

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

2020 DRAFT OPERATING AND CAPITAL BUDGET –
TRANSIT COMMISSION

ACS2019-FSD-FIN-0007

CITY WIDE

Referred from the City Council meeting of November 6, 2019.

REPORT RECOMMENDATION:

That the Transit Commission consider the relevant portions of the draft 2020 Operating and Capital Budgets and forward its recommendations to Council, sitting as Committee of the Whole, for consideration at the meeting to be held 11 December 2019.

At the outset, Chair Hubley asked that the following Budget-related Motions that had been submitted in advance of the meeting, be read aloud, as follows:

MOTION N^o TTC 2019 08/03

Vice-Chair J. Cloutier read out the following Motion:

THAT the Transit Commission recommend that Council, sitting as Committee of the Whole, approve the Transit Commission 2020 Draft Operating and Capital Budget, as follows:

- 1. Transit Services as follows:**
 - a. User fees (pages 4-6);**
 - b. Operating Resource Requirement (page 3);**
- 2. Transit Commission Capital Budget (pages 7 and 8, individual**

11 DECEMBER 2019

**EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8**

**EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019**

20 NOVEMBER 2019

projects listed on pages 16-37).

MOTION N^o TTC 2019 08/04

Commissioner R. Brockington read out the following Motion:

WHEREAS the Family DayPass for OC Transpo is only available on Saturdays, Sundays and statutory holidays, allowing a family group to ride all day on a single DayPass for \$10.75; and

WHEREAS a family can be made up of as many as six people, with a maximum of two aged 13 or older; and

WHEREAS providing additional opportunities for families to ride public transit promotes future ridership; and

WHEREAS it would be beneficial to families to have the Family DayPass also available during March Break, the months of July and August, and the two-week school board over the Christmas week and New Year's holiday period;

WHEREAS providing additional opportunities for families to ride public transit during peak tourist seasons will create an economic boost for Ottawa businesses; and

WHEREAS staff has not yet been able to fully quantify the financial impacts of this change, which could potentially be revenue positive, neutral or negative to the City, but anticipate that any one-time administrative costs and/ or modest revenue impact (if any) can be accommodated through the existing proposed Transit Services operating budget and/or Transit Reserve Fund.

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass during the March Break as scheduled in 2020 by the four school boards in Ottawa, beginning on the Saturday through to, and including, the following Sunday; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass from July 1 to September 7, 2020; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass from the first Saturday of the primary and secondary school Christmas week through the period ending on the Sunday before school classes begin, as scheduled in 2020-21 by the four school boards in Ottawa; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT staff report back in the proposed 2021 budget with any estimated changes to ridership and fare revenue that were recorded in 2020, so that Council can make a decision on whether to make this a regular change to the OC Transpo fare table.

Commissioner T. Kavanagh read out the following, that she said she intended to submit as Direction to Staff:

That staff review the Ottawa Seniors' Transportation Committee (OSTC) proposal to Transit Commission entitled "Senior Pick Your Ride Free Day" and report back to the Transit Commission with information on the feasibility of implementing this proposal now or in the future.

11 DECEMBER 2019

**EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8**

**EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019**

20 NOVEMBER 2019

Commissioner T. Tierney read out the following Motion:

WHEREAS Council has adopted a Transit Long Range Financial Plan, which is predicated on annual increases to transit fares to keep pace with transit cost inflation and maintain an appropriate balance between funding for transit from taxes and fares; and

WHEREAS Council on June 15, 2016, approved that the annual fare increase should be made on January 1 each year to be consistent with the City's budget year, subject to annual budget approval; and

WHEREAS by decision of Council, the 2019 fare increase was frozen until October 1, 2019, in recognition of the delay in opening O-Train Line 1; and

WHEREAS the 2020 Draft Budget recommends an overall 2.5% base increase to OC Transpo Fares, to take effect on January 1, 2020; and

WHEREAS the Transit Commission is of the opinion that the current service being provided on O-Train Line 1 is not yet satisfactory and that transit users have been experiencing challenging and uncertain commutes as a result of the ongoing issues and service interruptions on LRT; and

WHEREAS maintaining the current fares would recognize the challenges experienced by OC Transpo customers since the launch of the LRT; and

