



Office of the Auditor General

**Follow-up to the 2011 Audit of the Corporate
Communications Function**

Tabled at Audit Committee – October 8, 2015

Table of Contents

Executive Summary.....	1
Introduction	1
Summary of the Level of Completion	2
Conclusion	3
Acknowledgement.....	4
Detailed Follow-up report	5
Introduction	5
Key findings of the original 2011 Audit.....	5
Status of Implementation of 2011 Audit Recommendations	8
Summary of the Level of Completion	33
Conclusion	35
Acknowledgement.....	35

Executive Summary

Introduction

The Follow-up to the 2011 Audit of the Corporate Communications Function was included in the Auditor General's 2013 Audit Plan.

The key findings of the original 2011 audit included:

- The City's Communications group lacks consistent strategic direction and a clear mandate and authority.
- Without a clear strategy or mandate, many departments have lost confidence in Corporate Communications and have added their own internal resources to compensate.
- There are 51 positions in the Corporate Communications Department with a \$4.4 million budget for communications. In addition, there are another 20 positions within various departments with some communications duties, costing an estimated \$1.05 million.
- The Corporate Communications Function lacks a prioritization framework to support and communicate resource allocation as well as a consistent and disciplined approach to planning, organizing and monitoring work. This has led to the group providing uneven client services.
- The review of the communications strategy for the Source Separated Organics program confirmed the lack of clear mandate, role and authority for the Corporate Communications Function. Of the Source Separated Organics strategy the audit states:
 - Target audience(s) were not properly identified;
 - The most effective methods for reaching these target audience(s) were not adequately assessed and pursued;
 - Strategic messaging to these target audience(s) was not developed; and,
 - Communications initiatives were never evaluated to determine their effectiveness.

Summary of the Level of Completion

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of April 2014.

Table 1: OAG's assessment of level of completion

Category	% Complete	Recommendations	Number of Recommendations	Percentage of Total Recommendations
Little or no action	0 to 24	10	1	5%
Action Initiated	25 to 49	n/a	n/a	n/a
Partially Complete	50 to 74	8	1	5%
Substantially Complete	75 to 99	5, 7, 13, 22	4	18%
Complete	100	1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21	16	72%
Total			22	100%

The table below outlines management's assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of July 2014 in response to the OAG's assessment. These assessments have not been audited.

Table 2: Management's assessment of level of completion

Category	% Complete	Recommendations	Number of Recommendations	Percentage of Total Recommendations
Little or no action	0 to 24	n/a	n/a	n/a
Action Initiated	25 to 49	n/a	n/a	n/a
Partially Complete	50 to 74	n/a	n/a	n/a
Substantially Complete	75 to 99	n/a	n/a	n/a
Complete	100	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22	22	100%
Total			22	100%

Conclusion

Management has substantially or fully completed 20 of the 22 recommendations contained in the original report.

At the time of our follow-up audit, Corporate Communications had not started work on the new City's Visual Identity (recommendation 10). Management considers that the Visual Identity, as it was developed at amalgamation, is overly specific and that level of detail may no longer be warranted. The advent of social media (Twitter, Facebook, etc.) has also resulted in major changes, in terms of communication size as well as reach, frequency and immediacy. Corporate Communications are still at the conceptualizing stage as to what the City's Visual Identity requirements are.

In relation to recommendation 8, management informed us that the Annual Consultation Plan, that should have been developed in July 2013 and be provided to Executive Committee by end of Q1 2014, was combined within the Annual Corporate Communication calendar of events/initiatives. However, the Annual

Corporate Communication calendar does not address the intent of the recommendation i.e., reflect the various stakeholder feedback monitoring mechanisms. For this recommendation to be considered fully implemented, an Annual Consultation Plan should be developed.

Guidelines, policies and procedures should be revised as needed. We found that the date of when guidelines, policies and procedures becomes effective or its revision date was not always captured on individual documents. By clearly indicating the date when guidelines, policies and procedures took effect or were revised, readers will be able to understand that it is the most recent document, and/or that it has been updated.

Acknowledgement

We wish to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance afforded the audit team by management.

The following section is the detailed follow-up report.

Detailed Follow-up report

Introduction

The Follow-up to the 2011 Audit of the Corporate Communications Function was included in the Auditor General's Audit Plan.

Key findings of the original 2011 Audit

1. The audit identifies the need that Corporate Communications clearly articulate both its mandate in delivering services to the City, and the authority of the Chief and Corporate Communications vis-à-vis its clients (e.g., departments, Council, etc.).
2. The result of this lack of clarity and definition of authority has meant that stakeholders are less aware and may have less confidence in the capacity of CC to advise on, develop and manage effective public and internal communication strategies and initiatives to meet their program needs and objectives. Largely because of this lack of confidence and satisfaction with CC services, many departments/programs and Councillors have put in place their own communications resources to undertake communications activities outside the purview of Corporate Communications. During the audit, Management identified 11 such FTEs that are 100% dedicated to communications activities and another 9 which have 5-90% of their duties related to communications (Appendix A, of the full report, lists each of these FTEs and their location).
3. While it is common practice within most large municipalities to have some level of internal communications resources, in our opinion, the Corporate Communications function should have the necessary authority to coordinate efforts in order to ensure consistency and avoid duplication and working at cross-purposes. Without this, the development and provision of coherent, effective and economical communications to support City strategic and operational goals is compromised.
4. CC management is in the process of developing a Strategic Communications Framework and Communications Policy for the City of Ottawa that defines the City's overall policy on internal and external communications and identifies accountability and responsibility for its various elements. This is similar to communications policies identified in existence at other levels of government (e.g., Canada and Alberta).
5. Frequent reorganizations and changes in the position of Chief, Corporate Communications (four times in 2011 alone) have meant a lack of consistent direction both strategically for the City and functionally within CC itself. At amalgamation in 2001, communications resources for the City were centralized

in a single Corporate Communications unit on the basis that consolidation of communications resources would be a more productive model.

