

## Summary of Written and Oral Submissions

**Note: This is a draft Summary of the Written and Oral Submissions received in respect of the Official Plan Amendment and Zoning By-law Amendment – 325, 327, and 333 Montreal Road, 334 Montfort Street and 273 Ste. Anne Avenue (ACS2017-PIE-PS-0126), prior to City Council’s consideration of the matter on 25 October 2017.**

**The final Summary will be presented to Council for approval at its meeting of 13 December 2017, in the report titled ‘*SUMMARY OF ORAL AND WRITTEN PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS FOR ITEMS SUBJECT TO BILL 73 ‘EXPLANATION REQUIREMENTS’ AT THE CITY COUNCIL MEETING OF 22 NOVEMBER 2017 (ACS2017-CCS-OCC-0020)*’. Please refer to the ‘Bulk Consent’ section of the Council Agenda of 13 December 2017 to access this item.**

### **Official Plan Amendment and Zoning By-law Amendment – 325, 327, and 333 Montreal Road, 334 Montfort Street and 273 Ste. Anne Avenue (ACS2017-PIE-PS-0126)**

In addition to those outlined in the Consultation Details section of the report, the following outlines the written and oral submissions received between the publication of the report and prior to City Council’s consideration:

- **Number of delegations at Planning Committee:** 147
- **Number of Submissions received by Planning Committee between 3 and 28 November 2017:** 210
- **Primary arguments in support**
  - The new facility is crucial for the well-being of the vulnerable. It will double the number of beds with medical services for those who are troubled by physical and mental illness, offering relief to hospitals.
  - The present facility on George Street cannot meet the needs of the citizens the Salvation Army wants to serve. The current Salvation Army facility is very old and cannot accommodate its clientele.
  - There is a high concentration of shelters in the Byward Market area.
  - The new facility would vastly improve their services to the most vulnerable in our downtown community. Salvation Army to serve its clientele of vulnerable citizens by providing integrated services for housing support, employment, life skills, addiction treatment, food bank, clothing hampers, medical and dental care for men, women, children and families in need.

- By selling its high-value property in the Byward Market, the Salvation Army will reduce its need for taxpayer support for the move of its facility.
- Closure of the George Street facility will significantly decrease the high density of vulnerable people in the prime tourist area of Ottawa.
- The City will benefit from increased property taxes on properties in the Byward Market.
- Salvation Army worked with leading security professionals who have provided detailed input and analysis into the design and development of the facility, ensuring the utmost considerations for security and safety. The Crime Prevention through Environmental Design principles have been applied in the design of the site.
- The proposed facility is not anticipated to cause a negative economic impact but rather a major indirect benefit, which would be generated by the proposed Community Hub and increase annually.
- In the foreseeable future, some degree of shelter space is required. The existing facility space on George Street does not provide the full range of services required in a safe environment; the proposed facility is designed to do so. The age, structure and inaccessibility of the current Salvation Army location impedes the circulation of clients and potential clients.
- Neighbouring social services will benefit from the proximity of the new facility and its continuum of care.
- There will be separate entrances for family-oriented services and for the men's shelters to reduce the risk of young families being exposed to the vulnerable population.
- The facility would be purpose built and would also have the flexibility to adapt to future needs as homelessness prevention and Housing First programs grow.
- A central facility offering a continuum of care is important to meet the increasingly complex needs of Salvation Army clients.
- The architecture is world-class as designed by Barry Hobin. There were similar concerns and objections by the community when the Wabano Centre was proposed. Now the Wabano Centre is a foundation of the community and the street and is also a desired destination for international architects, planners and downtown professionals.

- The facility proposed would be practical from the funding and service delivery model, whereas splitting it up would result in less service capacity and higher costs.
- There are vulnerable men who need shelter services, and the arguments against a men's shelter would not be tolerated for any other vulnerable group.
- Salvation Army is a leader in providing social services.
- The proposed design is setback to ensure the privacy and a healthy environment for those living there, and reduce the number of people on Montreal Road.
- The Provincial Policy Statement requires intensification of built-up areas to efficiently use land where existing infrastructure and public service facilities are available.
- The proposed shelter use complies with the Official Plan. Traditional Mainstreets are intended to be mixed use corridors. A wide range of uses is permitted within, including retail and service commercial uses.
- Montreal Road is an artery that connects the City's east-end communities to downtown Ottawa, and the shelter would be located along the City's vehicle, transit and pedestrian network.
- The site is largely internal to the block and could be considered part of general urban area rather than part of the Traditional Mainstreet.
- Only 15% of the building is dedicated to shelter use.
- The volume and number of shelters and social services in and around the Byward Market has not hindered residential or commercial development there.
- Salvation Army presented to staff and Councillor Fleury with 2 other options on St-Laurent and 333 Montreal Road. This shows efforts of Salvation Army over last couple of years.
- Salvation Army has a 90% success rate on average since 2008. They want to offer an inviting and supportive environment.
- Additional services should be co-located. They are essential in delivery of services, and wrap-around service. Being nimble and flexible and working with integrated partners is essential to adapting such as to the opioid crisis.

