A CULTURAL HERITAGE IMPACT STATEMENT 480 Coverdale Road Ottawa, Ontario



SUBMITTED TO: Jianbin Wang, President Konson Homes Inc. PREPARED BY: John Stewart, Commonwealth Historic Resource Management January 2022 Revision #6 Cover: A view of 480 Cloverdale from the street. Source: Linebox Studio 2022

TABLE OF CONTENTS

1.0	INTRODUCTION	2
1.2	Site Location, Current Conditions, and Introduction to Development Site	3
1.3	Built Context and Street Characteristics	4
1.3	Relevant Information from Council Approved Documents	9
2.0	HERITAGE RESOURCE DESCRIPTION AND HISTORY	10
2.1	Description and Neighbourhood Heritage Character	10
3.0	STATEMENT of CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST	11
3.1	Statement of Cultural Heritage Value	11
4.0	DESCRIPTION OF THE DEVELOPMENT	13
4.1	Siting	13
4.2	Design and Massing	14
4.3	Materials and Finishes	21
4.4	Landscape	22
5.0	IMPACT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT	25
5.1	Impacts of the Development Proposal	25
5.2	Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan	25
5.3	Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Properties in Canada	
6.0	ALTERNATIVES AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES	33
6.1	Alternatives	
6.2	Mitigation Measures	34
6.3	Conclusions	34
7.0	AUTHORS QUALIFICATIONS	35
9.0	Appendix A Pre-consultation Comments and responses	36
10.0	Appendix B Evaluation Form for 484 Cloverdale Road	45

1.0 INTRODUCTION

This Cultural Heritage Impact Statement (CHIS) is a requirement of the City of Ottawa. The purpose of the CHIS is to identify the heritage resources and values that may be impacted by the proposed development. The property at 480 Cloverdale Road is located within the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District designated under Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act (By-law 97-10). It is a double, mid block lot located west of McKay Lake and near the northern boundary of the heritage district. The well treed property with a varied topography has never been developed.

The CHIS evaluates the impact the construction of a new home in a manner that is consistent with the City of Ottawa Official Plan Section 4.6. This CHIS follows the content outline recommended by the City of Ottawa for Cultural Heritage Impact Statements.

The following documents were consulted in the preparation of this report:

- Part V of the Ontario Heritage Act.
- Guidelines for the Preparation of Cultural Heritage Impact Statements, City of Ottawa.
- Village of Rockcliffe Park, Heritage Conservation District Study Julian Smith & Associates 1997.
- Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan, July 2016 City of Ottawa (By-law 2016-089).
- Architectural Drawings, including Site Plan, Floor Plans, Elevations, Perspectives, and Conceptual Landscape Plans Linebox Studio October 2021 revised
- Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada, Second Edition, 2010.
- Minutes of the pre-consultation review by the City of Ottawa.
- Comment letter from the Rockcliffe Park Heritage Committee following a second pre consult meeting March 2021.
- Joint Comments from the City of Ottawa and the RPHC following a third pre-consultation meeting 19 August 2021
- A revised set of drawings, plans, elevations, and renderings prepared by Linebox Studio October 2021.

1.2 Site Location, Current Conditions, and Introduction to Development Site The property is located within Rockcliffe Park. The site is an internal double lot backing onto the Rockcliffe Lawn and Tennis Club. To the south is Lakehurst Road, Old Prospect Road and McKay Lake are to the east and Hillsdale Road is to the north.

This area of Rockcliffe Park was sub-divided and developed beginning in the 1920s through to the present day. Homes along Cloverdale are well screened with filtered views through the mixed forest canopy. The residence 484 Cloverdale is a grade 1, Cape Cod style residence. Other homes along the street are generally, handsome interpretations of traditional architectural styles and all are classified as Grade II contributing homes. The property is a large double lot 85 ft wide along the street frontage, with a notch along the north expanding to 102 ft wide for most of the property that extending 234 ft deep. The property to the south is undeveloped and tennis courts are located to the east. As the map illustrates a canopy of mature trees is a feature of this section of Rockcliffe Park.



Figure 1: Aerial view surrounding the site illustrating the context. Site Arrowed. Source: GeoOttawa.

1.3 **Built Context and Street Characteristics** ZONING INFORMATION

Address

480 Cloverdale, Ottawa, Ontario

Zoning R1B [1259] R1 - Residential First Density Zone

Lot Area: 2079 m² Lot size: 25.9 (30.48) m x 71.4m Max Lot Coverage: 30% (623 m²) Minimum lot width: 27m Minimum lot area: 925m Maximum building height: 9m

Permitted building types

(1) The following uses are permitted uses subject to:

- (a) the provisions of subsection 155 (3) to (6);
- (b) a maximum of three guest bedrooms in a bed and breakfast;
- (c) a maximum of ten residents is permitted in a group home; and
- (d) a maximum of ten residents is permitted in a retirement home, converted.
- bed and breakfast, see Part 5, Section 121
- detached dwelling
- diplomatic mission, see Part 3, Section 88
- group home, see Part 5, Section 125
- home-based business, see Part 5, Section 127
- home-based daycare, see Part 5, Section 129
- park
- retirement home, converted see Part 5, Section 122
- secondary dwelling unit, see Part 5, Section 133
- urban agriculture, see Part 3, Section 82 (By-law 2017-148)

Conditional Permitted Uses

(2) The following conditional use is also permitted in the R1 zone, subject to the following:

- (a) it is located on a lot fronting on and having direct vehicular access to an Arterial or Major Collector Road, such roads which are indicated on Schedule 3 - Urban Road Network; and
 - (i) Where there is no secondary dwelling unit, a maximum of seven rooming units is permitted;
 - (ii) Where there is a secondary dwelling unit, a maximum of six rooming units is permitted. (By-law 2018-206) rooming house see Part 5, Section 122 (By-law 2018-206)

Minimum front yard setback: 4.5m

Minimum rear yard setback: 12m Minimum side yard setback: 4.5m

SITE STATISTICS - NEIGHBOURHOOD COMPARISON

ADDRESS	BUILDING GRADE	LOT AREA	BUILDING FOOT PRINT	LAND COVERAGE	BUILDING HEIGHT	HARDSCAPE DRIVEWAY	% HARDSCAPE DRIVEWAY	HARDSCAPE OTHER	% HARDSCAPE OTHER
480 CLOVERDALE RD PROPOSED	n/a	2,080m ²	461m ²	22%	2 STOREYS	155m ²	7%	15m ²	1%
484 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEI	1,115m ²	225m ²	20%	2 STOREYS	55m²"	5%	n/a	n/a**
540 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,548m²	447m ²	29%	3 STOREYS	268m²*	17%	305m²*	20%
475 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,194m ²	296m²	25%	2 STOREYS	44m²*	4%	109m ^{2*}	9%
467 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,231m ²	339m²	28%	2 STOREYS	139m²*	11%	80m²*	7%
461 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	1,230m²	310m ²	25%	3 STOREYS	170m²*	14%	243m ^{2*}	20%
455 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	2,719m²	750m²	28%	3 STOREYS	278m²*	10%	185m²*	7%
446 CLOVERDALE RD.	GRADEII	944m²	232m²	25%	3 STOREYS	136m²*	14%	65m²*	7%

* VALUES ARE APPROXIMATE AND REQUIRE LAND SURVEYS TO BE VERIFIED ** HEAVY FOLIAGE PREVENTS ANALYSIS OF REAR YARD LANDSCAPING

ZONING MATRIX

ZONING	REQUIRED	EXISTING	PROPOSED
MIN. LOT AREA	925m²	-	-
MIN. LOT WIDTH	27.0m	25.9m	25.9m
MIN. FRONT YARD SETBACK	4.5m	6.0m	6.8m
MIN. REAR YARD SETBACK	12.0m	n/a	22.3m
MIN. SIDE YARD SETBACK	4.5m	n/a	4.5m
MAX. BUILDING HEIGHT	8.5m	n/a	8.5m
GFA	780m ² (based on FSI)	n/a	777.55 m²
FSI	0.375	n/a	0.374



Figure 2: Plan view of the development site illustrating the existing context, both built and landscape. The development site (centre in pink) features a large linear double lot extending to the tennis courts to the east. The property to the south is undeveloped; the house at 484 Cloverdale Road is a two storey Grade 1 building. The building at 484 is sited close to the property line, which has been notched to accommodate the garage and parking. An addition (not shown) on the east side of the house occupies a large part of the rear. Buildings on the west side of Cloverdale are all large two storey homes classified as contributing Grade II. Source: Linebox Studio.



