of Highland Park and connect the house to other dwellings in Highland Park constructed in the same period. For these reasons, staff have determined that the property meets the criteria for contextual value according to Ontario Regulation 09/06.

Conclusion

As the house at 501 Cole Avenue demonstrates limited historic or architectural value, staff are of the opinion that the property's designation under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act* would not contribute meaningfully to the City's designation program nor

address any gaps in regard to associative or community histories not yet represented through heritage designation.

501 Cole Avenue meets the contextual value criteria for designation under Ontario Regulation 09/06., however staff do not believe that it is a strong candidate for designation under Part IV of the OHA. The designation process is values-based rather than based on a numerical scoring system, however, in general the practice of the City of Ottawa is to designate properties under Part IV of the OHA when they meet more than one e than one of the criteria for designation. The City's Heritage Register features many listed properties with similar values to this property and in staff's professional opinion, the designation of this property could set a precedent for future designations under the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Given the existing cluster of similarly aged houses near the intersection of Cole and Kenwood, including the adjacent 420 Kenwood, a property designated under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*, the historic context of Highland Park will be maintained despite the potential loss of 501 Cole. Other values embodied by this house, such as being representative of upper middle class suburban development in the late 19th and early 20th century, are represented in other buildings that are either designated or listed on the City's Heritage Register, including a further 21 listed houses which display similar physical characteristics, including a truncated hip roof and red brick cladding.

The department does not recommend the designation of this property under Part IV of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Recommendation 2:

Notices of Intention to Demolish buildings listed on the City's Heritage Register are more frequent in Ward 15 as the ward contains 335 listed heritage buildings alongside only a handful of designations under the *Ontario Heritage Act*. In addition, Ward 15 does not contain any heritage conservation districts or cultural heritage character areas. The area is rapidly intensifying and its heritage building stock is at risk of being lost over time. The current approach is that Heritage Planning staff react to Notices of Intention to Demolish on a case-by-case basis within a 60-day time limit. Given the City's essential role in heritage conservation and the rich history of Kitchissippi, Heritage Planning staff recommend that further analysis is undertaken to establish a more proactive approach for preserving the heritage building stock in Ward 15. This analysis will be completed within staff's existing workplan related to the Heritage Register.

Provincial Policy Statement

Staff have determined that not proceeding with the designation of this property is consistent with the Provincial Policy Statement, 2020.

RURAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no rural implications associated with this report.

CONSULTATION

The property owner is aware of this report and objects to the potential designation of this property.

The Ward Councillor was notified of the Notice of Intention to Demolish and requested this report.

The Chair of the Built Heritage Sub-committee is aware of this report.

The Westboro Community Association have been advised of this report.

COMMENTS BY THE WARD COUNCILLOR

The Ward Councillor provided the following comments:

“The temptation of heritage designation is to assume it applies only to a building which housed a figure well-known to us all: a house where Laurier slept, a cottage where Mackenzie King vacationed. Competition is stiff in a capital city; we have no shortage of important Canadians have lived on our streets, and the city has inspired equally important and significant buildings to line them.

Sometimes, however, honing in on the local – and what made a community – can be equally compelling. Such is the case when examining the quaint brick, two-and-one-half storey house located at 501 Cole Avenue.

Highland Park was one of the earliest neighbourhoods to experience growth in Westboro through purchase and subdivision of multiple properties by John E. Cole. Part of the explosion of development in Westboro soon after the turn of the 20th century, speculation spurred by the completion of a streetcar line fueled the neighbourhoods that appeared. The population of Westboro had grown seven times larger than its population in 1905 when 501 Cole was constructed in 1913. Advertisements for lots for the very year of its construction advertised Highland Park as an area to be celebrated for its community of neighbours who took pride in their neighbourhood. (“Westboro, ‘Ottawa’s

Westmount': An illustrative number devoted to its past, present and future growth," 1913).

Standing alongside the 420 Kenwood, better known as the Cobble Cottage, the context of the building and its inhabitants represent a sum greater than their parts. It is not simply a matter of the inhabitants of the building, but the visitors and attendees of Highland Park events, who established the significance of the building to its community. As one of first batch of homes to occupy the corner of Kenwood and Cole, the house at 501 Cole exemplifies the character sought by the first owners of the Highland Park area. When the Highland Park Baptist Church established the home as their manse in the 1940s, it cemented the humble building as a centerpiece in the neighbourhood. Unlike other homes, the site of the church's manse made it an institution in its own right. In the 1950s, perhaps with a sense of normalcy returning to the community after the war, the church hosted Highland Park's Strawberry Socials at the manse for a decade; reuniting the community, and further establishing itself as a cornerstone of the neighbourhood.

Ranging from the creation of Cole's first lots in the west end to the Highland Park Strawberry Social, the house represents the development of a fundamental part of the Highland Park neighbourhood. The sizable lots, peppered with trees and cemented by their turn-of-the-century homes served the community for decades to come. It is a touchstone in the narrative of the Highland Park neighbourhood, especially as it continues to see its surroundings continuously transformed.

