

Municipal Comparators (\*as reported by KPMG in 2016)

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
<p><b>1. Please describe how your by-law administration and enforcement business unit is organized.</b></p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Under umbrella of <b>Policy, Gaming, Licensing, and Enforcement</b></li> <li>• Conducts enforcement and licensing for all regulations, with no specialization by specific by-law</li> <li>• <b>Parking and Property Standards</b> are under <b>different business units.</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Organized under the <b>Municipal Licensing and Standards branch</b></li> <li>• 4 service lines               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Investigation</li> <li>• By-law enforcement</li> <li>• Animal services</li> <li>• Business licensing &amp; regulatory services</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Parking Enforcement</b> is delivered by the <b>Toronto Police Service.</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Organized under <b>By-law and Licensing Services</b></li> <li>• Underwent a reorganization in September 2016</li> <li>• 4 service lines               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Licensing</li> <li>• Animals</li> <li>• Municipal Law Enforcement</li> <li>• Lottery</li> </ul> </li> <li>• <b>Parking is delivered by Transit.</b></li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <b>By-law and Regulatory Services Branch</b> is part of Emergency &amp; Protective Services Department and includes 5 units:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Parking Enforcement</li> <li>• By-law Enforcement</li> <li>• Operational Support Service</li> <li>• Dispatch, Training and Logistics;</li> <li>• Issues Management/By-law Review/Policy Development</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p>Ottawa has the following service lines:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Property Standards, Zoning</li> <li>• Animal Care &amp; Control, Noise, Parks, Signs, Tobacco Control, Vehicles-for-Hire enforcement</li> <li>• Spay/Neuter Clinic, Municipal Animal Shelter Services Agreement with Ottawa</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
				Humane Society, Large Wild Mammal Emergency Response <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Business Licensing, Pet Registration, Vehicles-for-Hire administration</li> <li>• Lottery Licensing</li> <li>• Conducts policy/by-law development, administration and enforcement for majority of above-noted regulations</li> </ul>
1a. What is your staff complement?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 26 FTEs (17)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 12 By-law Enforcement Officers (1 per ward + floater)</li> <li>• 3 property standards officers;</li> <li>• 2 parks inspectors</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 469 FTEs (378)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 230 By-law Enforcement Officers</li> <li>• 30 Animal Care/Control Officers</li> <li>• 97 Licensing Officers</li> <li>• 21 Policy Staff</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 54 FTEs (40)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 18 Property Standards Officers</li> <li>• 8 Environmental Officers</li> <li>• 4 Special Enforcement Officers</li> <li>• 6 Licensing Officer</li> <li>• 4 Animal Services Officers</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 153.78 FTEs (117)               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 13 Property Standards/Zoning Officers</li> <li>• 26 By-law Generalists</li> <li>• 69 Parking Control Officers</li> <li>• 6 Licensing Assistants</li> <li>• 3 By-law Review / Policy / Issues Management</li> </ul> </li> </ul>
1b. What is the budget for the by-law unit?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By-law: \$1.4 million in expenditures</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$52 million in expenditures               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Licensing - \$8.5 million</li> <li>• Animal Care/Control - \$9.8 million</li> <li>• Property Standards - \$16.4 million</li> <li>• By-law Enforcement - \$17.4 million</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$6.8 million in expenditures               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Animal Services - \$2.7 million</li> <li>• Municipal Law Enforcement - \$3.9 million</li> <li>• Licensing – (\$128,000)</li> <li>• Directors Office - \$691,000</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$11.6 million in expenditures (Prop Stds, Licensing, Taxi etc.)</li> <li>• \$8.2 million in expenditure (Parking)</li> <li>• \$19.8 million parking fine revenue</li> <li>• \$6.1 million in licensing revenue</li> <li>• Branch Totals:               <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$19.8 million expenditures</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
				<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• \$25.9 million revenue</li> </ul>
1c. What percentage of the by-law unit's expenditures is financed through taxes vs revenues?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By-law: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2.7% from revenue</li> <li>• 97.3% from tax levy</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	Revenue Sources: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 37% from property tax</li> <li>• 4% user fees</li> <li>• 54% license and permit</li> <li>• 5% transfers from capital</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Percentage of funding wasn't available</li> <li>• Net revenue contribution from Licensing of \$128,000</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 100% from revenue (fees, parking fines)</li> </ul>