Figure 3: Roof Elevations of the homes along Cloverdale and Lakehurst Roads. Source: Linebox Studio



Figure 4: Comparative heights of buildings along Cloverdale and Lakehurst Roads. The revised height of 480 has been reduced to 66.17. Source: Linebox Studio



Figure 5: View looking south. The streetscape features a mature wooded landscape of mixed trees, terraced plantings screening the homes, with front lawns containing a variety of flowering plants, shrubs, and mature trees visible from the driveways that interrupt the tree canopy and create picturesque points of view focusing on the homes. Source: Google Earth.



Figure 6: View of 484 Cloverdale Road to the north of the development site. The property is a 11/2 Storey Grade 1 contributing property within the context of the HCD. The front yard with fruit trees and manicured lawn are defining features of this property and support the picturesque traditions of the HCD. A two-storey addition built in 2001 in the rear yard takes up most of the soft landscape and presents a much larger footprint than is suggested from the street. Source: Google Earth.



Figure 7: Rendered views of the two homes 484 and 480. The one storey side entry garage is in line with the front façade of 484 Cloverdale. The bulk of the residence sits well back on the lot. With the reduced frontage of 480 and the garage of the neighbouring 484 home positioned close to the lot line, there is a potential pinch point. Source: Linebox Studio. 2022 revised.



Figure 8: Winter view of the Hart Massey House is an art piece in the landscape overlooking MacKay Lake. This distinct residence just one block east of the subject property illustrates the eclectic range of styles that Rockcliffe Park features. Attributes of the residence such as the raised floor on stilts, clean lines and modularity are suggested in the proposed Cloverdale project. Source: Thomas d'Aquino. <u>http://thomasdaquino.ca/house-and-garden/</u>

1.3 Relevant Information from Council Approved Documents

The following council approved documents are relevant to the assessment of the proposed development, including:

Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Study completed in 1997; and,

Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan, 2016.

Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada 2010

2.0 HERITAGE RESOURCE DESCRIPTION AND HISTORY

2.1 Description and Neighbourhood Heritage Character

The history of Rockcliffe Park is outlined in detail in Julian Smith & Associates *Heritage Conservation District Study* completed in 1997. As noted in the heritage assessments of the adjacent properties the area was subdivided beginning in the 1920s.

The development site is located near the northern edge of the HCD in a mature section of the Park next to tennis courts and McKay Lake to the west. The area contains an eclectic mix of architectural styles, including Tudor Revival, International, Contemporary Ranch, Cape Cod, and vernacular Queen Anne with Chateaux.



Figure 9: Detail plan of the Rockcliffe Park HCD illustrating the heritage context with the Grade I am building next door, (in red), a vacant lot to the south and the tennis courts backing onto the property. Site Arrowed. Source: City of Ottawa.

3.0 STATEMENT OF CULTURAL HERITAGE VALUE OR INTEREST

3.1 Statement of Cultural Heritage Value

The following Statement of Cultural Heritage Value identifies the primary heritage values and attributes of the HCD.

Rockcliffe Park is a rare and significant approach to estate layout and landscape design adapted to Canada's natural landscape from 18th-century English precedents. Originally purchased from the Crown by Thomas MacKay, it was laid out according to the principles of the Picturesque tradition in a series of "Park and Villa" lots by his son-in-law Thomas Keefer in 1864. The historical associations of the village with the MacKay/Keefer family, who were influential in the economic, social, cultural, and political development of Ottawa continue and the heritage conservation district is a testament to the ideas and initiatives of various key members of this extended family, and their influence in shaping this area. Rockcliffe Park today is a remarkably consistent reflection of Keefer's original design intentions. Although development of the residential lots has taken place very gradually, the ideas of estate management, of individual lots as part of a larger whole, of Picturesque design, of residential focus, have survived. This continuity of vision is very rare in a community where development has occurred on a relatively large scale over such a long time.

The preservation of the natural landscape, the deliberately curved roads, lined with mature trees, and without curbs or sidewalks, the careful landscaping of the public spaces and corridors, together with the strong landscaping of the individual properties, create the apparently casual and informal style so integral to the Picturesque tradition. The preservation and enhancement of topographical features, including the lake and pond, the internal ridges and slopes, and the various rock outcroppings, has reinforced the original design intentions. The views to and from the Ottawa River, the Beechwood escarpment, and the other park areas are integral to the Picturesque quality of Rockcliffe Park.

Beechwood Cemetery and the Rockeries serve as a compatible landscaped boundary from the earliest period of settlement through to the present. The various border lands create important gateways to the area and help establish its particular character.

The architectural design of the buildings and associated institutional facilities is similarly deliberate and careful. Many of the houses were designed by architects, in a variety of the architectural styles that have been popular since the first decades of the 20th century, including Georgian Revival, Tudor Revival, and Arts and Crafts. The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines, has maintained the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer.

The attributes of the Rockcliffe Park HCD are:

- The siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the neighbouring buildings.
- the variety of mature street trees and the dense forested character that they create.
- the profusion of trees, hedges, and shrubs on private property.
- varied lot sizes and irregularly shaped lots.
- spacing and setbacks of the buildings.
- cedar hedges planted to demarcate property lines and to create privacy.
- the dominance of soft landscaping over hard landscaping.
- wide grass verges.
- the high concentration of buildings by architect Allan Keefer.
- the rich mix of building types and styles from all eras, with the Tudor Revival and Georgian Revival styles forming a large proportion of the total building stock.
- the predominance of stucco and stone houses and the relative rarity of brick buildings.
- the narrow width of many streets,
- the road pattern that still reflects the original design established by Thomas Keefer when he originally laid out the area for residential development.
- the low, dry-stone walls that demarcate property lines in certain areas of the Village.
- Informal landscapes character with simple walkways, driveways, stone retaining walls and flowerbeds.
- the "dog walk," a public footpath that extends from Old Prospect Road to corner of Lansdowne Road and Mariposa Avenue.
- the public open spaces including the Village Green and its associated Jubilee Garden.
- institutional and recreational buildings including the three schools, Rockcliffe Park Public School, Ashbury College and Elmwood School for Girls and the Rockcliffe Park Tennis Club.
- the multi-unit buildings, small lots, and more modest houses in the area referred to as the "Panhandle," that characterize the south and west boundaries of the District,

4.0 DESCRIPTION OF THE DEVELOPMENT

4.1 Siting

The property is a large, wooded lot on the east side of Cloverdale Road, backing onto the Rockcliffe Lawn and Tennis Club. To the north is a single-family Grade I Listed residence and to the south, the lot is vacant, across the street large estate style houses are set back and screened by mature trees. The owner of the property has set the retention of as much of the existing tree cover as possible as one of the project directives. For this reason, the new home has been sited with a generous front yard setback in keeping with other houses on the street; a series of different scaled pavilions have been staged ensuring the footprint has minimum impact to the environment and does not dominate or interfere with the existing streetscape of Cloverdale Road. In order to reduce the impact on the neighbouring designated house the design has been revised to reduce the height and length of the house and to wrap it away from the side yard of the neighbouring property.

The pool has been removed along with an outdoor covered sitting area and the skybox , which results in much more extensive rear yard and setback from the north, south and the east property lines. See the Zoning Matrix on Page 4.



Figure 10: Site analysis illustrating grade changes, vegetation seasonal sun/shade patterns and feature views. There is a steep grade change between the front property and midway through the lot. A large retaining wall along the north property line defines the north edge of the depression. Source Linebox Studio.

4.2 Design and Massing

The design concept is an Asian expression with strong modernist lines. The massing of the building is broken-up into a series of linked pavilions scaled to increase from a 1-1/2 storey garage wing at the street, with a two-storey portion extending into the lot. A two-storey entrance and connection in the centre of the property links with the two main sections of the building set apart to form a courtyard and screened area sheltered from the neighbouring properties. The two-storey portion along the north is positioned away from the property line with minimal slotted windows. Mature vegetation and a live hedge buffers views along the side yard.