- The need for beds may increase due to unforeseen circumstances, such as how the City asked Shepherds of Good Hope to take in Syrian refugees.
- The proposed facility would be more secure and different from what is now seen at the George Street location. Further, there have already been improvements in security at the George Street location.
- There will be day-time programming and more room at the new facility which will address the problems currently at the George Street location.
- There are a number of vulnerable residents including Inuit and women in Vanier, and some have died, been murdered or overdosed. People in Vanier need help from the proposed shelter.
- Ottawa Mission has 238 beds and has good relationships with its neighbours.

- **Primary concerns and arguments in opposition**

- There is a need for the City to conduct a comprehensive social impact assessment and follow up with community consultations.
- The proposed development is a large development (megashelter).
- The proposed development will provide services to many hundreds of high-risk single men, which may have an impact on families and vulnerable residents in Vanier such as women, children and seniors.
- There are schools and parks in the area. Residents of the area are concerned about children being safe when walking to school and not being exposed to drugs or drug dealing.
- The shelter will exasperate the safety situation in Vanier, which is already unsafe. There is a marked increase in the percentage of sexual offenders in this area compared with other areas in Ottawa. The number of used needles in the area will increase.
- Residents of the proposed shelter and transitional housing who are consumers of alcohol and/or drugs will not be allowed to consume on the Salvation Army site. They may go to public and private places and leave dangerous waste behind.
- A centralized facility with vulnerable residents will attract predatory drug dealers and the organized crime in the area will flourish. Further, the facility will be across the streets from money marts, an LCBO and pot shops.

- Traffic generated by the proposal will have a negative impact on the safety of the children.
- While families have experienced progress, the community remains fragile and faces ongoing challenges related to drug dealing, violent crimes, sexual solicitations, poverty, mental health and neglectful landlords.
- There is an increasing need for social services for women (not just men) given that Vanier has an older low-income population.
- The proposal, if accepted, is likely to have a greater impact on women than on men because women are more likely to be poor than men, and women living in poverty are more likely to be victims of crime.
- The proposal is not consistent with the “Housing First” model of the 10-year homelessness strategy, requiring permanent housing. The “treatment first” approach proposed is not as effective as “Housing First” at preparing individuals for independent living.
- The John Howard Society has several small residences scattered across Ottawa rather than a single large one. Even The Mission and The Shepherds of Good Hope are moving the same way. The sole exception is the Salvation Army. They want to take a model that even they admit doesn’t work, make it larger and move it to Vanier.
- The Salvation Army’s policy elsewhere has been “to move people from homelessness into stable, permanent housing”, as illustrated by projects such as the Wiseman Centre and proposed Centre of Hope in St. John’s, Newfoundland.
- Two thirds of homeless people are struggling with addiction and/or mental health issues. These issues can only be effectively addressed when the homeless gain access to stable and supportive housing.
- We need to study to this whole question of homelessness before the Salvation Army moves, in light of the recent experience of a local Vanier landlord with the housing first model.
- The proposal is contrary to the Zoning By-law, because shelters are not permitted on traditional main streets and the proposal exceeds both the maximum number of shelters and the shelter minimum distance rules.
- The City does not have the authority to amend the Official Plan as proposed. The proposed facility would not be compatible with the surrounding commercial/residential land use.