6. The audit found that there is an uneven approach to how communications services are provided to individual clients. Furthermore, we found that there are a number of areas where the client service role of Corporate Communications has either not been clearly articulated or understood by clients. These areas include:
 - Corporate Communications support of City Councillors;
 - The role of Client Relations project managers; and,
 - The role of Corporate Communications strategists.
7. This lack of clarity in roles is further evidenced by client department observations expressing confusion as to whether Corporate Communications is a strategic advisor or an administrative support function. In an effort to clarify the roles and responsibilities of the Corporate Communications Department in serving its varied client base, the Department has recently commenced development of a Strategic Framework and supporting business model, in order to articulate and differentiate each of the roles and responsibilities of the key functions of Corporate Communications. This document also includes a revised mandate to emphasize and articulate the strategic advisory role of Corporate Communications in serving its clients.
8. In serving its broad and diverse client base, including the Mayor, Councillors, Committees, City departments and programs, the Corporate Communications Department is engaged in responding to high volumes of service requests, both planned and unplanned, across its functional business lines. We noted that Corporate Communications does not yet employ consistent operational planning and monitoring processes in serving its clients.
9. We also noted that Corporate Communications lacks a prioritization framework to support and communicate resource allocation decisions.
10. In the absence of a consistent and disciplined approach to planning, organizing and monitoring work activities and workloads, it is difficult to assess whether Corporate Communications and client Departments are meeting objectives established for communication activities (e.g., results expectations, resource estimates, etc.).
11. The City of Ottawa is subject to a number of laws, by-laws, regulations and internal policies and priorities which departments/programs, including Corporate Communications must respect. Based on our audit, we found that there is no guidance in the City of Ottawa on how these requirements are to be integrated

into communications planning and implementation. We also note that the Chief, Corporate Communications has no stated authority to monitor compliance to these requirements among clients (e.g., departments and programs).

12. The Corporate Communications budgeting process is focused on expenditures incurred within the Department (e.g., compensation costs for Corporate Communications staff) as Corporate Communications is not responsible for budgeting or monitoring communications expenditures incurred within client organizations (e.g., departments). The exception to this statement is advertising expenditures incurred by Corporate Communications clients. These costs are monitored by Corporate Communications.
13. Corporate Communications' knowledge of the costs of client communication activities would provide Corporate Communications with greater insight into planned client communication approaches. As confirmed with Corporate Communications representatives, access to this information would enable Corporate Communications to undertake more informed critical analysis in their provision of advice (i.e., is there a more cost effective approach that can be taken to achieving communication program objectives?).
14. Corporate Communications currently employs a chargeback system to recover a portion of costs for only two of its many service lines: advertising purchases and media monitoring services. This chargeback mechanism was implemented as a budgetary means of partially recovering associated service delivery costs. The chargeback system, however, has not been appropriately rationalized, nor documented, as part of any comprehensive approach or policy to establish which Corporate Communications services should be cost recovered.
15. The issues identified with the Source Separated Organics Communications Strategy can be summarized as follows:
 - the target audience(s) were not properly identified;
 - the most effective methods for reaching this target audience(s) were not adequately assessed and pursued;
 - the strategic messaging to these target audience(s) was not developed; and,
 - the communications initiatives utilized were never evaluated to determine which were effective and which were not to guide future efforts.
16. The Corporate Communications group was essentially not involved in the Source Separated Organics initiative. In our view, this experience demonstrates the implications of the broader issues raised in this audit of the need to clearly identify the mandate, role and authority of CC in the future.

Status of Implementation of 2011 Audit Recommendations

2011 Recommendation 1

That the City clearly define the intended overall mandate and role of the Corporate Communications function versus communications responsibilities of each department.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

In the summer of 2011, the newly hired Chief of Corporate Communications began efforts to clearly define the mandate and role of Corporate Communications.

Through consultation and guidance from Council, Executive Committee and Senior Management Committee, two key documents were drafted: 'Delivering Corporate Communications at the City of Ottawa: A Strategic Framework' and a Communications Policy for the City of Ottawa. These documents have laid the groundwork to manage communications in a systematic and organized manner.

The draft Communications Policy and Strategic Communications Framework documents were distributed to senior management and their teams in Q1 2012. Both documents will be finalized and redistributed to senior management by Q2 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 1 as of July 1, 2013

The Communications Policy and Strategic Communications Framework were both distributed to senior management and their teams in Q1 2012. In Q2 2012, the documents were presented to Executive Committee where they were finalized and approved under the authority of the City Manager.

In Q2 2012, the final Communications Policy was distributed to all managers at the City of Ottawa via email and in hard copy/booklet. In addition, the policy was made available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 1

The new Communications Policy was distributed via Management Bulletin in July 2012 and is available through Ozone, the City's Intranet. The Policy is comprehensive and delineates the responsibility of City departments and the Corporate Communications department.

The Strategic Communications Framework is a Corporate Communications departmental internal reference document and as such has been distributed to Executive Committee in April 2012 but is not available City wide.

Both the Communications Policy and Strategic Communications Framework clearly define the intended overall mandate and role of the Corporate Communications function versus communications responsibilities of each department.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 2

That Corporate Communications conduct active consultations with Council and senior managers in the City, to ensure the Strategic Communications Framework and the Communications Policy currently under development meet their needs.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Senior Management Committee and Executive Committee were extensively consulted on the Strategic Communications Framework and Communications Policy in Q1 and Q2 2012, respectively. Both documents will be finalized and redistributed to senior management by the end of Q2 2012. These documents will also form part of the Corporate Communications briefing material, which is made available for internal consultation and is updated as required. To ensure that Council is informed as to the content of the framework and policy, Corporate Communications will distribute the documents to members of Council.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 2 as of July 1, 2013

Senior Management Committee and Executive Committee were extensively consulted on the Strategic Communications Framework and Communications Policy in Q1 and Q2 2012, respectively. During the development of these documents, a series of interviews were conducted with members of Council to determine needs and requirements and discuss gaps. Both documents were finalized and redistributed to senior management in Q2 2012 as part of an update on communications at Senior Management Committee.