The scale of the two-storey structure is respectful of the scale of the adjacent house at 484 Cloverdale Road and appears much less massive than buildings across the street. The centre portion of the home is a two-storey entrance and will be constructed predominately in contemporary glazing units, on stilts.

This home takes full advantage of its setting with a footprint of first floor at 464 metres square, the second floor of 355 metres square. The basement floor area does not count towards total GFA as per City of Ottawa Zoning By-Law Exception 1259.

Impact of Covid 19 Pandemic

Although not specifically a heritage issue it is important to recognize that with the Covid 19 pandemic and requirements for lockdown and isolation, the nature of a family home is quickly changing and becoming far more inward focused with the potential of introducing amenities that had been deemed external services (theatre, gym, exercise, worship). These are now being incorporated into the basic structure of the home.

The residence is being designed to serve three generations with expectation that the entire family does not necessarily have to come together and always participate. The concept offers a series linked pods, that cater to a variety of the family's everyday needs. One of the concerns raised in the pre-consultation minutes was the distance between kitchen and dining room. This is a reasonable concern if there was just a core family. It is less valid when accommodating three generations with special catered needs, different timetables, and interests.





Figure 11: Views and all four elevations of 480 Cloverdale Avenue. Source: Linebox Studio 2022



Figure 12 & 13: Two views of the South Elevation in summer and winter illustrating the grade changes through the property. The side entrance to the garage. The right (SE) second floor volume has been reduced in size and clad in wood to break up the austerity of the overall elevation. All windows on this facade are above eye level, or narrow slit windows that provide light. Source: Linebox Studio 2022.





Figure 14 &15: Seasonal views looking north towards the rear façade from the neighbouring property. The chain-link fence (not shown) will be concealed by the evergreen hedge. Source: Linebox Studio 2021.





Figure 14: Main Entry with 1.5 storey garage volume native plantings have been proposed to flank the driveway and permeable paving is proposed for the hardscaped driveway. A softer grey masonry façade is being illustrated. The side entry of the garage eliminates the gapping garage entrance from street views. Linebox Studio.



Figure 17 and 18: Views from the rear of the property looking west. The vegetation provides only glimpses of the new residence in both winter and summer. Source: Linebox Studio 2022





Figure 19 & 20: Seasonal views of the north elevation from the neighbouring property provides an indication of the screening from the trees along the property. Existing mature trees and additional trees and shrubbery will buffer the massing from the neighbours. The length has been reduced and the skybox removed from the plan. A combination of wood and stone break up the continuity of the elevation, as it wraps away from the property line reducing the appearance of the overall scale. Source Linebox Studio





Figure 21: View looking east towards the back garden. Source: Linebox Studio 2022

Following comments and a review by the City's heritage staff and the community association the plan was revised with notable changes, including removal of a roof terrace, reducing the building by half a storey, and rotating the rear most volume away from the lot line. Additional revisions were carried out following comments from the early January meeting hosted by Councillor King.



Figure 22: View looking from the back garden to the east facade. Source: Linebox Studio 2022

4.3 Materials and Finishes

The materials used on the home will consist mainly of natural stone veneer with a rough-cut finish, including copper coping and framing of large, glazed units. One of the concerns raised was the dark tones

to the masonry; in response, a lighter tone of grey limestone is being used. The centre portion has minimal glazing details with slit windows along the north elevation. With the natural grade change over the property the east portion of the basement sits partially out of the ground. The intent is to have the building flow through the landscape as a series of linked units to take advantage of the setting, different views and changing light throughout the day and seasons.





4.4 Landscape

Rockcliffe Park HCD Policies [5.0 Statement of Objectives] specifies that development should strive "To maintain the park-like attributes, qualities and atmosphere of the HCD." As indicated earlier, a comprehensive effort in retaining as much of the existing vegetation is a prime goal. Some of the highlights of the plan include:

- less front yard hardscape (7%) than what is typical of properties on street (11%)
- less 'other' hardscape (6%) than is typical of properties on street (12%)
- equivalent building coverage (22%) compared to typical coverage of properties on street (26%)
- 51 out of 53 existing trees preserved.
- a house designed to intertwin between stands of existing trees using angled volumes and raised courtyards to avoid critical root zones even the unorthodox way columns are randomly set to mimic stands of trees.
- A palette of natural materials and finishes that capture the spirit of the Rockcliffe Park as a cultural landscape.

Following the comments, revisions to the hardscape/softscape plan were undertaken that further advance the Statement of Objectives:

- driveway and rear patio to be constructed of permeable pavers to allow for better drainage.
- garage was shifted westward, away from the street, so that the front yard setback matches that of 484 Cloverdale. This results in more front yard softscape.
- turn-around area at end of driveway was reduced significantly to minimum required for safe driving conditions.
- the house was shifted southward and rotated further and tucked into the courtyard. This results in more than 66' rear yard softscape and no overlook.
- the patio and the pool eliminated.

- all the paths to/from open air pavilion to be landscaped stepping stones (results in uninterrupted drainage patterns).
- side yard formal gardens (with retaining walls) were removed.
- rear-most volume (second floor terrace) rotated, lowered by half a storey, and additional roof gardens added to prevent overlook conditions to the North and East. Additional softscape introduced at the terrace.
- additional roof gardens added to west side of the terrace over the garage to prevent an overlook condition towards the road incorporating additional softscape.



Figure 24: Conceptual landscape plan showing the revised layout. Source: Linebox Studio 2021.



Figure 25: Revised ground floor plan. Source Linebox Studio 2022.

5.0 IMPACT OF PROPOSED DEVELOPMENT

5.1 Impacts of the Development Proposal

The following assesses the development proposal using the Conservation District Plan Guidelines for new buildings.

5.2 Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Plan

"strong landscaping of the individual properties"	The proposed landscape calls for retention of trees and integration of the building into the existing topography.
"The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this	There is ample space around all sides of the property to provide generous buffering and privacy screen both into and out.
space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines , has maintained the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer."	Reducing the size of the house and wrapping it away from the north has created a deeper rear yard. Removing the skybox has further reduced the scale. Initially, a chain-link fence was proposed. Considered inappropriate for Rockcliffe Park a black chain-link was screened by cedar hedges as a better alternative.
"The unobtrusive siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the neighbouring buildings"	Front yard setback is appropriate. The choice of materials gives the impression of a picturesque folly, which integrates well into the Rockcliffe landscape. The house is discretely situated when viewed from the street. From the side yards, the space between the building and its neighbour is generous.
"The profusion of trees, hedges, and shrubs on private property"	Proposal maintains most trees. Two mature trees to be removed and replanted.
"Generous spacing and setbacks of the buildings"	The unobtrusive siting of the house with sufficient space around the property in excess of neighbouring properties in the area offers a positive impact.
"The dominance of soft landscaping over hard landscaping"	Applicant's landscape plan demonstrates that soft landscaping will dominate.
"The rich mix of building types and styles from all eras"	Contemporary design with an Asian influence.

7.4.2 Guidelines for New Buildings

The following guidelines from the RPHCDS are relevant in the discussion of the new construction at 480 Cloverdale Road:

Guidelines

7.4.2 New buildings shall contribute to and not detract from the heritage character of the HCD and its attributes.

7.4.4 New buildings shall be of their own time but sympathetic to the character of their historic neighbours in terms of massing, height, and materials. New buildings are not required to replicate historical styles.

7.4.9 The use of natural materials, such as stone, real stucco, brick, and wood are important attributes of the HCD, and the use of materials such as vinyl siding, aluminium soffits, synthetic stucco, and manufactured stone will not be supported.

Positive Impacts to Guidelines 7.4.2, 7.4.4, and 7.4. 9:

- The new construction proposed for the site follows the management guidelines for the district in that its siting, form, materials, and detailing are sympathetic to the surrounding natural and cultural environment.
- The proposed development retains the existing lot size and density. The existing grades are largely maintained; the siting of the built form is strategically organized to retain existing trees with a sufficient setback to protect the root zone during construction. The massing also addresses the relationship to the side-yards between neighbouring properties.
- As recommended in the district study, the design of the new house is "of its own time" but harmonizes with its setting in its unique presentation, and generous use of limestone and wood. The proposed house is also compatible with the existing streetscape in its height, dimensions, and residential function.
- The siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I building next door with the length of the building reduced, and the sidewall angled away from the shared property line to reduce overview. At the same time, the reduced footprint provides a larger green soft landscape along the edge of the property and to the rear. Figures 3. and 4. assess the heights of residences and demonstrate that the planned residence will be no higher than the roof line at 484 Cloverdale.
- The landscape design incorporates nearly all the existing mature trees and shrubs and adds to the plantings on the property to conserve a distinct environment that will contribute to the streetscape, will provide privacy, and will support the naturalistic character between properties and the tennis court to the east.