- Since the Official and Secondary Plans were established after much consultation with the community, businesses and home owners and buyers made investment decisions based on this important planning foundation. The shelter will discourage investors from investing in Vanier.
- The land in question could instead be allocated to the development of future social housing developments.
- It would be better to have multiple locations than a centralized one. This would be helpful to the many people who depend on the Salvation Army.
- It will definitely affect the shops and restaurants given the number of men who will be attending the proposed development and who may be loitering.
- Alternate sites, such as at the intersection of St-Laurent Boulevard, Donald Street, and the former Rideau High School are more appropriate for a large center.
- The planning decision creates a tax burden on the City in both the short and longer term. Currently the City pays \$44.00 per night per bed at the existing shelter on George Street. This would translate into \$ 5,667,200.00 per year for 350 beds at the proposed shelter.
- The cost of this proposed facility works out to approximately \$ 142,857.00 per bed, 18 times more expensive than smaller housing units for those who are homeless.
- The use of emergency shelters can lead to higher health care and law enforcement costs.
- There is a lack of results from the current 10-year Homelessness plan.
- There was a lack of public consultation before the Salvation Army's Vanier shelter plans were finalized. Community consultation can lead to smarter and more efficient strategies.
- Vanier residents have been working to reduce ghettoization in the area, and this facility would be counter-productive to that goal.
- All beds should be considered shelter beds. Given that the emergency shelter is 140 of 350 beds, it actually comprises 40% of the program, a much heavier impact than stated by the applicant.
- The site is too small for the number of beds and accommodate the services and the logistics involved in providing the services to this site and the neighbourhood.

- The Salvation Army will be offering a continuum of care, from addiction treatment, medical care, and skills training to helping people move into their own homes. The majority of the beds in the new center will be in support of addiction treatment, skills training and medical care and only 25% will be used as shelter beds.
- Without these services, marginalized people will needlessly suffer and will die before their time. The new facility will be a last resort for citizens who have the same civic and constitutional rights to security of the person and dignity.
- An important part of Vanier residents are in support of this proposal but given the emotional intensity of this issue, they do not dare show their support for fear of social isolation or reprisal.
- The shelter should be moved to a commercial area.
- The City should take responsibility for the cost of additional police and paramedic services, and for the Salvation Army clients unable to obtain shelter due to overcrowding.
- The issues seen at the George Street location will simply be transferred to the Montreal Road proposed location.
- The new facility will have an impact on the many seniors in the area who walk for exercise and walk to get to the services available in their community.
- The Notre-Dame de Lourdes Grotto is located a mere 500 meters from the proposed site and more people will loiter there.
- The Salvation Army's megaproject is viewed by Vanier residents as another means of destroying the Francophone community that lives there.
- The facility would not offer harm reduction services, so those who consume must leave the facility and consume in the streets.
- Shelters are incompatible with the larger goals for Traditional Mainstreets. The Official Plan states that intensification should continue to focus on nodes and corridors to create an essential community focus and minimize disruption in existing stable neighborhoods. The zoning by-law states that TM zones must recognize the function of Business Improvement Areas as primary business or shopping areas.
- The Salvation Army has not demonstrated that the specific site at 333 Montreal Road is exceptional or exceptionally good site for a mega shelter.

- The City of Ottawa Official Plan in Policy 4 of Section 3.1, stipulates that a “shelter accommodation” is not permitted within the Mainstreets designation (including along Traditional Mainstreets such as Montreal Road)
- Medical, emergency, social services as well as businesses in the area reported that they cannot accommodate the added strain of the additional people who would be using the shelter.
- The site’s accessibility by transit/foot is lacking, as the transit services that do pass by there are already at capacity and have the most cancellations of OC Transpo local routes (route 12). There will be no light rail stations in Vanier.
- There is limited space in the side streets for delivery trucks to turn off of Montreal Road or back into or out of the facility.
- The City is simply moving a shelter to get it out of a tourist area (the Byward Market).
- Such large projects along one of our traditional main streets have significant impact on the surrounding community. The precedent set would break the social contract between communities and the City in how we plan our neighbourhoods.
- There will be noise from increased emergency and vehicle traffic. Parking on site will not be adequate.
- Housing first model is less costly and requires less public funding than the treatment first model.
- There will be an exodus of residents from Vanier if this application is allowed, and will have a negative social and economic impact on the area, denuding the City of one of its only true Francophone enclaves.
- There will be an increased rate of break-ins in the area.
- The staff report includes errors and needs to be revised.
- The staff report should be referred back to staff because the proposal restricts full participation in society which amounts to people zoning.
- Council should determine whether or not a general policy requires a review before accepting a site-specific application is approved. Absent a solid site-specific rationale, lack of authority could come in this case from the fact that Council created an exception for a shelter without offering other shelters - in policy - the possibility to establish their facility on a main street.



