

**Transportation Committee
Report 12A
November 25, 2020**

95

**Comité des transports
Rapport 12A
Le 25 novembre 2020**

**Extract of Draft Transportation
Committee Minutes 12
November 2, 2020**

**Extrait de l'ébauche du
procès-verbal 12
du comité des transports
Le 2 novembre 2020**

Transportation Services

Barrhaven Light Rail Transit (Baseline Station to Barrhaven Town Centre) and Rail Grade-Separations, Planning and Environmental Assessment Study – Recommendations

ACS2020-TSD-PLN-0006

Barrhaven (3); Knoxdale-Merivale (9);
Gloucester-South Nepean (22)

Report Recommendations

That the Transportation Committee recommend that Council:

- 1. Approve the functional design for the Barrhaven Light Rail Transit (Baseline Station to Barrhaven Town Centre) and Rail Grade-Separations Planning and Environmental Assessment (EA) study and interim transit priority measures as described in this report and supporting documents;**
- 2. Direct staff to complete the Transit Project Assessment Process (TPAP) in accordance with the Regulation 231/08 of the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act, including the preparation and filing of the Environmental Project Report for final public review and comment; and,**
- 3. Direct staff to remove the 1005--1045 Greenbank Road site earmarked for affordable housing by Council on April 10, 2019 (Report ACS2019-PIE-GEN-001) from the list of affordable housing development sites; and,**

- 4. Direct the Interdepartmental Task Force on Affordable Housing to undertake a comprehensive review of the planned Stage 3 LRT corridors to identify short-term alternative locations for future affordable housing development to replace the 1005-1045 Greenbank Road site that is now recommended for the Barrhaven LRT's Train Storage and Servicing Facility.**

The Committee received a slide presentation overview of the report from Vivi Chi, Director, Transportation Services, Transportation Services Department (TSD), Ron Clarke, Peter Steacy and Paul Croft, Parsons Corporation. A copy of which is held on file with the Office of the City Clerk. John Manconi, General Manager, TSD and Steve Willis, General Manager, Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development were also present and responded to questions.

Prior to receiving the delegations, the following motions were introduced for consideration:

Motion

Moved by Councillor M. Luloff (*on behalf of Councillor K. Egli*)

WHEREAS the Barrhaven LRT's recommended alignment requires the removal of 120 private rental units on the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club; and

WHEREAS these private rental units are not designated affordable or social housing administered by the City or by non-profit housing providers, but they are considered affordable by the tenants and the need to relocate elsewhere could cause hardship for some who have lived in the community for many years; and

WHEREAS on January 29, 2020, Council declared a housing and homelessness state of emergency through MOTION NO 26/14, and that this is an important

issue for all levels of government to address; and

WHEREAS there is a long lead time before the Barrhaven LRT is in the implementation phase, thus allowing time for residents and the City to consider relocation options;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that should the Barrhaven LRT's recommended alignment be approved, that Transportation Committee recommend Council direct staff to establish a Working Group to examine options on how to assist the residents who are facing a future relocation because of the LRT project; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this working group consist of: General Manager, Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development, General Manager, Community and Social Services, General Manager, Transportation Services, and/or their respective delegates; Ottawa Community Housing; community representatives from Manor Village and Cheryl Gardens; the ward Councillor; and the Councillor Liaison for Housing and Homelessness; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that staff report back to the Finance and Economic Development Committee by end of 2021 on the Working Group's recommendations including justifications, and policy and financial implications.