2. What are the leading complaints requiring by-law services?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Windsor receives 13,953 By-law requests for service</li> <li>• Highest: Yard Maintenance (4,927)</li> <li>• Second highest: Dog Control (4,229 – including licensing)</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Toronto receives ~110,000 requests for service in total</li> <li>• <b>By-law:</b> ~20,000 requests for service</li> <li>• Highest - noise complaints &amp; taxis</li> <li>• <b>Zoning:</b> ~45-50,000 requests for service</li> <li>• Highest – waste disposal</li> <li>• <b>Animals:</b> ~40,000 requests for service</li> <li>• ~200,000 total “inspections”, or responses, in total, with some calls taking multiple visits</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Top three complaints: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Property Standards: 3675</li> <li>• Noise: 2415</li> <li>• Zoning: 916</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Licensing <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 4502 business licenses</li> <li>• 1727 mobile licenses</li> <li>• 1900 trade licenses</li> <li>• 27 sign licenses</li> </ul> </li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Animals, Property Standards , Parking and Noise Requests for Service comprise 84% of all By-law RFS's received <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Animals = 10,845</li> <li>• Property Standards = 9,943</li> <li>• Noise = 9,717</li> <li>• Parking Enforcement = 32,019</li> </ul> </li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
<p>3 Does your unit have services standards in place, and an approach to performance measures and monitoring?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service standards are part of the 311 call centre metrics <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Based on time frame for close</li> <li>• Majority of standards are “within 21 days”</li> <li>• Council is updated once a year</li> <li>• Current performance standard is ~90%</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Officers required to complete minimum of 10 investigations / day</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By-law’s service standards: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Emergency: 24 hours</li> <li>• Non-emergency: 5 days</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Animal care: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Between 2 to 48 hours</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Performance is reported as percentage of calls within service standards and is reported annually in annual budget</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service standards exist on the basis of call priority</li> <li>• Performance is reported on a monthly basis to council</li> <li>• Data collection and performance reporting is new as of January, includes: days to license, charges laid, outstanding fines, calls received</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service standards based on time frame (days) to close a Request for Service. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Service request guidelines by Priority 1 (24 Hrs)</li> <li>• Service request guidelines by Priority 2 (48 Hrs)</li> <li>• Service request guidelines by Priority 3 (96 Hrs)</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Performance is reported monthly, quarterly and yearly (Property Stds Officers, Generalists, Licensing and Parking Control Officers)</li> <li>• By-law report card (Quarterly)</li> </ul>
<p>4 Are there new or emerging priorities that will impact front-line staff and your unit as a whole?</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Transportation network company by- law was recently passed by Council</li> <li>• Taxi enforcement</li> <li>• Lodging homes by-law is going to Council and is emerging as a priority</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Liquor licensing changes for dinner clubs</li> <li>• Emerging sharing economy business models, e.g. vehicle-for-hire and Air BnB Regulatory by-law for apartments</li> <li>• Rooming houses</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• At the moment, it’s unclear – data collection should inform identification of priorities impacting operations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cannabis legalization</li> <li>• Emerging sharing economy issues such as vehicles-for-hire (new by-law introduced in 2016, legalized PTCs), property rentals (Airbnb)</li> <li>• Landlord licensing, rooming houses/private home conversions</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
5a. What key services and programs within your unit are working well?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By and large, most things are working well</li> <li>• Backlog is manageable even though request for service volumes are high</li> <li>• Noise complaints are handled by complainants – provided a package to indicate the type of evidence required, and if completed a Part III charge will be laid</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Building audit program – proactive inspection of apartments</li> <li>• The mobile spay/neuter clinic</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Focus on shifting culture away from enforcement and towards compliance and behavior as “ambassadors for the city” is having positive impact</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Parking fine revenue is steady</li> <li>• New VFH By-law successfully implemented</li> </ul>
5b. What key services/programs within your unit are not working well?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Did not indicate any particular service areas that were not performing</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Rooming houses by-law is causing friction from the community</li> <li>• Liquor licensing and impact on community</li> <li>• Dogs off leash</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Performance management and data collection and analysis is new and creating challenges</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Proactive business license enforcement is not sufficient</li> </ul>