In Q2 2012, the final Communications Policy was distributed to all managers at the City of Ottawa via email and in hard copy/booklet. In addition, the policy was made available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone. Orientation sessions with Corporate Communications staff were also conducted in Q2 2012 and the documents continue to be part of the department's briefing material.

Following its approval and finalization, the Communications Policy was distributed to members of Council in July 2012 via a memo from the City Manager.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 2

The Communications Policy was discussed at SMC and EC in Q1 and Q2 2012 and approved in Q2 2012. It was issued to members of Council in July 2012. The Chief, Corporate Communications also presented the Framework and Policy to various Departmental Management Teams.

The Strategic Communications Framework is a Corporate Communications departmental internal reference document and as such has been distributed to Executive Committee in April 2012 but is not available City wide.

The new Communications Policy was made available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone and was distributed to managers and supervisors and is part of new employees' and new managers' orientations.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 3

That once the Strategic Communications Framework and the Communications Policy have been promulgated, these documents should be part of regular orientation for all managers, including new hires.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Corporate Communications will conduct orientation sessions with managers by Q3 2012 and will ensure that Corporate Communications staff is available to brief managers as required. Corporate Communications will work with Human Resources to ensure that these documents are included in the corporate orientation program for new management hires by Q4 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 3 as of July 1, 2013

Following approval of the Communications Policy, the document was rolled out to managers across the corporation, including the distribution of policy booklets to all managers with an accompanying memo from the City Manager. In addition, Corporate Communications offered orientation sessions to departmental management teams. With the support of Human Resources, the Communications Policy has been added to the curriculum of new employee orientation as well as the new manager orientation.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 3

The new Communication Policy was issued via Management Bulletin on July 12, 2012 as well as hard copy. It is available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone.

The Strategic Communications Framework is a Corporate Communications departmental internal reference document and as such has been distributed to Executive Committee in April 2012 but is not available City wide.

Managers were briefed and provided a hardcopy of the Policy. On an on-going basis, the Communications Policy was added to the curriculum of new employees and new managers' orientations. Communications staff are included in orientation sessions. Corporate Communications also present the Communications Policy as part of the "Supervisory Transition" training aimed at employees with new supervisory roles.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 4

That as part of Strategic Framework development, Corporate Communications clearly articulate the governance model, including roles and responsibilities, and the communications support delivery structure (including level and type of required resources) for serving its varied client base, and to meet the City's overall communication requirements.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The Strategic Framework articulates governance within the department, roles and responsibilities for each resource as well as workflows and functional organizational charts. This document will be finalized and distributed to Senior Management by Q2 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 4 as of July 1, 2013

The Strategic Framework articulates governance within the department, roles and responsibilities for each resource as well as workflows and functional organizational charts. This document was distributed to Senior Management in Q1 2012 and was finalized in Q2 2012 as part of an update to Senior Management Committee.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 4

The governance model, including roles and responsibilities, and the communications support delivery structure for serving its varied client base, and to meet the City's overall communication requirements was articulated in the Delivering Corporate Communication at the City of Ottawa – A Strategic Framework document. The document was distributed at SMC in February 2012 and EC in April 2012.

As previously noted, the Strategic Communications Framework is a Corporate Communications Departmental internal reference document and as such has not been distributed further then SMC and EC.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 5

That, upon clarification of the Corporate Communications governance model, Corporate Communications update its functional job descriptions and communicate this information to affected staff.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

All Corporate Communications job descriptions will be updated to reflect the roles and responsibilities outlined in the approved Strategic Framework and will be communicated to affected staff by Q4 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 5 as of July 1, 2013

Corporate Communications job descriptions were updated throughout 2012 as part of the CIPP Job Evaluation Plan. During that update, all job descriptions were revised to include the updated functions, roles and responsibilities, as outlined in the approved Strategic Framework. The changes to each job description were communicated to affected staff as part of that process.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 5

Per the SAP FTE Summary report as at March 2014, Corporate Communication has 42 budgeted FTEs; consisting of 31 CIPP; 6 CUPE 503 I/O; 4 MPE and 1 SAS.

CIPP job descriptions were updated during 2013 as part of a corporate-wide exercise to standardize these. The affected employee, section manager and director/GM or designate signed off on the job description.

Management informed us that all Executive Assistants positions were also standardized across all departments as part of a separate exercise.

We understand that Human Resources are presently negotiating with CUPE 503 to undertake a standardization exercise. Corporate Communications do not intend to undertake to standardize the CUPE 503 I/O positions unless it is part of a city-wide exercise.

All CUPE 503 I/O functional job descriptions will also need to be revised, updated and this information communicated to affected employees for this recommendation to be considered completed.

OAG: % complete

85%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 5 as of July 2, 2014

With the development of the Strategic Framework, the governance model of the Corporate Communications department was clarified. All roles and responsibilities for each Corporate Communications job function as reflected in the Strategic Framework were communicated to staff in 2012, thereby meeting the intent of the original recommendation. Management considers implementation of this recommendation to be complete.

Management: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 6

That Corporate Communications develop and implement a common set of tools to support consistent and reliable prioritization and planning of Corporate Communications workflows.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Corporate Communications is developing a Program Support Integration Model and an intake process to support the annual planning process, which will focus on aligning communication activities with priorities and capacity by Q3 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 6 as of July 1, 2013

In Q3 2012, the Program Support Integration Model and the Corporate Communications Planning Workflow were developed as a common tool to support consistent and reliable prioritization of communications efforts. This new planning process is being implemented in line with the 2013 business planning process and shared service agreements.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 6

The Program Support Integration Model changed and became the September 2012 Communications Planning Workflow which was provided by management.