Negative Impacts

- Houses in Rockcliffe Park tend to be rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition with multiple floors in and square or rectangular format. While the proposed house does not exhibit the picturesque principles found in some parts of the HCD, it is certainly within the vocabulary of modern homes that existed before designation, and the guidelines were implemented. A number of these homes are acknowledged as contributing to the District's value (see figure 8.). The massing of the house has been revised downward to acknowledge these qualities while also attempting to achieve its design vision.
- The height and mass of the new building were seen as negatively impacting the adjacent properties. A recent bylaw amended the height of buildings in Rockcliffe Park reducing the height

from 11 m to 8.5m. The height of the building complies with zoning provisions, with the main roof of the home set at (67.17).

Through the design process, the issue has been mitigated with the height lowered and the massing substantially reduced particularly the longitudinal portion has been adjusted and reoriented away from the sideyard.

Guidelines 7.4.3, and 7.4.5

7.4.3 Construction of new buildings will only be permitted when the new building does not detract from the historic landscape characteristics of the associated streetscape. Front yard setback is in line with neighbouring Grade I house. Proposed side yard setbacks would be more compatible with neighbouring properties if they provided more space for the planting of mature trees, considering their future canopy. The proposal should achieve a deeper rear yard.

The height has been reduced, and mass of the new building modified and more respectful of the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape. The front yard's siting, and materials of the new building are also compatible in the associated streetscape.

7.4.5 Integral garages shall be located in a manner that respects the cultural heritage value of the streetscape.

Impact of Massing Options as it pertains to Guideline 7.4.3.

The three options *described below* are useful in illustrating possibilities for siting the building *and varying impact*. The first two suggest more traditional approaches for the massing of the house and its placement on the lot. Option 1 and 2 reference neighbouring homes with a traditional footprint at the front of the property and a two and half storey front facing home with an attached garage occupying the front half of the property. (garage is orange, and the building is yellow).

The lot size and layout of 480 Cloverdale Road are unique with the notch along the north property line creating a bottle neck at the street frontage and a lot that is more than twice the length of the adjacent lots. The reduced frontage results in side-yards between the adjacent homes being pinched in both Option 1 and 2.

Given the adjacency to 484 Cloverdale, the third option pushes the bulk of the massing west/back on the property to have a more modest street face overwhelm the Grade I building. The garage at 480 is a single storey with a second-floor screened terrace setback.

The third option maintains a discrete interface with the street and offers a respectful distance to the neighbour's lot-line with the bulk of the building extending into the lot. Overall, the height and massing - as seen from the street - as well as the landscaping (largely preserved), materiality (natural stone, wood, and copper), and setbacks (matching front yard setbacks) along with the generous side yard setback of 480 Cloverdale allows for a building design and privacy plantings.



NOTES |

- NOTES | garage takes up 64% of front facade even with minimum setbacks extremely dominant garage doors narrow entry and little space for usable rooms on frst foor at front of house single-width driveway when many are dual and/or wider downward slope directed towards house



CLOVERDALE ROAD SIDE-FACING GARAGE WITH ENTRY SET BACK

NOTES

- garage and driveway leave only 29% of front facade for entry/interior usable space despite minimum side yard
- entry/interior usable space despire minimum side yara setbacks driveway/turn-around is long and at minimum (1.5m) setback from neighbours large garage door faces neighbour's house with minimum setback will little room for vegetation buffer

NOTES

NOTES | garage takes up only half of front facade garage doors barely visible front of house/entry is welcoming and relatively generous significant space for vegetation buffer between garage and both neighbour's house

Figure 26: Three options considered in siting the residence and the garage. Source: Linebox Studio 2022.



Figure 27: A view looking north-east illustrates the minimal impact of the new home from along the street. Orientation and siting of the garage are appropriate to reduce its visual impact of the garge from the street. Source Linebox Studio 2022



Figures 28 and 29: The east elevation from Cloverdale Road provides a comparison view with and without vegetation. Existing mature trees are an integral part of the design creating a foreground for the garage elevation screening it from the street and maintaining the traditional visual separation between the Grade 1 building next door. Even without the vegetation the two homes sit comfortably back from Cloverdale and appear to be at a similar height and scale. The garage of the Grade 1 home projects into the notch and creates a pinch point that is compensated for with a side yard setback of just under 10m between the two buildings. The two-storey addition at the rear of 484 is screened from the street as is much of the massing of 480.



Guideline 7.4.7.a. and 7.4.11

7.4.7 In order to protect the expansive front lawns, and the generous spacing and setbacks of the buildings, identified as heritage attributes of the HCD, the following guidelines shall be used when determining the location of new houses on their lots:

a. New buildings on interior lots shall be sensitively sited in relation to adjacent buildings. Unless a new building maintains the front yard setback of a building, it is replacing, the front yard setback of the new building shall be consistent with that of the adjacent building that is set closest to the street. A new building may be set back further from the street than adjacent buildings.

7.4.11 Terraces and balconies below the top storey (for example, on a garage roof, or one storey addition) may be recommended for approval if they do not have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding cultural heritage landscape.

Discussion of Siting as it pertains to Guideline 7.a. and 11.

Positive Impacts:

- The setback of the residence and garage relates well to the neighbouring properties. The plan below illustrates the revised setback of the building and garage. Average setbacks for each face are significantly more than required by zoning by-law.
- A series of angled volumes allows for the saving of multiple trees along the north and south property lines with the building only approach setbacks at specific points. None of the building's main wing references the 40 'rear setback with open soft landscape forming the core of the property.
- The roof terrace over the garage is screened from the street with planting to eliminate overviews onto the neighbouring property.



Figure 30: Setback Analysis of the revised plan in comparison to the earlier layout.

Negative Impacts

• Initially, the height of the building and the roof terrace overlooked the neighbouring property. The revised plan has taken into consideration the community comments with mitigation measures that include the rear-most volume lowered by half of a storey, roof terrace eliminated.

•

7.4.2. "Construction of new buildings will only be permitted when the new building does not detract from the historic landscape characteristics of the associated streetscape, the height and mass of the new building are consistent with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape, and the siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape." **Discussion**: see Page 30.

7.4.3 Landscape Guidelines – New Buildings and Additions

2. New buildings and additions will be sited on a property to respect the established landscaped character of the streetscape.

3. The existing landscaped character of a lot will be preserved, when new buildings and additions are constructed.

4. The front lawns and side yards of new buildings shall protect the continuity and dominance of the soft landscape within the HCD.

7. Setbacks, topography and existing grades, trees, pathways, and special features, such as stone walls and front walks shall be preserved.

9. The removal of mature trees is strongly discouraged, and all applications will be subject to the appropriate bylaw and permitting process. Where a tree has to be removed to accommodate new construction, it will be replaced with a new tree of an appropriate size and species elsewhere on the lot with preference given to native species.

10. Existing grades shall be maintained.

Discussion of Landscape Guidelines 7.4.3.

Positive Impacts

- The design of the landscape is contemporary with specific picturesque views of the house in keeping with the Keffer vision.
- The impact to the existing property is minimal and demonstrates a unique approach that appears to integrate well with natural surroundings and blends "outdoor" and "indoor."
- The approach to the design development is positive. In most cases, the design of a new home evolves with the management of the landscape taking a subservient role and retention of existing vegetation is seen as an impediment. At 480 Cloverdale, the approach has been reversed to place the conservation of the tree canopy as a primary requirement and to meld the house in a far more plastic way to fit in.
- Changes to grade are limited and will occur along the driveway (slices topography) and in the eastern courtyard. Their impact is limited.

Negative Impacts

Negative Issues to the landscape were identified as part of the vetting process, these included the replacement of the board fence with a cedar hedge, eliminating a roof terrace and reducing the amount of hard paving with more permeable material. The scale and massing of the house, the setbacks from the property lines and the height have all been adjusted in response to the committee's comments.

The chain-link fence in combination will provide a green edge. The chain link and posts should be a dark green or black to make the fence less visible while the plant material fills in.