6. Does your unit have capacity gaps and if so, what are the needs that are currently not being	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is currently insufficient capacity to conduct proactive work</li> <li>• Night shifts can only be conducted</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Overall capacity is sufficient – the Branch regularly turns down additional enforcement resources</li> <li>• The Branch lacks the necessary support services to be as efficient and effective as possible</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Currently have surplus capacity – there are more resources available than required to deliver on enforcement and administration needs</li> <li>• Data collection and analysis is intended to identify specific</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insufficient capacity to conduct proactive enforcement</li> <li>• MAP system does not support data collection/analysis</li> <li>• Radios continue to be inconsistent performance/reliability</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
addressed and what would you require to address them?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>on an ad-hoc basis</li> <li>There is no surge capacity to handle licensing “crush” periods, e.g. dog licensing renewal in February and March</li> <li>Snow removal enforcement and business licensing are generally under strain</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The Branch needs to improve its data analytics capabilities</li> <li>Supervisors and managers need more training and guidance to enhance and increase decision-making at lower levels of management</li> </ul>	areas of over-supply	
7. Are all of your staff being fully utilized or are there opportunities to better leverage their skills?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff are fully utilized unless there is lighter-than-average snowfall</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Staff are fully utilized</li> <li>Resources could be better utilized if data was available to identify high-impact activities on which to focus</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Utilization is relatively low, given excess capacity</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Majority of staff is fully-utilized</li> </ul>
8. Is there explicit or implicit direction from Council on by-law enforcement? Are individual Councilors involved in the enforcement or	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Given that there is a single by-law officer assigned to each ward, each Councillor has a personal relationship with their ward officer</li> <li>Officers try to collect emails and</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Councillors have an active working relationship with the Branch at a policy and management level</li> <li>There are 125 outstanding directives from Councillors – multi-year backlog</li> <li>There is a policy prohibiting Councillors from directing enforcement activities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Councillors are very active in engaging with by-law administration and enforcement</li> <li>The organization has adapted structurally to accommodate Councillors – they have a separate email inbox, and Special Enforcement Officers are</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Formal motions through Committee and Council</li> <li>Varying degrees of informal involvement</li> <li>Councillor requests tend to be given priority</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
non-enforcement of by-laws?	<p>correspondence with Councillors to share with management</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Councillor requests are prioritized, which create a strain on capacity</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Managers work to shield by-law enforcement offers from Councillor directives</li> </ul>	<p>dedicated to dealing with councilor requests</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Councillors are more focused on “open for business” licensing policies</li> </ul>	
9. Can you describe your relationship with the municipality’s police service? Is by-law enforcement part of a broader community safety model?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No collaboration with Police outside of fireworks management</li> <li>• This is different from previously, where relationship with police was strong</li> <li>• The relationship with the Police has weakened over the past several years</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There is a good and open relationship with the Police Service</li> <li>• Joint investigations are common, and charges are stronger when going to prosecution</li> <li>• The General Manager is a former police officer which keeps channels open between the two organizations</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Very strong relationships with police, with many joint initiatives</li> <li>• Noise complaints are often dealt with in tandem with police</li> <li>• Head of unit is a former deputy police chief</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Good relationship with Ottawa Police Service, which mainly assists BLRS on problematic noise complaints</li> <li>• OPS is available to assist By-law Officers on calls with suspected criminality or potential violence</li> <li>• BLRS contributes to community safety</li> </ul>
10. What technology do you use for by-law administration and enforcement, in particular for	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Branch uses the AMANADA 7 case management software system for by-law</li> <li>• Parking uses a package from ParkSmart, Inc,</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Branch uses three IT systems that have been modified extensively; they no longer receive vendor support (youngest system is 23 years old)</li> <li>• IT systems do not communicate with one another</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Two systems exist as a result of reorganization: Hansen and AMANADA</li> <li>• AMANDA is considered primary system for by-law, with Hansen housing legacy data</li> <li>• Not highly satisfied with AMANDA, currently</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• By-law Enforcement uses MAP/GIS and Toughbook on site.</li> <li>• Parking uses a package from ParkSmart, Inc, which includes AutoCite X3 handhelds, supplies, and software for managing ticket</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