Intensification is occurring at a rapid pace in Highland Park, and it is reasonable to predict that it will continue in light of new Official Plan policies. The area will shoulder a significant amount of the low-rise residential infill required to meet our intensification policies and designation of this structure will not meaningfully affect the supply of housing in the area. Preserving this touchstone to an earlier time will be to the benefit of the hundreds of residents who will call this area home over the next generation. In this context, I would also ask sub-committee members that they keep in mind that the request for designation of this property was submitted prior to it becoming a development possibility. The strong community support for this request isn't driven by a thrust to forestall the future, but a genuine desire to recall and celebrate the past.

Sources

*Elliott, Bruce. *The City Beyond: A History of Nepean, Birthplace of Canada's Capital, 1792-1990*. 1991."

Westboro', "Ottawa's Westmount": An Illustrative Number Devoted to Its Past, Present and Future Growth. Published and Printed under the personal supervision of J. Bower Lyon, Advertising Specialist, 1913. <https://www.canadiana.ca/view/oocihm.80370/1>.

LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no legal implications associated with the report recommendation.

RISK MANAGEMENT IMPLICATIONS

There are no risk implications

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

There are no direct financial implications.

ACCESSIBILITY IMPACTS

There are no accessibility implications associated with this report.

TERM OF COUNCIL PRIORITIES

This project addresses the following Term of Council Priorities:

- Thriving Communities: Promote safety, culture, social and physical well-being for our residents.

APPLICATION PROCESS TIMELINE STATUS

The statutory 60-day timeline for consideration of this item under the *Ontario Heritage Act* will expire on July 8, 2022.

SUPPORTING DOCUMENTATION

Document 1 Location Map

Document 2 Ontario Regulation 09/06

Document 3 Heritage Survey Form

Document 4 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

DISPOSITION

If Council follows Recommendation 1, no further steps are required. If Council proceeds with the issuance of a Notice of Intention to Designate for the property located at 501 Cole Avenue, several actions must be taken:

- 1) Heritage Planning Branch, Planning Real Estate and Economic Development Department, to prepare the Notice of Intention to Designate. Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services to notify the property owner and the Ontario Heritage Trust (10 Adelaide Street East, 3rd Floor, Toronto, Ontario, M5C 1J3) of Council's decision to issue a Notice of Intention to Designate 190 Laurier Avenue East under Part IV of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- 2) Heritage Planning Branch, Planning Real Estate and Economic Development Department to ensure publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate in the newspaper according to the requirements of Section 29 the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- 3) If the City Clerk receives a Notice of Objection under Section 29(5) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* within thirty days of the publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate, the Heritage Planning Branch, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department is to prepare a report regarding the objection for consideration by Council within 90 days after conclusion of the objection period, according to Section 29(6) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- 4) If the City Clerk does not receive any Notice of Objection under Section 29(5) of the *Ontario Heritage Act* within thirty days of the publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate, or if City Council decides not to withdraw the notice of intention to designate the property after an objection as been served, the Heritage Planning Branch, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department, is to prepare the designation by-law, under the authority of the approval of this report and Legal Services to submit to City Council for enactment within 120 days of the publication of the Notice of Intention to Designate as prescribed in Section 29(8) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.
- 5) Office of the City Clerk, Council and Committee Services to cause a copy of the by-law together with a statement explaining the cultural heritage value or interest of the property and a description of the heritage attributes of the property, to be served on the owner of the property and on the Trust according to the requirements of the *Ontario Heritage Act*. Heritage Planning Branch, Planning, Real Estate and Economic Development Department to ensure publication of the

notice of the by-law in the newspaper according to the requirements Section 29(8)(4) of the *Ontario Heritage Act*.

Document 4 - Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

Description of Property – 501 Cole Avenue, Ottawa

The house located at 501 Cole Avenue is a two-and-one-half storey, red brick clad building with a truncated hip roof constructed in 1913 and located on the east side of Cole Avenue, south of Kenwood Avenue, in the Highland Park neighbourhood in Ottawa’s west end.

Statement of cultural heritage value or interest

The cultural heritage value of 501 Cole Avenue lies in its contextual value for its contribution to the character of the Highland Park neighbourhood and its design value as an example of early twentieth century vernacular residential architecture.

501 Cole Avenue has contextual value as a house designed and constructed subject to John E. Cole’s requirements for large residences in Highland Park. Cole, one of a number of dairy farmers in Ottawa’s west end in the late 19th century, subdivided his land in 1898 with the vision of creating a prosperous, cohesive suburban neighbourhood and included a covenant on the area’s large lots to ensure development was in keeping with this vision. The house is situated on a large lot that features mature trees along the property line, a green front lawn and a generous setback in keeping with the character of other houses from this period in Highland Park.

501 Cole Avenue has design value as a typical early 20th century example of vernacular suburban residential architecture. Typical of the time period, it features Edwardian Classicist elements including the red brick cladding central two storey porch with simple columns and triangular pediment, a central hipped dormer, and a stone foundation.

Description of Heritage Attributes

Key exterior attributes that contribute to the contextual heritage value are:

- The generous front yard setback from Cole Avenue; and,
- The green front lawn and mature trees along the property lines.

Key exterior elements that contribute to the heritage value as an example of early twentieth century vernacular suburban residential architecture in Highland Park:

- Simple square plan and the siting of the building on the lot;
- Red brick cladding;
- Central two storey front porch with pedimented roof;
- Symmetrical front façade with rectangular windows on either side of central two-storey porch; and,
- Truncated hip roof.