5.3 Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Properties in Canada The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places in Canada (2010) were adopted by City Council and are used to assess applications under the Ontario Heritage Act.

The Standards and Guidelines in this particular exercise address the impact of new development at 480 Cloverdale Road as a potential new attribute to the Rockcliffe Park Conservation District.

As per the General Standards (all projects)

- Conserve the character defining elements of a historic place; The existing topography, views and viewsheds in and out of the site, the vegetation, and the property in context with the HCD are considered to be character defining.
- 2. Do not move a component of a historic place if it is determined that the current location is a character defining element.

Construction of the house has required the replacement of three mature trees.

- 3. Find a use for a historic place that requires minimal changes to its character defining elements. The introduction of a family residence requires minimal change to the defined attributes on-site, to the mostly residential nature of the District, and to the neighbouring Grade 1 building.
- 4. Evaluate the existing condition of the character defining elements to determine the appropriate intervention needed.

Following conservation practices, the history of the district was considered, the landscape was documented and a detailed as-found tree inventory as well as a comparative assessment of the neighbouring properties, including the relative heights, setbacks, and visual integration.

Standard 11

Conserve the heritage value and character-defining elements when creating any new additions to an historic place or any related new construction. Make the new work physically and visually compatible with, subordinate to and distinguishable from the historic place.

Houses in Rockcliffe Park tend to be rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition. While the proposed house does not exhibit the picturesque principles found in some parts of the HCD, it is certainly within the vocabulary of modern homes that existed before designation, and the guidelines were implemented. A number of these homes are acknowledged as contributing to the district's value (see Figure 8). The massing of the house has been designed to acknowledge these qualities while also attempting to achieve a distinct design vision. Following the advice set out in comments the house has been further scaled back, reduced in height, with additional soft landscape to the rear.

• Subsection 4.1.4 – Spatial Organization, Guideline 13

Designing a new feature when required by a new use that is compatible with the character-defining spatial organization. The new home is situated respectfully addressing the street's spatial organization (height, setback, vegetation, attached garage, and driveway). The new house as a feature in the Rockcliffe cultural landscape is compatible in massing and scale with the District's spatial organization and is respectful of the neighbouring home at 484 Cloverdale.

• Subsection 4.1.5 – Visual Relationships, Guideline 15

The new house in its landscape respects the historic visual relationships in the cultural landscape, including matching established setbacks, uses, the overall ratio of open space to building mass is in excess of required guidelines, and the height in relation to neighbouring buildings is compatable with the height of the Grade 1 building to the north. Utilizing the tree cover the views of the house from the street will be filtered and will establish picturesque relationships.

• Subsection 4.1.8 – Vegetation, Guideline 16

This project is unique in that it is a mature wooded lot and only two trees will be lost. Introducing additional plantings are intended to ensure that the heritage value of the District's cultural landscape is preserved, including augmenting with the planting of native species appropriate to the District Plan and planting hedges to filter views and screen the new construction.

• Subsection 4.1.11 – Built Features, Guideline 15

The use of noble materials and traditional finishes (limestone, wood, and copper) in the construction of the house, and the conservation of the existing mature tree canopy as a structural element.

6.0 ALTERNATIVES AND MITIGATION STRATEGIES

6.1 Alternatives

The design process for this project has gone through a at least five alternative designs for the building, its placement, massing, materiality, and landscape. These were explored with the design team and reviewed by the client, the city, and the community association. Throughout the CHIS, these alternatives have been highlighted in the appropriate sections, including the discussion of impacts above.

The most-recent revisions described in this CHIS have responded to recommendations with a smaller footprint, less height, and fewer areas where the topography has been altered.

An alternative that was formally explored is the potential of flipping the footprint with the driveway next to 484 and the smaller building on the north side. Although there were some positive outcomings including the side yard setback and building massing in relation with Garde 1 building next door, it

resulted in an awkward footprint. The negative impacts included the loss of additional trees, the ability for the interior circulation to flow, light quality and heavy shading. For these reasons this alternative was abandoned.

A series of pre-consultation meetings with the heritage section of the city of Ottawa Planning Section and the Rockcliffe Park Community Association were held. An informal review meeting was also held between City Staff, the architect, and heritage consultant April 2021. Councillor King also hosted a session in early January. At these review meetings, a number of alternatives were suggested. Many have been incorporated into the plans. The full review is included in the Appendix.

Several further comments regarding the proposed design were emphasized, including the replacement of the board fence with a live hedge, introducing larger windows along the north and south facades to move away from the institutional character, the use of a lighter coloured limestone as an exterior cladding and a careful interpretation of the city's definition of basement. These valid suggestions have been addressed as part of the third iteration of design.

6.2 Mitigation Measures

Mitigation measure may include:

• As a means of reducing the impact of additional hard surfaces the inclusion of a system of green roofs has been introduced as art of the revised plans.

6.3 Conclusions

The plan for 480 Cloverdale Road is in keeping with the character defining attributes of the District by maintaining the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer. It acknowledges and respects the Grade 1 building next door with the "generosity of space around the proposed house, and the flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines." The proposed design results in a unique residential expression, which is well within the normal parameters of the HCD with regards to understated prominence on the street, setbacks, height, lot coverage and preservation of the existing vegetation.

The new construction proposed for the site follows the management guidelines for the district in that its siting, form, materials, and detailing are sympathetic to the surrounding natural and cultural environment. The proposed development retains the existing lot size and density. The existing grades are maintained; the siting of the built form is strategically organized to retain existing trees with sufficient setback to protect the root zone during construction. This strategic approach to the massing also addresses the relationship to the side-yards between neighbouring properties.

The height and mass of the new building have been adjusted and broken up to be more consistent with the Grade I buildings (484 Cloverdale) and the siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape. While the proposed house does not exhibit the picturesque principles found in some parts of the HCD, it is certainly within the vocabulary of modern homes that existed before/after designation, and the guidelines were implemented. A number of these
homes are acknowledged as contributing to the District's value. As recommended in the district study, the design of the new house is "of its own time" but harmonizes with its setting in its unique presentation, and generous use of limestone, copper, and wood. The proposed house is also compatible with the existing streetscape in its height, dimensions, and functions as a private family residence.

The landscape design incorporates nearly all the existing mature trees and shrubs and adds to the plantings on the property to create a distinct environment that will provide privacy and support the naturalistic character between properties and the tennis court at the rear of the lot. This project has been intriguing on several fronts. One rarely sees a design where the landscape takes precedence, and the architecture is integrated.

This home takes full advantage of its setting. The building size and form are in response to a program set out by the owner to create a home that can accommodate three generations of family, with expectation that the entire family does not necessarily have to come together and participate at all times. The concept of linked pods that has evolved capitalizes on and attempts to prioritize the site's unique characteristics (a bucolic setting, mature wooded lot, significant grade changes) all of which are attributes of the Rockcliffe Park ethos.

7.0 AUTHORS QUALIFICATIONS

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management is a consulting and management firm that offers services related to conservation, planning, research, and interpretation for historical and cultural resources. The firm was incorporated in 1986.

John J. Stewart, B.L.A., O.A.L.A., C.S.L.A., CAHP, a principal of Commonwealth is a specialist in the planning and design of cultural resources, building conservation, and commercial area revitalization. A graduate of the University of Guelph, he received additional training at Cornell University (USA) and Oxford University (UK) and holds a diploma in the Conservation of Monuments from Parks Canada, where he worked as Head, Restoration Services Landscape Section. Before Commonwealth's formation, Stewart served for four years as the first director of Heritage Canada's Main Street Program.

Stewart is a founding member of the Canadian Association of Heritage Professionals. He has served as the Canadian representative of the Historic Landscapes and Gardens Committee of ICOMOS and the International Federation of Landscape Architects. Stewart is a panel member with the Ottawa Urban Design Review Panel and a board member of Algonquin College Heritage Carpentry Program.



9.0 APPENDIX A PRE-CONSULTATION COMMENTS AND RESPONSES

This section specifically addresses the cultural heritage values of the HCD. The heritage attributes of the HCD are itemized in Section 3.0. The design proposal is assessed in the tables below using the policies and guidelines contained in the Rockcliffe Park Heritage District Plan for new buildings along with heritage staff's comments. A response is followed in *"italic."* The comments provided by the community association are addressed separately. It is included here to part of the project record.