parking enforcement?	<p>which includes AutoCite X3 handhelds, supplies, and software for managing ticket information</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Enforcement officers are mobile and are assigned laptops</li> <li>GPS system monitors officer locations on a regular basis</li> <li>There are no printers in by-law enforcement cars</li> <li>Officers are not assigned radios</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>The City is currently preparing an RFP for a new ERP system for by-law enforcement</li> <li>The Branch uses a GPS system for tracking vehicles</li> <li>By-law officers have no printers nor radios</li> <li>The Branch's capex is \$4 million per year in technology expenditures (capital)</li> </ul>	<p>investigation a US software solution procured by Oshawa</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Parking uses the MES OFFICER database by Gtechna</li> <li>Officers have handhelds that allow for issuance and printing of tickets</li> <li>All cars equipped with GPS and laptops</li> <li>Officers do not have radios</li> </ul>	<p>information</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Officers have handhelds that allow for issuance and printing of tickets</li> <li>Officers are assigned radios</li> <li>Licensing Unit staff use Taxi Info Management System and MAP primarily.</li> <li>Moneris system for financial transactions</li> </ul>
11. How are animal shelters in the municipality run? Are they managed internally, or through partnerships with community organizations?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>One shelter run through an agreement with the Windsor Essex Country Humane Society</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Currently have 3 shelters that are run directly by the city</li> <li>A 4th shelter was recently closed</li> <li>There are a number of partnerships for specific programs with rescue groups and the SPCA</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Animal Services runs one shelter directly</li> <li>Only interaction with SBCA is if an animal found by an officer and there is a cruelty concern</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>One shelter, operated by the Ottawa Humane Society for the City under a Municipal Animal Shelter Services Agreement (MASSA)</li> <li>Rely on OSPCA for animal cruelty/neglect investigations since July 2016</li> <li>City has, since 1978,</li> </ul>



Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
				operated a Spay/Neuter Clinic, staffed with 1 vet and 3 vet techs
12. How does the shift schedule for by-law enforcement work?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>By-law enforcement officers currently work 0830-1630</li> <li>Collective agreement allows for 0830-1630, 1400-2200, 1800-0200, and 1900-0300 shifts</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Typical :0600-1900 on weekdays, 0800-1700 on weekends</li> <li>Extended hours currently: 0600- 2300 on Su-Th, and 0600-0300 (next day) on Fr-Sa</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Regular day shifts: 0700-1500, 0800-1600, 0830-1630, 0900- 1700</li> <li>Heat call shifts: 1300-2100</li> <li>Noise shifts: Th-Sa 2100-0500, one office currently volunteering 1500-2300 during week</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>By-law enforcement officers currently work 6:00 a.m to 2:00 a.m (Sun thru Thursday) and from 6:00 a.m to 4:00 a.m (Fri/Sat)</li> <li>Parking Enforcement currently from 7:00 a.m to 11:30 p.m and 8:00 a.m. to 11:30 Sunday</li> </ul>
13. What types of noise complaints is by-law enforcement responsible for?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Police are responsible for anything after hours if complaints are called into them</li> <li>If submitted to by-law, they follow up within two days for education</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All noise complaints, including late night related to bars and nightclubs.</li> <li>Police assist on the more problematic ones</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All types, including parties</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>All noise complaints. Police assist with calls that may have potential for violence or criminality.</li> </ul>
14. Does by-law enforcement have any work-from-home policies?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No work-from-home policy</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>No work-from-home policy, but shifts and desk sharing are geared towards having officers in the field as much as possible.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>One staff member telecommutes – the Councillor Coordinator</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Property Standards Officers are mobile, although they do work-from-home</li> </ul>

Question	City of Windsor	City of Toronto	City of Hamilton	City of Ottawa
15. How does By-law's IT infrastructure link into the broader municipality's?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Not aware of the other city's systems.</li> <li>• 311 call centre uses a Motorola solution</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The City and its Divisions have hundreds of systems</li> <li>• No unifying ERP</li> <li>• SAP used for budgeting.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• No unifying system</li> <li>• Provincial Offences use ICON and have no access to Amanda</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BLRS uses MAP which is also used by other Depts</li> <li>• 311 uses Lagan</li> </ul>
16. Are officers uniformed?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All by-law enforcement officers are uniformed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All officers uniformed</li> <li>• Vehicle for hire and marijuana dispensary officers are plain clothes.</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All officers, including students, are uniformed</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• All by-law enforcement officers are uniformed</li> <li>• Some types of investigations may involve plain clothes, i.e. for smoke-free/water pipe, PTCs, etc.</li> </ul>
17. When was the last corporate reorganization?	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• 2014</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• N/A</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• September 2016</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• October 5, 2016</li> </ul>