WHEREAS freezing fares at 2019 levels from January to March 2020 would result in an approximate reduction in fare revenue of \$980,000, and the City Treasurer has advised that it is reasonable to expect that this reduction over the short-term can be funded from financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the effective date for the

11 DECEMBER 2019

**EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8**

**EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019**

20 NOVEMBER 2019

recommended 2020 fare increases be amended from January 1 to April 1, 2020, with the anticipated revenue reduction of \$980,000 to be funded from the anticipated funds from the financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Transit Commission recommend Council direct the General Manager of Transportation Services to bring forward recommendations to Transit Commission and Council no later than February 2020 on how a freeze beyond March 2020 could be funded in the event that LRT service to transit passengers has not improved to the City's satisfaction.

The Commission received a detailed slide presentation overview of its portion of the 2020 City of Ottawa Capital and Operating Budget from Mr. John Manconi, General Manager, Transportation Services Department. Ms. Marian Simulik, General Manager, Finance Services Department and City Treasurer, was also present to speak to reserve balances and to respond to questions. A copy of the presentation is held on file with the City Clerk.

Vice-Chair Cloutier noted that written correspondence had been received from Mr. Murray Gallant*, on behalf of the Accessibility Advisory Committee. A copy of Mr. Gallant's submission is held on file with the City Clerk.

The Commission then heard from the following delegations:

- Ms Dominique D'Angelo*, referencing a prepared statement, spoke to the experiences of public transit users on low incomes.
- Mr. John Redins spoke to fare disparities between regular transit and Para Transpo, expressed concerns with the safety and conditions of Para Transpo vehicles, and that the system's users might not be aware of complaints mechanisms that are available to them.

11 DECEMBER 2019

**EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8**

**EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019**

20 NOVEMBER 2019

-
- Ms Christine Santelé*, City for All Women Initiative (CAWI), spoke of her experiences with OC Transpo as a senior and as a low-income person with disabilities, who relies heavily on transit for mobility across the City. She advocated for transit equity in Ottawa.
 - Mr. Assaf Mitta, on behalf of Mr. Alex Cullen*, Chair, Ottawa Seniors Transportation Committee, spoke of concerns with respect to OC Transpo's Free Seniors Day on Wednesday, and to a proposal to have seniors pick their own 'free ride day'.
 - Mr. Alex Cullen*, Vice-President, Federation of Citizens Associations (FCA), proposed a number of principles to the Transit Commission to fund fixes to the LRT system.
 - Ms Sally Thomas spoke as both a Para Transpo user and as a user of conventional transit. She thanked the Commission for an LRT system that she said was better than expected, but she took issue with its connectivity. She felt that the money being invested in taxis to augment the service would be better spent on bus drivers or more buses, and that Para Transpo should also offer a 'Seniors Ride Free' Day.
 - Mr. Trevor Haché*, Healthy Transportation Coalition, expressed concerns similar to those of earlier delegation regarding inequities, and of unfairness for poorer seniors when wealthy seniors could also ride free for two days during the week. He encourage the City to review the transit fare structure.
 - Ms Miranda Gray expressed concerns related to getting the LRT and transit service to a point of stability, and questioned the costs involved.
 - Mr. Raymond Leury, Electric Vehicle Council of Ottawa, recommended the adoption electric buses as a cleaner, healthier form of transportation. He suggested that operational costs could be reduced by seeking to leverage funding from other levels of government

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

-
- Ms Catherine Gardner spoke to express concerns with how online booking will work, questioned whether staffing was adequate, whether there could be more funding allocated for Para Transpo buses, and whether Para Transpo buses could match the service hours of regular transit. She also recommended a number of system improvements that she believed would both save money and increase ridership.

*[* Individuals / groups marked with an asterisk above either provided comments in writing or by e-mail; all submissions are held on file with the City Clerk.]*

Commissioner Brockington raised a Point of Order and asked whether the “Seniors Pick Your Ride Free Day” Direction would amount to reconsideration of a matter the Commission had dealt with, and rejected, earlier in the year. Mr. Taffy Nahas, Legal Counsel, Innovative Client Services Department, advised that this *would* amount to reconsideration, requiring the support of three-quarters of all members present and voting.