F	OCKCLIFFE PARK HCD POLICIES	COMMENT	
5.0	"Buildings set within a visually continuous green landscape"	 Front yard trees provide appropriate visual screening of the building from the street. Front yard setback is appropriate and in line with neighbouring Grade I house. Choice of materials and colours helps to integrate the building within its natural surroundings. Proposed building is surrounded by trees and softscape in front, rear, and side yards. 	
	"To ensure that new house construction is compatible with, sympathetic to and has regard for the height , massing and setbacks of the established heritage character of the streetscape in order to conserve the character and pattern of the associated streetscape, while creating a distinction between new and old ."	 Front yard setback is in line with neighbouring Grade I house. Proposed side yard setbacks are appropriate and compatible with neighbouring properties. Appreciate that massing is broken up but is not "compact" enough – the building is too "long" and perhaps could be wider and bulkier at the front/north-south volume. The building appears much larger than it is from the perspective of neighbouring properties. Most houses in Rockcliffe Park are rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition. The massing of the house should be revised to maintain these qualities as far as possible while also attempting to achieve its design vision. Could still benefit from a deeper rear yard. Design is contemporary. Also appears to integrate well with natural surroundings and blends "outdoor" and "indoor". 	

		<complex-block></complex-block>
	"To ensure the use of natural materials for new construction to reflect the existing character of the area."	Applicant indicates that materials to be used will include copper, stained cedar and two different types of stone cladding (to be confirmed). Aluminium framed windows.
	 Response: This is a large home that takes full advantage of its setting with first floor at 4,817 sf second floor of 3,558 sf. The basement floor area does not count towards total GFA as per City Ottawa Zoning By-Law Exception 1259. The concept of linked pods, that cater to a variety of the family's everyday needs has been taken new level. The building size and form are in response to the program set out by the owner to cr home that can accommodate three generations of family, that acknowledges the strain of isola that the reduced access to a range of services may not be temporary. The building's form and r acknowledge this new reality with a series of interconnected linked pods. The form that has even attempts to prioritize the site's unique characteristics (mature vegetation, long deep lot, and gr changes). The City provided a sketch plan with a more traditional footprint reflective of other homes in the neighbourhood. The suggestion is reasonable but would most likely result in a house far more v from the street. The other drawback is the pinch points that would be created with the side electron form the street. Second piece figure 9. 	
	"To encourage the retention of existing trees, shrubs, hedges and landscape features on public and private property."	Only two mature trees to be removed and relocated.
6.0	"strong landscaping of the individual properties"	Appreciate the proposed landscape details, retention of trees and integration of considerations of topography.
	"The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines, has maintained	There appears to be sufficient space around the property in line with neighbouring properties in the area. Could still benefit from a deeper rear yard.
	the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer."	Proposed fence is inappropriate for Rockcliffe Park – chain-link screened by hedges is a better alternative.

"The unobtrusive siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the neighbouring buildings"	Front yard setback is appropriate. The choice of materials gives the impression of stone "ruins", which integrates well into natural landscape. The house is subtle when viewed from the street. There appears to be enough space between the building and its neighbour.
"The profusion of trees, hedges, and shrubs on private property"	Proposal maintains most trees. Two mature trees to be removed and replanted.
"Generous spacing and setbacks of the buildings"	There appears to be sufficient space around the property in line with neighbouring properties in the area.
"The dominance of soft landscaping over hard landscaping"	Applicant has demonstrated that soft landscaping will dominate.
"The rich mix of building types and styles from all eras"	Contemporary and interesting design

Response: In most cases the design of a new home evolves with the management of the landscape taking a subservient role. At 480 Cloverdale the approach has been reversed to place the conservation of the tree canopy as a primary requirement and to meld the house in a far more plastic way to fit in.

7.3.3	"The dominance of soft landscape over hard landscape is an essential heritage attribute of the HCD and shall be retained to maintain a green setting for each property."	Applicant has demonstrated that soft landscaping will dominate.
	"Landscape projects shall respect the attributes and established character of the associated streetscape and the HCD."	Street tree coverage maintained. House is set back appropriately from the street. Soft landscaping dominates the front yard.
	"Front yards shall have a generous area of soft landscaping which may include lawns, shrubs and flower beds, specimen, or groupings of trees. The tradition of using native plant material is encouraged. Existing elements such as lawns, flower beds, glades of trees, shrubs, rocks and low stone walls shall be maintained, and hard surfacing shall be kept to a minimum."	Only two mature trees to be removed and replanted. Soft landscaping dominates the front yard.
	"The removal of mature trees is strongly discouraged. Where a tree must be removed to allow for new construction, it will be replaced with a new tree of an appropriate size and species."	Only two mature trees to be removed and replanted.

	"Driveway design that minimizes the amount of asphalt and other paving materials is encouraged. Consideration should be given to the use of porous materials such as turfstone."	Driveway width has been reduced and permeable paving is proposed.
 Response: "To maintain the park-like attributes, qualities and atmosphere of the HCD." Some of the highligh of the plan includes: less front yard hardscape (7%) rather than what is typical of properties on street (11%), with the use of permeable hard scape materials. equivalent building coverage (26%) compared to typical coverage of properties on street (26%) 51 out of 53 existing trees preserved. a conceptual design intertwined between stands of existing trees using angled volumes and raised courtyards to avoid critical root zones even the unorthodox way columns are randomly set. A palette of natural, high-quality materials, and colours that capture the spirit of the Rockcliffe Park as cultural landscape. 		
7.4.2	"Construction of new buildings will only be permitted when the new building does not detract from the historic landscape characteristics of the associated streetscape, the height and mass of the new building are consistent with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape, and the siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape."	 Historic landscape characteristics of the streetscape are maintained. Height of the building is consistent with its neighbour. Appreciate that massing is broken up but is not "compact" enough – the building is too "long" and perhaps could be wider and bulkier at the front. The building appears much larger than it is from the perspective of neighbouring properties. Most houses in Rockcliffe Park are rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition. The massing of the house should be revised to maintain these qualities as far as possible while also attempting to achieve the design vision. Visual impact of the building is reduced by its siting. The front design of the house does not overwhelm its neighbour.
	"New buildings shall be of their own time but sympathetic to the character of their historic neighbours in terms of massing, height and materials. New buildings are not required to replicate historical styles."	Contemporary and interesting design. Appreciate that massing is broken up but is not "compact" enough – the building is too "long" and perhaps could be wider and bulkier at the front. The building appears much larger than it is from the perspective of neighbouring properties. Most houses in Rockcliffe Park are rectangular and estate-like, designed in the picturesque tradition. The massing of the house should be revised to maintain these qualities as far as possible while also attempting to achieve the design vision. Height of the building is consistent with its neighbour.

Still some concerns with massing shown on the north and south elevations – impacts on neighbouring properties. The building appears much larger than it is from the perspective of

	 neighbouring properties. Hard and dark walls read as "institutional". Not compatible with the residential character of Rockcliffe Park. Some distinction between lower and upper storeys may help. Applicant indicates that materials to be used will include copper, stained cedar and two different types of stone cladding (to be
Cloverdale Road and appears much les the home is a two-storey entrance and on stilts. Following comments and a r	confirmed). Aluminium framed windows. structure is respectful of the scale of the adjacent house 484 as massive than buildings across the street. The centre portion of d will be constructed predominately in contemporary glazing units, eview by the City's heritage staff and the community association inges including removal of a roof terrace, reducing the building by post volume away from the lot line.
Views from the backyards of the two adjacent residences (Figures 12 and 14) illustrate the screened nature with only nominal exposure through a screen of vegetation. Recognizing views will be more evident during the winter a palette of materials has been selected to he and blend into the winterscape. Overviews into neighbouring properties are minimal and the house from the Lawn and Tennis Club is negligible.	
"Integral garages shall be located in a manner that respects the cultural heritage value of the streetscape."	Orientation and siting of the garage is appropriate to reduce its visual impact on the streetscape.
"Existing grades shall be maintained."	Minor changes to grade to occur along driveway (slices topography) and in courtyard.
"New buildings on interior lots shall be sensitively sited in relation to adjacent buildings. Unless a new building maintains the front yard setback of a building it is replacing, the front yard setback of the new building shall be consistent with that of the adjacent building that is	Applicant indicates that materials to be used will include copper, stained cedar and two different types of stone cladding (to be confirmed). Aluminium framed windows.
set closest to the street. A new building may be set back further	Front yard setback is consistent with its neighbour.
from the street than adjacent buildings."	
from the street than adjacent	Applicant indicates that materials to be used will include copper, stained cedar and two different types of stone cladding (to be confirmed). Aluminium framed windows.