- Wabano Center clients will be reluctant to seek service if there is an increased risk that they will be accosted by aggressive panhandlers that may be using the Salvation Army shelter.
- The proposal undermines the Traditional Mainstreet character of Montreal Road: it may impede the promotion of a pedestrian-oriented development and the safety of pedestrians and cyclists.
- The Salvation Army may seek to expand the shelter by going to the Committee of Adjustment rather than City Council.
- As stated in the Secondary Plan for Montreal Road, this Traditional Mainstreet should be protected as a focal point for Francophone heritage and culture.
- An Archaeological Assessment should be completed for the site as it is a known Indigenous Camping Site.
- The site will require additional patrols and the taxpayers of K1L should not pay for the extra patrols.
- The availability of these beds does not actually incentivize the Salvation Army to direct residents towards housing programs that can help them escape the cycle of poverty and/or addiction, because they have the capacity to receive new residents and send the bill to the City of Ottawa.
- Concentrating social services inhibits growth of that area.
- Residents who live at the Concord may be displaced or become homeless themselves.
- There should not be any new uses such as shelters, money marts, strip clubs, bingo halls, or pawnshops on a traditional Mainstreet.
- More information is required on whether Salvation Army operations are run properly and with good living conditions for those who stay there.
- Increasing the number of shelter beds in Ottawa will attract more people from across Canada who use them.
- All the safety features are offering protection for staff or clients only.
- The Salvation Army's application is not a minor variance and therefore should not be permitted.
- A Traditional Mainstreet is intended to accommodate a broad range of uses including retail, commercial, office, residential and institutional. With the

Salvation Army's abstinence policy and its minimal harm reduction strategies, the shelter's clients who use drugs and alcohol may find themselves spilling onto Vanier's Traditional Mainstreet.

- The Transportation Impact Assessment document submitted by the Salvation Army doesn't include any estimates on increased bus usage from shelter residents going downtown via Route 12 to access services (cited as a reason for the current site).
- If allowed, this proposal will set a precedent that will allow shelters on other Traditional Mainstreets.
- Should the City accept this application, citizens would be justified in their reluctance to participate in future community planning and other consultations processes.
- This application was a deal brokered by private interests.
- The proposed summer courtyard will not be a suitable gathering spot during the winter so there will be increased loitering on Montreal Road.
- No one asked the people of Vanier to contribute to this decision to build a megashelter on this site; instead they received a million dollar public relations effort and an application to use our land in a fashion that ignores the needs of residents.
- Because Salvation Army does not offer harm reduction, more than any other decision, the new shelter will replicate the problems of the George Street location despite the pleasant architecture.
- The current location is more central, and residents in the area complain about things other than the Salvation Army. It is central, while not being very visible or disruptive.
- The current trio of Shepherds of Good Hope on Murray Street, Salvation Army on Georges Street, and the Ottawa Mission on Waller Street is a great set-up as they offer services that complement each other.
- Removing the homeless to make room for entertainment means more bars, restaurants and possibly casinos along King Edward. None of these are really "culture" or physically healthy.
- The Salvation Army's budget would allow to instead build 5 shelters with 48 beds each.

- The ideal location for the Salvation Army is the old M.T.O. property on Tremblay Road near St. Laurent Blvd.
- The proposed shelter does not meet the Salvation Army's own stated needs. It stated that K1N, K1L and K1K accounts for 52% of its user base, whereas only K1L is in Vanier.
- The economic benefit study paid for by Salvation Army is based on the entire Rideau-Vanier ward and incorrectly concludes that Vanier is a thriving business area.
- Ottawa East is growing and will need more stores and retail. Montreal Road has space for this development. A shelter of this size will redefine the purpose of the street.
- Canada is signatory to domestic and international conventions aimed at safeguarding the rights and interests of women, children and vulnerable peoples. Responsible city planning must account for these demographics by making them part of the discussion over the entirety of the project.
- OC Transpo bus shelters on either side of the street should have improved safety measures for those who take the bus.
- The proposed facility should be accessible and offer palliative services.
- Funds should instead be put into affordable housing because the waitlist is too long to transition people out of shelters.
- A facility of this size should be located in an industrial or rural area rather than a residential area.
- As a Traditional Mainstreet, Montreal Road could be like Similar to Toronto's Kensington Market, a place with a mix of businesses, to test a model for a business.
- There are 12 shelters rather than 5 in the Rideau-Vanier (Ward 12). Staff reduced this number by incorrectly characterizing shelters as residential care facilities.
- Similar to adult entertainment and arcades. There is a concern about the users and the services offered. It is fair ball to talk about impact on neighbourhood. "Compatibility" it is a planning issue.
- The 2008 study approved by Council spoke to a reduction in number of shelters in Ward 12. Without a further study as to a shelter should be added in ward 12, then the City should follow the 2008 study.