Motion

Moved by Councillor S. Menard

WHEREAS significant questions remain about the Grade-Separation of Woodroffe Avenue and Southwest Transitway

WHEREAS alternative options 3, 4 and 6 in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives' may cost the city approximately the same amount of money; and

WHEREAS option 6 has less predictable costing given the nature of land deals and the potential expropriation process that are associated with this option; and

WHEREAS alternative option 6, the currently recommended option, will displace the more than 300 low-income residents; and

WHEREAS many of the drawbacks of option 3, 4 vis-a-vis option 6 in the staff report, such as concerns over wheel noise and discomfort from a curving track and the temporary disruption of vehicular traffic on Woodroffe, must be balanced with the significant impact option 6 will have on the lives of over 300 low-income tenants; and

WHEREAS any potential redevelopment of the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club could allow for more housing, including deeply affordable options, and, thus, greater density within a TOD location; and

WHEREAS many of the residents of Manor Village have indicated they were not aware of consultations, and unable to locate or recall receiving buck slips advertising public consultations from the city; and

WHEREAS the new owners of Manor Village have also expressed concerns with the plan while also expressing a desire to redevelop the site, with no current concrete plans in place; and

WHEREAS the residents of Manor Village deserve more assurances prior to accepting an agreement to displace their homes, considering the state and trends of Ottawa's housing market;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the direction in the report to adopt the Recommended Alternative (Alternative 6) in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives' be tabled until more complete information can be presented

to Transportation Committee; and

Be it further resolved that staff be directed to report back to committee with further information and analysis of the 6 alternative options in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives', and that this report include:

- a. A detailed comparison of options 3, 4 and 6, and that this comparison address the moral hazard of uprooting a community of low-income tenants on the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club;
- b. The results of a public consultation with the tenants in this area;
- c. Potential ways to accommodate or compensate the tenants should they be displaced
- d. Better understanding of the implications of increased density and re-development of that area in line with the direction of the City of Ottawa's New Official Plan.

The Committee then heard from the following delegations:

- Alison Trowbridge, Representing the ACORN Manor Village Tenant Union, expressed concern with being displaced from her home and explained that Manor Village is a tight community. Demolishing their homes is concerning considering there is a homelessness and housing crisis in the City also noting that there was insufficient consultation done.
- Peggy Rafter (Manor Village Resident), indicated she has been a resident of Manor Village for 30 years, spoke about rent for her three-bedroom townhome being affordable and if the village were to be demolished there would be an inability to find similar accommodations. She encouraged the city to consider LRT options that wouldn't result in demolishing Manor Village.

- Lisa Bilow (Manor Village Resident), indicated support for the LRT moving forward, however, not at the expense of their neighbourhood especially given there is a housing crisis in the City of Ottawa.
- Clark Hill (Manor Village Resident), noted Manor Village is a safe, family oriented and affordable community. Choosing the option to demolish the neighbourhood would be adding to homelessness, not helping to end it.
- Trevor Haché*, Healthy Transportation, urged the city to prioritize affordable housing. Noting the scale of the affordable housing crisis is so massive that money identified in the last two budgets is nothing compared to scale of the problem. By proceeding to approve this plan it will make the situation worse. The City needs to be more thoughtful.
- Jason MacDonald, Barrhaven BIA, spoke to the focus of the BIA and stressed the need for an effective and efficient rapid transit system for Barrhaven to become a complete and vibrant community. Mr. MacDonald further expressed concern with referring to the properties along Woodroffe as affordable housing as it is privately owned. The owner of that property would be within their rights to redevelop with higher priced units. Councillor Egli's motion provides a clear solution and most advantageous route.
- Kaite Burkholder Harris, Executive Director, Alliance to End Homelessness Ottawa speaks to the loss of affordable housing units in Ottawa, homelessness emergency and the lack of a plan in place to accommodate the residents of Manor Village if they are displaced.
- Khulud Baig, City for All Women Initiative supports the residents of Manor Village, noting there is a public health and housing and homelessness crisis. The city needs to consider alternative options for new transit stations. LRT is important but shouldn't come on the backs of the low-income residents who

rely on homes for their well being.