manufactured stone will not be supported."	
"Terraces and balconies below the top storey (for example, on a garage roof, or one storey addition) may be recommended for approval if they do not have a negative effect on the character of the surrounding cultural heritage landscape."	Terraces are appropriately screened and oriented away from the street and neighbouring properties.
"If brick and stone cladding is proposed, it will extend to all façades and not be used solely on the front façade . Other cladding materials may be appropriate."	Stone cladding appears to extend to all facades. Use of different stone materials adds variation.
"The use of modern materials such as plastic or fiberglass to replicate architectural details such as columns, balusters or bargeboard is not acceptable and will not be permitted."	Applicant indicates that materials to be used will include copper, stained cedar and two different types of stone cladding (to be confirmed). Aluminium framed windows.
"Other accessory buildings (sheds, playhouses, pool houses) should be located in the rear yard and will not result in the loss of significant soft landscaping."	Proposed pavilion is in the rear yard and does not result in significant loss of soft landscaping.

Response: In many ways the house is a response to the Covid 19 pandemic and the changes that it has brought about with the nature of a home, how families can continue to interact, requirements for isolation and the need for greater self sufficiency. Overnight we have gone from interactive to a touchless Society that has been thrust into conditions where even modest accommodations need both indoor and outdoor amenity space, and the ability to separate. The design is a well thought out response.

7.4.3	"New buildings and additions to existing buildings shall respect the heritage attributes of the lot's existing hard and soft landscape,	Only two mature trees to be removed and replanted.
	including but not limited to trees, hedges and flowerbeds, pathways,	The proposal has been revised to include more soft landscaping including permeable pavement for the driveway and walkways,
	setbacks and yards. Soft	the reduction of paved patio and terraces.
	landscaping will dominate the	
	property."	
"New buildings and additions will sited on a property to respect the established landscaped character	"New buildings and additions will be sited on a property to respect the established landscaped character of the streetscape."	Front yard setback is appropriate, and the proposed building is appropriately sited. The landscape character of the streetscape is maintained.
	"The existing landscaped character of a lot will be preserved, when new buildings and additions are constructed."	Changes to grade to occur along driveway (slices topography) and in eastern courtyard.
		Proposal maintains most trees. Only two mature trees to be removed and replanted.

"The front lawns and side yards of new buildings shall protect the continuity and dominance of the soft landscape within the HCD."	Softscape dominates front yard. Permeable paving materials are proposed for the driveway.
"Setbacks, topography and existing grades, trees, pathways and special features, such as stone walls and front walks shall be preserved."	Could still benefit from a deeper rear yard. Minor changes to grade to occur along driveway (slices topography) and in eastern courtyard. Proposal maintains most trees. Two mature trees to be removed and replanted.
"All applications for new construction shall be accompanied by a detailed landscape plan . The plan must clearly indicate the location of all trees, shrubs and landscape features including those to be preserved and those to be removed, and illustrate all changes proposed to the landscape ."	Landscape plan has been provided.
"The removal of mature trees is strongly discouraged, and all applications will be subject to the appropriate bylaw and permitting process. Where a tree has to be removed to accommodate new construction, it will be replaced with a new tree of an appropriate size and species elsewhere on the lot with preference given to native species."	Proposal maintains most trees. Two mature trees to be remove and replanted.
"Existing grades shall be maintained."	Changes to grade to occur along driveway (slices topography) and in eastern courtyard.

Response: We concur with the City's comments above and point out that the board fence illustrated in earlier renderings has been replaced with live plantings such as cedar as suggested in the comments.

2nd Pre-consult Comments from the RPRA Heritage Committee with respect to the designs for the proposed new house at 480 Cloverdale All of which is respectfully submitted by the RPRA Heritage Committee, March 8, 2021

5. The Heritage plan calls for "buildings set within a visually continuous green landscape."

Comments form the Heritage Committee;

The garage and the front of the building are satisfactorily set back from the original 19' to 25' to align with the neighbour Grade 1 house at 484 Cloverdale.

Although the Heritage Plan does not permit garages in front of the house, in this case the garage is acceptable due to several factors: the garage is sensitively treated with doors facing South out of sight from the street, discreet vertical slat windows on the street side, the use of natural stone and the generous landscaping which assists in concealing the garage from the street. An addition of some coniferous trees would increase the lack of obtrusiveness in a winter landscape.

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management

The driveway turnaround radius has been significantly reduced and the extra hard surface for basketball has been eliminated.

Response: no comment

6. The generosity of space around the houses, and the flow of this space from one property to the next by continuous planting rather than hard fence lines, has maintained the estate qualities and park setting envisioned by Keefer."

The unobtrusive siting of the houses on streets and the generous spacing relative to the neighbouring buildings

7.3.3. "The dominance of soft landscape over hard landscape is an essential heritage attribute of the HCD and shall be retained in order to maintain a green setting for each property."

7.4.2. "Construction of new buildings will only be permitted when the new building does not detract from the historic landscape characteristics of the associated streetscape, the height and mass of the new building are consistent with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape, and the siting and materials of the new building are compatible with the Grade I buildings in the associated streetscape."

Committee Comments for 6. and 7.

Response: The plan illustrated in figure 30 documents the setback with the front façade and garage setback in keeping with other neighbouring homes. Average setbacks for each face are significantly more than required by zoning by-law. The allowable setbacks along both the north and south side yards are indicated in yellow, and the orange indicates the actual distance of the home from the lot line. Angled volumes allow for the saving of multiple trees along the north and south property lines with the building only approach setbacks at specific points. Only one corner of the main wing references the 40 'rear setback with open programmed landscape forming the core of the property. The revised plan has taken into consideration the comments with the rear-most volume lowered by half of a storey (roof terrace eliminated) and the rear pavilion rotated away from the neighbouring property to overlook the pool.

Community Comment Continued....

Because the property is disproportionately long (230') compared with the standard 100' the rear yard set back needs to be adjusted appropriately. Where a 40' rear yard set back is appropriate for a 100' long property, an 88' rear yard set back is a proportionately equal (40%) rear yard set back for this property. The elimination of the pavilion would assist in gaining back a portion of the soft landscape.

Response: The property is a double lot. As the illustration above shows, the rear garden is considerably larger than the mandated 40'. There is only one corner of the rear building façade that touches the setback. The gazebo is a playful open air feature set among the trees with views looking towards the house. It provides a distinct shaded area and does not result in significant loss of soft landscaping.

Comments Continued....

The building is oversized and excessively long. The height of the house is reduced from three stories to two stories. But the "basement" would appear not to meet the definition of a basement and therefore

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management

the house essentially does have three stories. What is referred to as a basement is wholly above ground and should therefore be included in the FSI. This gives a more realistic appreciation of the enormity of the house. Its FSI is far over the maximum allowable.

Response: The City of Ottawa has specific criteria for determining the definition of basements. With the topographic changes throughout Rockcliffe Park the opportunities for a walkout basement are a standard feature for many homes and taking advantage of the additional floor space is a part of most new home design. The design team appreciates your comments and has review the FSI with City staff as it relates to the basement.

The length of the building creates a very long, hard flat surface facing the neighbours on both sides but most significantly on the North side. It is 169 feet long from the beginning of the garage to the back of the skybox/master bedroom. The house looks like an institution perhaps even a prison with dark walls and vertical slit windows. A softer, lighter gray stone would enhance the otherwise dark look of the massive exterior facing walls. The fact that it is built with a courtyard space between the buildings gives the appearance of an even larger building from the neighbour's perspective.

In conclusion, the house needs to be redesigned. The house should take a more conventional design to fit in all the space without the two wings going back on the property which is now 169 feet. I fail to see how this house could be convenient in any way considering how far its occupants have to walk to get from one end to the other. The distance from the kitchen to the dining room is perhaps 70', and from the garage to the bedroom 135 feet, more than an average city block. The revised plans move the roof top Terrace at the east end of the property to face away from the neighbours. This is a positive step.