- Salvation Army will not be delivering bilingual services in the francophone area of Vanier.
- This is not NIMBYism, as there are other success stories such as John Howard Society, which was welcomed to the Vanier community.
- The proposal does not include commercial space to rent to the community. Had this been a condominium development, there would be commercial units at the ground level. The proposed shelter cannot provide animation that a Traditional Mainstreet should offer.
- Salvation Army does not know how to manage its business and for this reason it will not be a good neighbor.

**Effect of Submissions on Planning Committee Decision:**

Debate        The Committee spent three days (25 hours and 30 minutes) on this item.

Vote:         The staff recommendations CARRIED as presented. Seven Motions were referred to Council for consideration.

**Effect of Submissions to both committees on Council Decision:**

Council considered all written and oral submissions in making its decision, and CARRIED this item with additional amendments, as follows:

1.     **That Council approve:**
  - a.     **an Amendment to the Official Plan Section 3.1.4 and to the Montreal District Secondary Plan for 325, 327 and 333 Montreal Road, 334 Montfort Street and 273 Ste. Anne Avenue to permit a shelter, residential care facility and surface parking, as detailed in Document 2; and**
  - b.     **an amendment to Zoning By-law 2008-250 for 325, 327, and 333 Montreal Road, 334 Montfort Street and 273 Ste. Anne Avenue to permit a shelter and residential care facility, as detailed in Document 3.**
2.     **That Council recognizes the value that the Salvation Army brings, the importance of the services offered, and we applaud their work in Ottawa.**
3.     **That Council approve that Document 3 – Details of Recommended Zoning of Report ACS2017-PIE-PS-0126 be amended by replacing the number “900” with “801”; and that there be no further notice pursuant to Section 34 (17) of the *Planning Act*.**

4. That Council direct staff to initiate a by-law under section 45 (1.0.3), to establish specific criteria in respect of any proposed expansion or addition relating to the shelter use at 325, 327, and 333 Montreal Road, 334 Montfort Street and 273 Ste. Anne Avenue, so that any such proposal is to be heard by Planning Committee and Council of the City of Ottawa; and

That the zoning by-law amendment adding “shelter” as a permitted use to this location, if approved, shall not be enacted until such time as the by-law referenced herein comes into force under section 45 (1.0.4); and

That notwithstanding any resolutions made by Council in respect of section 45 (1.4), section 45 (1.3) shall apply to this site specific amendment, being a restriction on the ability to apply for a minor variance from the provisions of the by-law in respect of the land, building or structure before the second anniversary of the day on which the by-law was amended, should the amendment be approved by Council.

5. That Council approve that a holding provision with two conditions be included in Document 3 – Details of Recommended Zoning, as follows:
  - a. That the holding provision not be lifted until the Site Plan Control Application for the proposal is approved containing conditions related to the implementation of design measures proposed in the Report provided by Security Through Safe Design Inc. of May 1, 2017, to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development; and
  - b. That the holding provision not be lifted until such time as the Applicant has implemented an Ambassador Program to the satisfaction of the General Manager of Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development in consultation with the General Manager of Community and Social Services.

And that there be no further notice pursuant to Section 34 (17) of the *Planning Act*.

6. That Council direct staff to bring forward a Zoning By-law amendment to remove shelter as a permitted use on the lands known municipally as 171 George Street after the Salvation Army has ceased its shelter operations on these lands.
7. That the Zoning By-law amendments contained within Report ACS 2017-PIE-PS-0126 be repealed should the Salvation Army cease operating the

**proposed facility; and that there be no further notice pursuant to Section 34 (17) of the *Planning Act*.**

- 8. That the Term of Council Priorities Section of the report be revised to remove the identified Term of Council Priorities in this report.**
- 9. That Council direct staff to work with the Ward Councillor, the Chair of Planning Committee, the Chair of Community and Protective Services Committee, the Mayor and the Salvation Army to establish a Site Plan Review and Programming Advisory Committee consisting of the above-named Members of Council, relevant City staff, and community stakeholders to provide input into the next phase of the Salvation Army Relocation development; and**

**That, where deemed appropriate by the General Manager of Planning Infrastructure and Economic Development in consultation with Legal Services, specific recommendations from the Site Plan Review and Programming Advisory Committee be incorporated into the conditions of Site Plan.**

- 10. That Council direct staff working on program and infrastructure projects, including the upcoming Montreal Road Redevelopment project and the upcoming Community Improvement Plan, to work with the Building Better Revitalized Neighbourhoods Initiative (BBRN) Sponsors Group on how to incorporate BBRN community collaboration tools for those projects; and**  
**That the Building Better Revitalized Neighbourhoods Initiative (BBRN) Sponsors Group identify the 2018 neighbourhood in the BBRN Initiative to be Vanier North.**