Based on the advice of Legal Counsel and the General Manager’s assertion that the Department could not, at present, implement her intended Direction regarding the OSTC proposal, Commissioner Kavanagh said she would instead introduce it as a Commission Inquiry, for *future* consideration (*Inquiry TTC 10-19*).

The Commission’s questions to staff, and discussions, included but were not necessarily limited to: bus routes, reliability and the cost of adding 40 buses as a contingency against LRT breakdowns; fare increases in 2020 and the scheduling of same; suggested alterations to LRT stations; RTG’s 30-year maintenance guarantee; a fare freeze proposed for early 2020, as well as the potential effects of extending such a freeze; whether it would be better to spend money on service improvements; Para Transpo staffing and customer wait times; questions on the costs of the Family Pass; whether the Budget will allow the Department to meet levels of service earlier directed by Council, and; the need to acquire new riders.

11 DECEMBER 2019

LE 11 DÉCEMBRE 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN

20 NOVEMBER 2019

LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

As a result of Commission discussions, Commissioner McKenney said she would submit a Direction to Staff asking *that staff provide to Council, before December 11, 2019, the cost of providing two days of free transit each week for low income residents, similar to the program already offered to seniors.*

Discussions having concluded, the Commission then considered the Motions submitted earlier.

During earlier discussions, Commissioner Brockington had amended his original Motion to add the following...

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass on Family Day;

...to read:

REVISED MOTION N^o TTC 2019 08/04

Moved by Commissioner R. Brockington:

WHEREAS the Family DayPass for OC Transpo is only available on Saturdays, Sundays and statutory holidays, allowing a family group to ride all day on a single DayPass for \$10.75; and

WHEREAS a family can be made up of as many as six people, with a maximum of two aged 13 or older; and

WHEREAS providing additional opportunities for families to ride public transit promotes future ridership; and

WHEREAS it would be beneficial to families to have the Family DayPass also available during March Break, the months of July and August, and the two-week school board over the Christmas week and New Year's holiday period;

11 DECEMBER 2019

LE 11 DÉCEMBRE 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN

20 NOVEMBER 2019

LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

WHEREAS providing additional opportunities for families to ride public transit during peak tourist seasons will create an economic boost for Ottawa businesses; and

WHEREAS staff has not yet been able to fully quantify the financial impacts of this change, which could potentially be revenue positive, neutral or negative to the City, but anticipate that any one-time administrative costs and/ or modest revenue impact (if any) can be accommodated through the existing proposed Transit Services operating budget and/or Transit Reserve Fund.

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass during the March Break as scheduled in 2020 by the four school boards in Ottawa, beginning on the Saturday through to, and including, the following Sunday; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass from July 1 to September 7, 2020; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass from the first Saturday of the primary and secondary school Christmas week through the period ending on the Sunday before school classes begin, as scheduled in 2020-21 by the four school boards in Ottawa; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass on Family Day; and

THEREFORE BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED THAT staff report back in the proposed 2021 budget with any estimated changes to ridership and fare revenue that were recorded in 2020, so that Council can make a decision on whether to make this a regular change to the OC Transpo fare table.

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

CARRIED

Commissioner McKenney had proposed to defer an increase in transit fares to *the end* of 2020, and as this would have served to amend Commissioner Tierney's Motion, it was voted on first, as follows:

MOTION N^o TTC 2019 08/06

Moved by Commissioner C. McKenney:

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the effective date for the recommended 2020 fare increases be amended from January 1 to December 31, 2020, with the anticipated revenue reduction \$4,950,000 to be funded from the anticipated funds from the financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group.

LOST, on a division of 7 'Nays' to 4 'Yeas', as follows:

NAYS (7): Commissioners R. Brockington, G. Gower, M. Olsen, J. Sudds, T. Tierney, J. Cloutier and A. Hubley

YEAS (4): Commissioners A. Carricato, T. Kavanagh, C. McKenney and S. Wright-Gilbert

The Commission then considered Commissioner Tierney's Motion on fare increases (to implement a fare freeze):

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

MOTION N^o TTC 2019 08/05

Moved by Commissioner T. Tierney:

WHEREAS Council has adopted a Transit Long Range Financial Plan, which is predicated on annual increases to transit fares to keep pace with transit cost inflation and maintain an appropriate balance between funding for transit from taxes and fares; and