- Claude Brulé, Algonquin College President spoke to the benefits of extending the LRT. Students are thinking of connections and interconnections, new initiatives, better networks and providing a talent pipeline for the future. The college wants to be part of a solution for affordable housing and be an active partner to drive innovation.
- Bruce Harvey, Film Commissioner, Ottawa Film Office indicated accessibility to the LRT was a critical component to the decision to build a soundstage campus, noting that stops at the Nepean Sportsplex and Algonquin College are important as well. He also noted that a design that doesn't bend in front of the stage would be more favourable as to limit noise. Having LRT and subway stations like at Baseline would be very attractive for promoting Ottawa as a filming destination.
- Miranda Gray stated she doesn't believe there is an adequate plan and doesn't support either proposed motion or staff recommendations. She expressed concerns with removing affordable housing units, timeframes and how consultation is done.
- Karen Paquette, ACORN member, believes more discussion needs to be done given concerns with displacing people who are under stress, already have mental health issues and are at risk for homelessness.
- Alex Cullen, President of FCA, touched on traffic safety concerns at the Woodroffe and Fallowfield area, noting phase 3 will take time, he encourages staff address a solution sooner than later.

Correspondence had been received from the following, as noted:

- Email dated October 26 and 27 from Trevor Haché
- Email dated October 30, 2020 from Binkerbelle's Yarning

Transportation Committee
Report 12A
November 25, 2020

102

Comité des transports
Rapport 12A
Le 25 novembre 2020

Extract of Draft Transportation
Committee Minutes 12
November 2, 2020

Extrait de l'ébauche du
procès-verbal 12
du comité des transports
Le 2 novembre 2020

-
- Email dated October 30, 2020 from Soloway Wright
 - Email dated November 2, 2020 from David Wiseman

[* *Individuals / groups marked with an asterisk above either provided comments in writing or by e-mail; all submissions are held on file with the City Clerk.]*

Having concluded the delegations and questions to staff, the Committee considered the following motions:

Motion

Moved by Councillor M. Luloff (*on behalf of Councillor K. Egli*)

WHEREAS the Barrhaven LRT's recommended alignment requires the removal of 120 private rental units on the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club; and

WHEREAS these private rental units are not designated affordable or social housing administered by the City or by non-profit housing providers, but they are considered affordable by the tenants and the need to relocate elsewhere could cause hardship for some who have lived in the community for many years; and

WHEREAS on January 29, 2020, Council declared a housing and homelessness state of emergency through MOTION NO 26/14, and that this is an important issue for all levels of government to address; and

WHEREAS there is a long lead time before the Barrhaven LRT is in the implementation phase, thus allowing time for residents and the City to consider relocation options;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that should the Barrhaven LRT's recommended alignment be approved, that Transportation Committee

Transportation Committee
Report 12A
November 25, 2020

103

Comité des transports
Rapport 12A
Le 25 novembre 2020

Extract of Draft Transportation
Committee Minutes 12
November 2, 2020

Extrait de l'ébauche du
procès-verbal 12
du comité des transports
Le 2 novembre 2020

recommend Council direct staff to establish a Working Group to examine options on how to assist the residents who are facing a future relocation because of the LRT project; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that this working group consist of: General Manager, Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development, General Manager, Community and Social Services, General Manager, Transportation Services, and/or their respective delegates; Ottawa Community Housing; community representatives from Manor Village and Cheryl Gardens; the ward Councillor; and the Councillor Liaison for Housing and Homelessness; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that staff report back to the Finance and Economic Development Committee by end of 2021 on the Working Group's recommendations including justifications, and policy and financial implications.

CARRIED, on a division of 10 yeas and 0 nays, as follows:

YEAS (10): Councillors G. Darouze, L. Dudas, E. El-Chantiry, M. Fleury, A. Hubley, J. Leiper, M. Luloff, C. Kitts, S. Menard, T. Tierney

NAYS (0):

Motion

Moved by Councillor S. Menard

WHEREAS significant questions remain about the Grade-Separation of Woodroffe Avenue and Southwest Transitway

WHEREAS alternative options 3, 4 and 6 in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives' may cost the city approximately the

same amount of money; and

WHEREAS option 6 has less predictable costing given the nature of land deals and the potential expropriation process that are associated with this option; and

WHEREAS alternative option 6, the currently recommended option, will displace the more than 300 low-income residents; and