The Communications Planning Workflow created in September 2012 guides the process. Each department provides Corporate Communications with a list of all possible events for the upcoming year. The draft departmental plans are reviewed to ensure that no two events conflict and events are prioritized prior to being approved at EC or refined based on EC direction(s). Thereafter, departmental project plans and resource requirements are defined. Shared service agreements are documented, completed and signed off by each GM.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 7

That Corporate Communications develop a performance measurement framework that incorporates qualitative and quantitative performance indicators to measure if desired results are achieved and defined objectives met.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

A performance management framework, aligned to the Corporate Planning Framework will be developed by Q4 2012. The framework will feature an ability to measure the effectiveness of the communications business lines and report results to the appropriate department or committee. The indicators will be aligned to corporate priorities and will enable risk areas to be identified and mitigated.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 7 as of July 1, 2013

A performance measurement framework, aligned to the Corporate Planning Framework was completed in Q1 2013. The framework features an ability to measure the effectiveness of the communications business lines and report results to the appropriate department or committee.

Management: % complete**100%****OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 7**

Corporate Communications' performance measurement framework aligns to the Corporate Planning Framework. The framework features an ability to measure the effectiveness of the communications business lines and report results to the appropriate department or committee. Indicators, targets and dashboard items had not been determined for Internal Communications; and, targets had not been determined for media relations, implementation and advertising.

We also reviewed the department's latest Balanced Scorecard Report on 2013 reporting year, which was completed March 2014. The Balanced Scorecard reported on strategic communications, governance and planning, employee engagement and financial stewardship.

The Corporate Communication's Dashboard (e.g., staffing, budget tracking, corporate accountabilities, legislative agenda, projects and initiatives, outreach, etc) is reported to the City Manager's Office monthly.

All indicators, targets and dashboard items from the performance measurement framework need to be determined in order for this recommendation to be considered fully implemented. Specifically, the media relations target; the implementation target; the internal communications indicator/unit, target and dashboard items; and, the advertising targets need to be established.

OAG: % complete**90%****Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 7 as of July 2, 2014**

A performance measurement framework, aligned to the Corporate Planning Framework was completed in Q1 2013. Upon further consideration of the appropriate measures for media relations, implementation, internal communications and advertising, qualitative measures were assigned to ensure that the desired results are achieved and objectives are met for the above functions.

Media relations: Message effectiveness is monitored and adjusted through a daily media analysis, social media scan and ServiceOttawa call trends; and is discussed at the daily stand-up meeting to ensure that communications to residents, employees and stakeholders is integrated and coordinated. Further, the daily media analysis identifies whether the media's coverage is on message and allows for corrective action if required.

Implementation: The department has various planning processes and tools to support the implementation of communications plans and to ensure that communications to residents, employees and stakeholders is integrated and

coordinated. These include: the Corporate Communications Annual Plan; departmental Shared Service Agreements and related work plans; departmental editorial calendar; weekly review of communication plan objectives by Departmental Management Team (DMT); campaign strategy process; and the communications plan template, which provides guidelines on how to implement a communications plan. Each of these processes allows for periodic adjustments as required.

Internal Communications: The department uses various feedback mechanisms to ensure that communications to employees is integrated and coordinated. These include: a review of internal communications plans objectives at weekly DMT meetings; regular internal communications updates at Senior Management Committee; use of an e-mail feedback mechanism in the Top 5, the City Manager's monthly newsletter; and an Employee Communications e-mail address which employees are encouraged to use. In addition, the measures captured in the Employee Engagement Survey (every 18 months) provide insight into the effectiveness of internal communications and helps to determine internal communications strategies.

Advertising: An advertising cap for all discretionary advertising has been developed and identifies a cap for each department. The tracking of the advertising cap began in Q1 2012 and ensures that advertising spending is managed in alignment with the Corporate Communications Annual Plan, in a fiscally responsible manner. Corporate Communications meets regularly with departments to review and discuss variances in advertising spending against the ad cap. In alignment with the Communications Strategy, Corporate Communications recommends more cost-effective and adaptable communications strategies and tactics, such as social media and digital channels, in order to address the variances.

Management: % complete ***100%***

2011 Recommendation 8

That the various stakeholder feedback monitoring mechanisms be centrally coordinated to avoid overlaps and duplication.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Corporate Communications will prepare an annual consultation plan to reflect the major stakeholder feedback activities in conjunction with the annual planning process. This will be used to reduce duplication and integrate initiatives to the extent possible and will be made available to Executive Committee by Q1 2013.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 as of July 1, 2013

An Annual Consultation Plan is currently being developed in conjunction with the development of an integrated editorial calendar, which will be available to Executive Committee members by the end of Q1 2014. The timeline was adjusted in order to align with the requirements of the Public Engagement Strategy, currently in progress.

Management: % complete

60%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 8

Corporate Communications compiles an Annual Corporate Communication Plan calendar of events/initiatives broken down by department by month. We reviewed the calendars of public consultations that occurred between June and December 2013.

Management informed us that the Annual Consultation Plan, that should have been developed in July 2013 and be provided to Executive Committee by end of Q1 2014, was combined within the Annual Corporate Communication calendar of events/initiatives. However, the Annual Corporate Communication calendar does not address the intent of the recommendation i.e., reflect the various stakeholder feedback monitoring mechanisms. For this recommendation to be considered fully implemented, an Annual Consultation Plan should be developed.

The Public Engagement Strategy was approved by Council in December 2013.

OAG: % complete

60%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 8 as of July 2, 2014

Stakeholder feedback mechanisms, e.g. public consultations are included in the Corporate Communications Annual Plan and communications planning process. This ensures that the Corporation avoids overlaps and duplication of effort in its stakeholder feedback initiatives.