Response: See the response to Section 5.

The proposed 7' wooden fence surrounding most of the property is very obstructive and not conducive to the Greenscape culture of Rockcliffe where one property runs into another, and they are separated by hedges, and chain-link fences, when necessary, for pools.

Response: Your comment has been noted and the design adjusted to eliminate the board fence.

Community Conclusion

The committee fails to see how the retention of a dominance of soft landscape over hard landscape can be achieved with a house design that covers so much of the property. Similarly, the goal of proposing a building that is not overly obtrusive to the neighbours cannot be achieved other than to redesign the house in accordance with the requirements and guidance of the RP HCD Plan.

Response: The residence is being designed to serve three generations with expectation that the entire family does not necessarily have to come together and always participate. The concept of linked pods that cater to a variety of the family's everyday needs has been taken to a new level. One of the concerns raised

in the pre-consultation minutes was the distance between kitchen and dining room. This is a reasonable concern if there was just a core family. It is less valid when accommodating three generations with special catered needs, different timetables, and interests.

10.0 APPENDIX B EVALUATION FORM FOR 484 Cloverdale Road



HERITAGE SURVEY AND EVALUATION FORM				
484 Cloverdale Road	Building or Property Name	042280002		
PLAN M61 LOT 11 AND PT LOT E;RP CAR 38 PART 1	Lot	Block	Plan	
	Date of current structure	c. 1945		
1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at rear	Original owner	Colonel R.D. Huestis		
	484 Cloverdale Road PLAN M61 LOT 11 AND PT LOT E;RP CAR 38 PART 1 1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at	484 Cloverdale Road Building or Property Name PLAN M61 LOT 11 AND PT LOT E;RP CAR 38 PART 1 Lot 2001 E;RP CAR 38 PART 1 Date of current structure 1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at Original owner	484 Cloverdale Road Building or Property Name 042280002 PLAN M61 LOT 11 AND PT LOT E;RP CAR 38 PART 1 Lot Block Date of current structure C. 1945 1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at Original owner Colonel R.D. Hu	



Garden / Landscape / Environment	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault		
	Month/Year: June 2011		
Heritage Conservation District name	Rockcliffe Park		
Character of Existing Streetscape			
Cloverdale is a sharply curving and uneven roadway that cuts generally north-south underneath the embankment which overlooks McKay Lake. This particular section of Cloverdale is situated in the middle of the embankment, and therefore properties are defined by their uneven grading and placement above the roadway. There are no curbs or sidewalks on either side of the street and therefore pedestrians and cars share the same street. The landscape features of these properties are informally arranged, featuring a variety of mature trees, lawns and gardens. This informal arrangement is enhanced by the dense growth of trees along the roadside.			
Character of Existing Property			
The property is similar to others on Cloverdale Road. The yard is primarily composed of open lawn, with three apple trees planted at even intervals near the front edge of the lawn. A maple tree is located behind the fruit trees. On the south side of the yard there is a row of trees along the property line. On the north side of the yard, the terrain dips sharply. There are coniferous trees scattered on this section of the yard. Garden beds line the exterior walls of the house, filled with shrubs. There is a straight asphalt driveway on the south side of the yard, and an asphalt pathway leading to the entrance.			
Contribution of Property to Heritage Environs			
Landscape / Open Space The property is consistent with the variety of landscape forms found on Cloverdale Road. Many of the lots are open to the street, while others are defined by hedges. Most are characterised by numerous trees, often planted towards the edge of the road. The presence of mature trees along the roadside contributes to a coherent streetscape.			
Architecture / Built Space The house is consistent with the variety of architectural forms found on Cloverdale Road.			
Landmark Status			
The house is visible from Cloverdale Road.			
Summary / Comments on Environmental Significance			
The tree-lined property contributes to the informal and naturalized character of Cloverdale Road.			

History	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault		
	Month/Year: June 2011		
Date of Current Building(s)	c. 1945		
Trends			
In 1945, the council of the Village of Rockcliffe Park established a bylaw that required 100 foot frontages on a road for all lots falling within the area bounded by Maple Lane, Lansdowne Road, Lakeview Avenue, and Mariposa Avenue.			
In the early to mid 20 th century, there was an influx of families to Rockcliffe Park as a result of higher- density development and crowding in downtown Ottawa. With its scenic location and relative isolation from the city, the Village of Rockcliffe Park became a fashionable neighbourhood, perceived to be a more healthy and peaceful residential environment.			
This section of Rockcliffe was mainly developed in the post WWII period. For the most part, the buildings in this section date from the mid-20 th century and thus relate to one another in terms of their planning. The postwar development of suburbs was coupled with the expansion of the automobile industry and increased prevalence of cars as the primary means of transportation. As such, these suburbs and the architecture of the buildings within them were organized around the increasing cultural reliance on automobiles.			
Events			
Persons / Institutions			
1945: Colonel R.D. Huestis (House previously listed as 480 Cloverdale) 1950, 1960, 1966: Lt. Richard and June White 1966-1970-: Peter L and Nini MacDougall (1990)-1999 Emanuel Somers (worked for WHO) (member of Rockcliffe Park Environmental Committee) 1999- Louise Arbour			
Summary / Comments on Historical Significance			
The historical significance of this house is due to its age, constructed c. 1945, and its association with Louise Arbour.			
Historical Sources			
City of Ottawa File			

Rockcliffe LACAC file Edmond, Martha. *Rockcliffe Park: A History of the Village*. Ottawa : The Friends of the Village of Rockcliffe Park Foundation, 2005. *Village of Rockcliffe Park Heritage Conservation District Study*, 1997. *Village of Rockcliffe Park LACAC Survey of Houses*, 1988 Carver, Humphrey. *The Cultural Landscape of Rockcliffe Park Village*. Village of Rockcliffe Park, 1985. Might's Directory of the City of Ottawa

Architecture	Prepared by: Lashia Jones / Heather Perrault				
	Month/Year: June 2011				
Architectural Design (plan, storeys, roof, windows, style, material, details, etc)					
484 Cloverdale is a one and one half storey residence with a rectangular centre-hall plan and a steeply pitched side gable roof. The entrance is composed of a single unglazed door, with a sidelight of coloured stained glass on the south side. The entrance is flanked by pilasters and topped with a bell cast porch roof. On either side of the entrance there are eight over eight single hung sash windows with decorative shutters. On the half storey, there are three gabled wall dormers with six over six single sung sash windows. On the south side of the house there is a single storey single car garage with secondary entrance and balcony above. On the north side of the house there one and one land storey wing, with a shallow projection on the first storey with a six over six single hung sash window with decorative shutters.					
Architectural Style					
The house has elements of Colonial Revival/Cape Cod styles.					
Designer / Builder / Architect / Landscape A	Architect				
Unknown					
Architectural Integrity					
1965 constructed rear patio 2001 two storey addition at rear					
Outbuildings					
Other					
Summary / Comments on Architectural Sig	nificance				
This house is a good example of Colonial Revival type architecture that became popular in Rockcliffe as the village became a fashionable retreat from the City, and increasing residents demanded higher density housing.					

Commonwealth Historic Resource Management

PHASE TWO EVALUATION					
ENVIRONMENT CATEGORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Character of Existing Streetscape		Х			20/30
2. Character of Existing Property	Х				30/30
3. Contribution to Heritage Environs	Х				30/30
4. Landmark Status			Х		3/10
Environment total					83/100
HISTORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Construction Date		Х			23/35
2. Trends			Х		11/35
3. Events/ Persons/Institutions		Х			20/30
History total					54/100
ARCHITECTURE CATEGORY	E	G	F	Р	SCORE
1. Design	Х				50/50
2. Style	Х				30/30
3. Designer/Builder				Х	0/10
4. Architectural Integrity		Х			7/10
Architecture total					87/100

RANGES	EXCELLENT	GOOD	GOOD	FAIR	POOR
	Pre-1908	1908 to 1925	1926 to 1948	1949 to 1972	After 1972

Category	Phase Two Score, Heritage District				
Environment	83x 45% =37.35				
History	54x 20% =10.8				
Architecture	87x 35% =30.45				
Phase Two Total Score	78.6/100 = 79				

PHASE TWO EVALUATION SUMMARY					
Phase Two Score	Above	to	to	Below	
Group					