WHEREAS many of the drawbacks of option 3, 4 vis-a-vis option 6 in the staff report, such as concerns over wheel noise and discomfort from a curving track and the temporary disruption of vehicular traffic on Woodroffe, must be balanced with the significant impact option 6 will have on the lives of over 300 low-income tenants; and

WHEREAS any potential redevelopment of the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club could allow for more housing, including deeply affordable options, and, thus, greater density within a TOD location; and

WHEREAS many of the residents of Manor Village have indicated they were not aware of consultations, and unable to locate or recall receiving buck slips advertising public consultations from the city; and

WHEREAS the new owners of Manor Village have also expressed concerns with the plan while also expressing a desire to redevelop the site, with no current concrete plans in place; and

WHEREAS the residents of Manor Village deserve more assurances prior to accepting an agreement to displace their homes, considering the state and trends of Ottawa's housing market;

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that the direction in the report to adopt the

Recommended Alternative (Alternative 6) in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives' be tabled until more complete information can be presented to Transportation Committee; and

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED that staff be directed to report back to committee with further information and analysis of the 6 alternative options in Section 1 of 'Corridor Alignment and Design Alternatives', and that this report include:

- a. **A detailed comparison of options 3, 4 and 6, and that this comparison address the moral hazard of uprooting a community of low-income tenants on the west side of Woodroffe Avenue between Knoxdale Road and West Hunt Club;**
- b. **The results of a public consultation with the tenants in this area;**
- c. **Potential ways to accommodate or compensate the tenants should they be displaced**
- d. **Better understanding of the implications of increased density and re-development of that area in line with the direction of the City of Ottawa's New Official Plan.**

LOST, on a division of 3 yeas and 7 nays, as follows:

YEAS (3): Councillors M. Fleury, J. Leiper, S. Menard

NAYS (7): Councillors G. Darouze, L. Dudas, E. El-Chantiry, A. Hubley, M. Luloff, C. Kitts, T. Tierney

The committee CARRIED the staff recommendation as amended, as set out below with Councillor Menard dissenting on recommendation 1:

Report Recommendations

That the Transportation Committee recommend that Council:

1. **Approve the functional design for the Barrhaven Light Rail Transit (Baseline Station to Barrhaven Town Centre) and Rail Grade-Separations Planning and Environmental Assessment (EA) study and interim transit priority measures as described in this report and supporting documents;**
2. **Direct staff to complete the Transit Project Assessment Process (TPAP) in accordance with the Regulation 231/08 of the Ontario Environmental Assessment Act, including the preparation and filing of the Environmental Project Report for final public review and comment; and,**
3. **Direct staff to remove the 1005--1045 Greenbank Road site earmarked for affordable housing by Council on April 10, 2019 (Report ACS2019-PIE-GEN-001) from the list of affordable housing development sites; and,**
4. **Direct the Interdepartmental Task Force on Affordable Housing to undertake a comprehensive review of the planned Stage 3 LRT corridors to identify short-term alternative locations for future affordable housing development to replace the 1005-1045 Greenbank Road site that is now recommended for the Barrhaven LRT's Train Storage and Servicing Facility.**
5. **Direct staff to establish a Working Group to examine options on how to assist the residents who are facing a future relocation because of the LRT project and that this working group consist of: General Manager, Planning, Infrastructure and Economic Development,**

Transportation Committee
Report 12A
November 25, 2020

107

Comité des transports
Rapport 12A
Le 25 novembre 2020

Extract of Draft Transportation
Committee Minutes 12
November 2, 2020

Extrait de l'ébauche du
procès-verbal 12
du comité des transports
Le 2 novembre 2020

General Manager, Community and Social Services, General Manager, Transportation Services, and/or their respective delegates; Ottawa Community Housing; community representatives from Manor Village and Cheryl Gardens; the ward Councillor; and the Councillor Liaison for Housing and Homelessness; and

6. that staff report back to the Finance and Economic Development Committee by end of 2021 on the Working Group's recommendations including justifications, and policy and financial implications.