WHEREAS Council on June 15, 2016, approved that the annual fare increase should be made on January 1 each year to be consistent with the City's budget year, subject to annual budget approval; and

WHEREAS by decision of Council, the 2019 fare increase was frozen until October 1, 2019, in recognition of the delay in opening O-Train Line 1; and

WHEREAS the 2020 Draft Budget recommends an overall 2.5% base increase to OC Transpo Fares, to take effect on January 1, 2020; and

WHEREAS the Transit Commission is of the opinion that the current service being provided on O-Train Line 1 is not yet satisfactory and that transit users have been experiencing challenging and uncertain commutes as a result of the ongoing issues and service interruptions on LRT; and

WHEREAS maintaining the current fares would recognize the challenges experienced by OC Transpo customers since the launch of the LRT; and

WHEREAS freezing fares at 2019 levels from January to March 2020 would result in an approximate reduction in fare revenue of \$980,000, and the City Treasurer has advised that it is reasonable to expect that this reduction over the short-term can be funded from financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group;

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED THAT the effective date for the recommended 2020 fare increases be amended from January 1 to April 1, 2020, with the anticipated revenue reduction of \$980,000 to be funded from the anticipated funds from the financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that Transit Commission recommend Council direct the General Manager of Transportation Services to bring forward recommendations to Transit Commission and Council no later than February 2020 on how a freeze beyond March 2020 could be funded in the event that LRT service to transit passengers has not improved to the City's satisfaction.

CARRIED

The report recommendation was then put before the Commission and was 'CARRIED', as amended by Motions N^{OS} TTC 2019 08/03 (Roadmap), *Revised* TTC 2019 08/04 (Family DayPass) and TTC 2019 08/05 (Fare Freeze), with a call for 'Yeas' and 'Nays', as outlined below:

That the Transit Commission recommend that Council, sitting as Committee of the Whole, approve the Transit Commission 2020 Draft Operating and Capital Budget, as follows:

1. Transit Services User Fees (pages 4-6), as amended by the following:

a. That OC Transpo implement the Family DayPass:

- i. during the March Break as scheduled in 2020 by the four school boards in Ottawa, beginning on the Saturday through to, and including, the following Sunday; and**
- ii. from July 1 to September 7, 2020; and**

11 DECEMBER 2019

EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8

EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019

20 NOVEMBER 2019

-
- iii. from the first Saturday of the primary and secondary school Christmas week through the period ending on the Sunday before school classes begin, as scheduled in 2020-21 by the four school boards in Ottawa; and
 - iv. on Family Day;
 - b. That staff report back in the proposed 2021 Budget with any estimated changes to ridership and fare revenue that were recorded in 2020, so that Council can make a decision on whether to make this a regular change to the OC Transpo fare table;
 - c. That the effective date for the recommended 2020 fare increases be amended from January 1 to April 1, 2020, with the anticipated revenue reduction of \$980,000 to be funded from the anticipated funds from the financial and performance provisions in the Project Agreement with the Rideau Transit Group;
 - d. That the the General Manager of Transportation Services be directed to bring forward recommendations to Transit Commission and Council no later than February 2020 on how a freeze beyond March 2020 could be funded in the event that LRT service to transit passengers has not improved to the City's satisfaction;
- 2. Transit Services Operating Resource Requirement (page 3); and
 - 3. Transit Commission Capital Budget (pages 7 and 8, individual projects listed on pages 16-37).

11 DECEMBER 2019

**EXTRACT OF DRAFT TRANSIT
COMMISSION MINUTES 8**

**EXTRAIT DE L'ÉBAUCHE DU
PROCÈS-VERBAL 8 DE LA
COMMISSION DU TRANSPORT
EN COMMUN
LE 20 NOVEMBRE 2019**

20 NOVEMBER 2019

CARRIED as amended, on a division of 8 'Yeas' to 3 'Nays', as follows:

YEAS (8): Commissioners A. Carricato, G. Gower, T. Kavanagh, M. Olsen,
J. Sudds, T. Tierney, J. Cloutier and A. Hubley

NAYS (3): Commissioners R. Brockington, C. McKenney and
S. Wright-Gilbert

The following Direction was also provided:

DIRECTION TO STAFF:

That Staff provide to Council, before December 11, 2019, the cost of providing two days of free transit each week for low income residents, similar to the program already offered to seniors.