Subsequent to this audit, Senior Management Committee made a corporate decision for all departments to report on their consultations directly through a centralized tool, which ServiceOttawa has developed, in support of the Public Engagement Strategy. Corporate Communications has fulfilled its responsibilities to support this initiative by completing a communications plan to inform residents, employees and stakeholders of the Public Engagement Strategy and its various public consultation activities.

Management: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 9

That, as part of the development of the City's Communications Policy, the roles and responsibilities of Corporate Communications and City managers in regard to implementation and compliance be clearly defined.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The Communications Policy outlines that all City staff are responsible for adhering to the parameters of the policy and for ensuring all communications efforts of the City of Ottawa conform to its requirements. It also articulates the monitoring responsibility and the results of contravention. The recommendation will be considered implemented with the approval of the Communications Policy in 2012.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 9 as of July 1, 2013

In Q2 2012, the final Communications Policy was distributed to all managers at the City of Ottawa via email and in hard copy/booklet. Accompanying the policy booklet was a letter from the City Manager outlining their shared responsibility for communications. In addition, the policy was made available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 9

The New Communications Policy was distributed to all managers hardcopy and via Management Bulletin in July 2012. The Policy is also available through Ozone, the City's intranet. It is comprehensive and delineates the responsibility of both departments and the Corporate Communications department.

Both the Communications Policy and Strategic Communications Framework define the intended overall mandate and role of the Corporate Communications function versus communications responsibilities of each department.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 10

That the City review and monitor its use of various designs for communications vehicles to ensure the Visual Identity Guidelines are followed wherever possible.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Corporate Communications will update the Visual Identity Guidelines and will communicate them to key stakeholders by Q4 2012. Corporate Communications

will also review communications products to ensure that the Visual Identity Program standards and other policy requirements are followed as part of the monitoring of the Communications Policy. Ongoing monitoring of the policy will begin in Q4 2012.

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 10 as of July 1, 2013

An update of the Visual Identity Guidelines is currently in progress and will be completed by the end of Q1 2014. Once completed, Corporate Communications will communicate the guidelines to key stakeholders. Corporate Communications will also review communications products to ensure that the Visual Identity Program standards and other policy requirements are being followed as part of the monitoring of the Communications Policy.

Management: % complete **5%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 10

At the time of our follow-up audit, Corporate Communications had not started work on the new City's Visual Identity. Management considers that the Visual Identity, as it was developed at amalgamation, is overly specific and that level of detail may no longer be warranted. The advent of social media (Tweeter, Facebook, etc.) has also resulted in major changes, in terms of the size of the communication and visual identity as well as reach, frequency and immediacy. In March 2014, Corporate Communications were still at the conceptualizing stage as to what the City's Visual Identity requirements are.

We have allocated 5% as management advised us in mid-April that "a guideline to supplement the standards is in process with a draft expected to be complete by end of Q2 2014". However, there were no draft guidelines, working papers or any documentation that would have allowed us to assess that implementation had started.

OAG: % complete **5%**

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 10 as of July 2, 2014

Updated Visual Identity Guidelines which provide direction on the various uses of the most frequently used visual identity elements has been developed.

The guideline has been circulated to key stakeholders. As part of its ongoing monitoring responsibility, Corporate Communications oversees the application of the Visual Identity Guideline and other policy requirements such as the Communications Policy.

Management: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 11

That, as part of the development of the City's Communications Policy, Corporate Communications include guidelines on the use of social media.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The official use of social media will be governed under the Communications Policy to be finalized in Q2 2012. Supporting guidelines will be created for the official use of social media (Twitter) by Q3 2012.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 11 as of July 1, 2013

The official use of social media is governed by the Communications Policy, which was finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

Guidelines for the official use of social media using the City's Twitter accounts (@ottawacity and @ottawaville) were created in Q2 2012 and implemented for use by the Corporate Communications administrator for Twitter.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 11

Social media is referenced in Section 15 of the Communications Policy. We were provided both the Social Media Guidelines and Twitter Guidelines which are not available on Ozone. Management informed us that both documents are for Corporate Communications department use only.

We found the Policy to be unclear as the Social Media and Web 2.0 states that "initiatives should be developed following the Social Media Guidelines" and "social media initiatives must be coordinated and approved through Corporate Communications"; however, the Policy does not clarify that the Guidelines are a Corporate Communication only resources and not available to departments.

We did note that the 2013 Corporate Communications Departmental Balanced Scorecard Report reported on the Social Media Enablement initiative.

Section 15 - Social Media and Web 2.0 – of the Communications Policy should be clarified. In addition, both the Social Media Guidelines and Twitter Guidelines should include who approved them, the approval date and any revision dates.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 12

That the City implement a communications budget development process that is closely aligned to, and informed by its operational resource planning process, including all communications resources reporting within departments.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

As part of the current Service Level Agreement process, departments forecast their annual workplans in advance of the development of the budget. As indicated in the management response for Recommendation 6, Corporate Communications will be implementing a Program Support Integration Model in Q3 2012, to strengthen this process and align communications activities with priorities identified during the annual planning process.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 12 as of July 1, 2013

In Q3 2012, the Program Support Integration Model and the Corporate Communications Planning Workflow were developed to drive the annual planning process and identify resource requirements for communications efforts. This new planning process is being implemented in line with the 2013 business planning process and shared service agreements.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 12

Management provided the September 2012 Communications Planning Workflow as a Program Support Integration Model has not been developed.

The Communications Planning Workflow created in September 2012 guides the process. Each department provides Corporate Communications with a list of all possible events for the upcoming year. The draft departmental plans are reviewed to ensure that no two events conflict; and events are prioritized. This corporate plan is approved at EC or refined per EC's direction.

Thereafter, departmental project plans and resource requirements are defined. Shared service agreements are documented, completed and signed off by each GM. Corporate Communications measures the communication's effectiveness and compliance to the Communication Policy; measure performance; identify and mitigate risks and revise the plans as required.

Resources (e.g., strategists, project managers, media relations officers) are allocated for individual standing and sub committees. Corporate Communications department is aware of operational resources within other departments.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 13

That, as part of enhanced strategic and operational planning processes employed with clients, Corporate Communications request access to and be provided with departmental communication budgets and expenditure information.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Corporate Communications will work with the Finance department to obtain departmental communication budgets and expenditure information for the 2013 fiscal year to inform strategic and operational planning, by Q1 2013.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 as of July 1, 2103

Departmental advertising budgets were provided to Corporate Communications in Q1 2013 and are now tracked against advertising expenditures on an ongoing basis to ensure effective management of advertising funding.

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 13

We concur that departmental advertising budgets are tracked against advertising expenditures on a monthly basis.

The tracking (but not the results) was also reported in the 2013 Corporate Communications Departmental Balanced Scorecard Report.

We do not consider this recommendation fully implemented as we have concerns that the expenditures against budgets, as at December 31, 2013, varied with no explanation as to variances. The total departmental spending at December 31, 2013 was \$1.7 million although the operational budget was for \$1.3 million (variance of 32%) For Corporate Communications department to benefit from the monitoring, operational budgets and expenditures should be reviewed to determine if they should be adjusted and rationales should be provided to support variances.

OAG: % complete

90%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 13 as of July 2, 2014

The tracking of advertising against the advertising cap began in Q1 2012 and ensures that advertising spending is managed in alignment with the Corporate Communications Annual Plan, in a fiscally responsible manner. Corporate Communications reviews the ad cap with departments on a regular basis to discuss variances in spending against the cap and adjusts advertising expenditures accordingly as part of the annual communications planning process. Budget planning and external expenditures are also identified in the communications plan template.

Management: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 14

That Corporate Communications evaluate its two existing cost recovery mechanisms in order to ensure their continued relevance and value within the Strategic Framework currently under development.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The two cost recovery mechanisms were examined in Q1 2012, and as a result, the advertising surcharge was eliminated. The media monitoring cost recovery will be further examined upon renewal of the service in Q1 2013.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 14 as of July 1, 2013

The media monitoring cost recovery model was evaluated in Q1 2013 to ensure continued relevance and value. A new cost recovery model was developed and will be implemented in the 2014 fiscal year.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 14

There were originally two cost recovery mechanisms: advertising; and, media monitoring. The first was to recover 50% of the cost of the FTE that dealt with advertising to users as a percentage of use during the year. Corporate Communications Management informed us that as this was labour intensive, the practice was eliminated.

The second practice relates to charging back for media monitoring. Due to the immediate pace of communications, Management informed us that media monitoring may eventually be handled by internal staff. The City's current contract with Media Miser ends April 2016.

The 2013 Corporate Communications Departmental Balanced Scorecard Report reported on both the elimination of the chargeback (now being absorbed by Corporate Communications) and the new communications standing offer for monitoring.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 15

That City communications plans/strategies, especially those aimed at changing public behaviour, be based on a thorough analysis of the environment within which the communications initiative will be launched.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The requirement to incorporate an analysis of the environment into communications efforts is included in the Communications Policy. The policy will be finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

Supporting Environmental Analysis Guidelines will be developed to reflect the need for public opinion research and media monitoring to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan and readjustments to be made if required. This guideline will be complete by Q4 2012. The Communications Planning Template will also be updated to incorporate the requirement by Q4 2012. This will include a scan of past and ongoing media coverage around an issue.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 15 as of July 1, 2013

The requirement to incorporate an analysis of the environment into communications efforts is included in the Communications Policy. This was completed in Q2 2012.

The Communications Planning Template was updated in Q4 2012 to include a scan of past and ongoing media coverage around an issue.

Environmental Analysis Guidelines, to reflect the need for public opinion research and media monitoring to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan and readjustments to be made if required, were completed in Q2 2013.

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 15

We concur that Section 7 of the Communications Policy relates to Environment Analysis and that the Communications Plan Template includes a section on environmental analysis.

We were provided an undated draft Environmental Analysis Guidelines. The “Current news coverage or issues” section stipulated that recent social media comments to record both media and public opinions on the issues should be reviewed.

A new undated version was thereafter provided in mid-April. The replacement guideline History/Comparators section stipulates that social media comments and trends to record media and public opinions on the issues should be reviewed.

The Communications Plan Template and Environmental Analysis Guidelines should be dated and any revision dates also be captured.

We only reviewed the Green Bin and Bi-weekly Communication Campaign as management informed us it was the only large scale campaign completed.

Specific to the Green Bin and Bi-Weekly Communication Campaign, an in-depth survey had been performed to obtain information from green bin occasional and non-users.

OAG: % complete ***100%***

2011 Recommendation 16

That City communications plans have no more than three objectives, all of which “should be as precise and measurable as possible in order to ensure measurement and increase mutual accountability” (as described in the City’s Communications Planning Template).

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The Communications Planning Template will be updated to reflect the requirement for no more than three objectives in communications plans. The updated template will be made available on the City’s Intranet by Q4 2012.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 16 as of July 1, 2013

The Communications Planning Template was updated in Q4 2012 to reflect the requirement for no more than three objectives in communications plans.

Management: % complete ***100%***

OAG’s Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 16

The Communications Planning Template reflects the requirement for no more than three objectives in communications plans. This was consistent with the Green Bin and Bi-weekly communications campaign. However, one of the three smaller scale

communication plans we reviewed had four objectives, one of which could have been interpreted as a fifth.

In addition, we could not determine when the Communications Planning Template had been updated. The template should be dated and any revision dates captured.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 17

That, when all citizens are affected by a City initiative, the City break out target audiences which might need tailored communications attention (e.g., new Canadians, rural residents, seniors, women, etc.).

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The requirement to identify and delineate strategies, tools and messages for communicating with target audiences is included in the new Communications Policy. The policy will be finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 17 as of July 1, 2013

The requirement to identify and delineate strategies, tools and messages for communicating with target audiences is included in the new Communications Policy, which was finalized and distributed in Q2 2012 via email and hard copy/booklet and is available online via the City's intranet website, Ozone.

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 17

Section 6 of the Communications Policy, Reflecting Diversity, states that "communications plans and activities should reflect the needs and interests of target audiences and communities". It also refers to the Equity and Inclusion Lens for the development of communication materials. The later includes both a section on designing communications; and, engaging the community / consultation.

In addition, Section 12 of the Communications Policy, Planning and Measurement, states that all departments must contribute to a Corporate Communications plan that identifies target audiences inside and outside of the Corporation; and, delineates strategies, tools, messages and responsibilities for communicating with target audiences.

We only reviewed the Green Bin and Bi-weekly Communication Campaign as management informed us it was the only large scale target group testing completed. The Green Bin and Bi-weekly Communication Campaign had four focus groups totalling 36 participants. Our review of the analysis of the target audiences revealed

that two large segments - women 35-64 and men 45-64 - were not part of the focus groups. In addition, we could not identify if new Canadians and/or rural residents had participated in the focus groups. The information provided stated that the focus group were made up of recruited non-users and occasional green bin users not representative of the average resident with no additional details.

On large scale projects, the City should break out target audiences which might need tailored communications attention (e.g., new Canadians, rural residents, women, etc.) for the recommendation to be considered fully complete.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 18

That all financial and human resources be identified to carry out benchmarking and performance measurement activities included in any communications plan.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The requirement to set out operational needs and resource allocations, and the requirement to measure the effectiveness of communications programs and campaigns is included in the new Communications Policy. The policy will be finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

The Communications Planning Template will also be updated to reflect the requirement by Q4 2012.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 18 as of July 1, 2013

The Communications Policy was approved in Q2 2012 and includes a requirement to set out operational needs and resource allocations, and the requirement to measure the effectiveness of communications programs and campaigns. The Communications Planning Template was updated in Q4 2012 and also reflects this requirement.

Management: % complete

100%

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 18

Section 12 - Planning and Measurement of the Communications Policy, approved in Q2 2012, includes a requirement to set out operational needs and resource allocations, and the requirement to measure the effectiveness of communications programs and campaigns.

The Communications Planning Template also reflects this requirement. For clarity, the template should be dated and any revision dates captured.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 19

That core messages be simple and consistent for all target audiences; that they should be tested before being made public and that adjustments to address the interests of particular audiences be added as needed.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The Communications Planning Template will be updated by Q4 2012 to reflect the requirement for core messages to be simple and consistent and will include detailed criteria for testing messages.

The Environmental Analysis Guideline will be created by Q4 2012, which will reflect the need for public opinion research to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 19 as of July 1, 2013

The Communications Planning Template was updated in Q4 2012 to reflect the requirement for core messages to be simple and consistent and includes detailed criteria for testing messages.

Environmental Analysis Guidelines were completed in Q2 2013. This document reflects the need for public opinion research to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 19

The Communications Planning Template (undated) reflects the requirement for core messages to be simple, accurate and consistent with all target audiences and support corporate priorities.

We were provided an undated draft Environmental Analysis Guidelines that did not reflect the need for public opinion research to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan, as stated in Management's response.

A new also undated version was thereafter provided in mid-April that did not address the need for public opinion research to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan. The replacement guideline History/Comparators section only stipulates that social media comments and trends to record media and public opinion on the issue should be reviewed.

For clarity, the Communications Planning Template and Environmental Analysis Guidelines should both be dated and any revision dates noted as such. The Environmental Analysis Guidelines should also be updated to reflect the need for public opinion research to be tracked throughout the implementation of a communications plan.

OAG: % complete

100%

2011 Recommendation 20

That the human and financial resources be identified for any online tactics before the plan is approved.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The requirement to set out operational needs and resource allocations is included in the new Communications Policy. The policy will be finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

The Social Media Guidelines also address the requirement for identifying human and financial resources as part of any social media/web 2.0 initiative. The Social Media Guidelines will be complete by Q3 2012.

As part of the annual planning process, resource identification will be a cornerstone. Service level agreements will be created with departments based on the identified resource requirements of planned projects.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 20 as of July 1, 2013

The official use of social media is governed by the Communications Policy, which was finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

Guidelines for the official use of social media using the City's Twitter accounts (@ottawacity and @ottawaville) were created in Q2 2012 and implemented for use by the Corporate Communications administrator for Twitter. Broader social media guidelines, which address the requirement for identifying human and financial

resources for social media initiatives were completed in Q2 2013, addressing social media activities outside of the official Twitter presence.

In Q3 2012, the Program Support Integration Model and the Corporate Communications Planning Workflow were developed to drive the annual planning process and identify resource requirements for communications efforts. This new planning processes is being implemented in line with the 2013 business planning process and shared service agreements.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 20

The Program Support Integration Model and became the September 2012 Communications Planning Workflow.

Section 15 of the Communications Policy governs Web 2.0 and Social Media.

We were provided with the undated Twitter Guidelines to be used by the Corporate Communications administrator for Twitter and the Social Media Guidelines. Although these guidelines are for the sole use of Corporate Communications, both should be dated with any revision date(s) also captured.

Any budget implication of operational needs and resources allocations were identified in the three communication plans we reviewed, which included on-line tactics.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 21

That a sound media analysis be developed for incorporation into communications plans and updated on a continuing basis so that messaging and media strategies can be adjusted as needed.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

The requirement for environmental analysis including media monitoring is included in the new Communications Policy. The policy will be finalized and distributed in Q2 2012.

An RFP will be issued in Q4 2012 to select a media monitoring firm to provide monitoring and analysis. The features for the new media monitoring service will be subject to financial availability of funds requested as part of 2013 budget and are dependent on approval.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 21 as of July 1, 2013

The Communications Policy was approved in Q2 2012 and includes a requirement for environmental analysis, including media monitoring.

The RFP to select a media monitoring firm to provide monitoring and analysis was issued in Q1 2013 and a new contract was put in place in Q2 2013.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 21

The Communications Policy was approved in Q2 2012 and includes a requirement for environmental analysis, including media monitoring. Section 7 of the Communications Policy relates to Environment Analysis and that the Communications Plan Template includes a section on environmental analysis.

A RFP to select a media monitoring firm to provide monitoring and analysis was issued in Q1 2013 and a new contract was put in place in Q2 2013. The City's current contract is with Media Miser and ends April 2016.

OAG: % complete **100%**

2011 Recommendation 22

That, in the case of a major communications plan, advertising be focus group tested before launch and evaluated periodically to ensure it continues to meet operational goals.

2011 Management Response

Management agrees with the recommendation.

Guidelines to support the effective roll-out of communications plans, including how to create, implement and measure their effectiveness in accordance with leading practices, including focus group testing and other research methods, will be created by Q1 2013.

Management Representation of the Status of Implementation of Recommendation 22 as of July 1, 2013

A guideline to support the effective roll-out of communications plans, including how to create, implement and measure their effectiveness in accordance with leading practices, was completed in Q1 2013.

Management: % complete **100%**

OAG's Follow-up Audit Findings regarding Recommendation 22

We were provided a campaign strategy workflow that defines the planning; implementation and measurement phases, which is very different. The last section

of the Communications Plans Template defines how success is to be measured. No guidelines have been developed to support the effective roll-out of communications plans (e.g., how to create, implement and measure their effectiveness in accordance with leading practices).

To be considered fully implemented, a guideline to support the effective roll-out of communications plans, including how to create, implement and measure their effectiveness in accordance with leading practices will need to be developed.

Specific to the Green Bin and Bi-Weekly Communication Campaign, which per management was the only major project, five ads relating to tips for the green bin were focus group tested.

We noted that success was measured post campaign, by how many could recall the ad, but could not find any evidence that the advertising had been evaluated periodically to ensure it continued to meet operational goals.

OAG: % complete

85%

Management Representation of Status of Implementation of Recommendation 22 as of July 2, 2014

As per the audit recommendation, Corporate Communications has met its requirement to focus group test advertising for a major communications plan. The Green Bin campaign, launched in 2012 is a large-scale multi-year campaign with significant advertising expenditures. As a result, its advertising plans were focus group tested externally. As is common practice in the industry, an evaluation of the first phase of the campaign was completed and effectiveness was measured. This allowed the City to revisit the communications objectives and adjust the campaign strategy for its next phase in 2014. These periodic evaluations allow Corporate Communications to adjust its strategies and messages, as required.

To further support communications plan development and implementation for initiatives with varying scopes, the Campaign Strategy, a process which describes how to develop, implement and measure the effectiveness of a communications plan within the Corporation was completed in Q1 2013. In addition, the communications plan template for internal and external communications initiatives provides written instruction on how to develop and implement each aspect of a communications plan, including measurement.

Management: % complete

100%

Summary of the Level of Completion

The table below outlines our assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of April 2014.

Table 3: OAG's assessment of level of completion (Repeat of Table 1 in Executive Summary)

Category	% Complete	Recommendations	Number of Recommendations	Percentage of Total Recommendations
Little or no action	0 to 24	10	1	5%
Action Initiated	25 to 49	n/a	n/a	n/a
Partially Complete	50 to 74	8	1	5%
Substantially Complete	75 to 99	5, 7, 13, 22	4	18%
Complete	100	1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 9, 11, 12, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21	16	72%
Total			22	100%

The table below outlines management's assessment of the level of completion of each recommendation as of July 2014 in response to the OAG's assessment. These assessments have not been audited.

Table 4: Management's assessment of level of completion (Repeat of Table 2 in Executive Summary)

Category	% Complete	Recommendations	Number of Recommendations	Percentage of Total Recommendations
Little or no action	0 to 24	n/a	n/a	n/a
Action Initiated	25 to 49	n/a	n/a	n/a
Partially Complete	50 to 74	n/a	n/a	n/a
Substantially Complete	75 to 99	n/a	n/a	n/a
Complete	100	1, 2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22	22	100%
Total			22	100%

Conclusion

Management has substantially or fully completed 20 of the 22 recommendations contained in the original report.

At the time of our follow-up audit, Corporate Communications had not started work on the new City's Visual Identity (recommendation 10). Management considers that the Visual Identity, as it was developed at amalgamation, is overly specific and that level of detail may no longer be warranted. The advent of social media (Twitter, Facebook, etc.) has also resulted in major changes, in terms of communication size as well as reach, frequency and immediacy. Corporate Communications are still at the conceptualizing stage as to what the City's Visual Identity requirements are.

In relation to recommendation 8, management informed us that the Annual Consultation Plan, that should have been developed in July 2013 and be provided to Executive Committee by end of Q1 2014, was combined within the Annual Corporate Communication calendar of events/initiatives. However, the Annual Corporate Communication calendar does not address the intent of the recommendation i.e., reflect the various stakeholder feedback monitoring mechanisms. For this recommendation to be considered fully implemented, an Annual Consultation Plan should be developed.

Guidelines, policies and procedures should be revised as needed. We found that the date of when guidelines, policies and procedures becomes effective or its revision date was not always captured on individual documents. By clearly indicating the date when guidelines, policies and procedures took effect or were revised, readers will be able to understand that it is the most recent document, and/or that it has been updated.

Acknowledgement

We wish to express our appreciation for the cooperation and assistance afforded the audit team by management.